

Dear Dr McHugh,

I write, as promised, to update you on the progress I have made to date :

1. I had the meeting with the Provincial and the local Prior of the Monastery in which Fr McCaffrey resides on Monday 5<sup>th</sup> and explained the steps I was going to take and your expressed wishes regarding no desire to sue the Order or Fr McCaffrey. Both were very co-operative and supportive of me in my work to follow.
2. On Tuesday 6<sup>th</sup> - I met with Fr McCaffrey accompanied by his local prior. I began the meeting by explaining the procedures I have to follow and his rights and entitlements. I also explained that you had given me consent to report the matter to the Gardai. He listened intently, asked a few clarifications then gave me his consent to proceed with the meeting.
  - (i) Your record of complaint was read out loud to him and he was given a copy to take away for his consideration, reflection, prayer and seek "wise counsel". He is to return to a meeting with me on Tuesday 13<sup>th</sup> to submit his response.
  - (ii) A number of safeguarding restrictions are now in place and he has formally signed a compliance agreement and will be under the supervision of his local Prior. He is removed from all public ministry and access to women among other items of agreement.
  - (iii) I have reported the matter to the Sexual Crime Management Unit - and I expect to hear from them soon. I anticipate that I will have the name and contact details of the Detective Inspector who will be assigned to your case. I will forward this information to you so that you can make direct contact with the Inspector to instruct him to begin the investigation.
  - (iv) On Tuesday 6<sup>th</sup> - I also had a very good phone conversation with Fr Powell. He was most helpful in giving his account of his involvement in the matter.
3. The next strategic step is receiving the response of Fr McCaffrey which will determine the way forward.

I need to let you know that our broadband service is down in our area and it will be some days before it would be repaired. There is no receiving/sending. Today I am taking my computer to another area to ensure that you receive this update. So if there is a temporary breakdown in our communication you would understand why that is so.

Kind regards until we are in touch again.  
johanna

Begin forwarded message:

**From:** "Johanna Merry" <[merryjo@eircom.net](mailto:merryjo@eircom.net)>  
**Date:** July 22, 2010 3:39:47 AM CDT  
**To:** "Rosemary E. McHugh" <[mchughrosemary@gmail.com](mailto:mchughrosemary@gmail.com)>  
**Subject:** RE: RE : Express Post.

Dear Dr McHugh,

Thank you for your prompt response. Like you, I am relieved that the letter was found and reached you. Yes, the letter was read out to me by Fr McCaffrey's Prior as Fr McCaffrey's expressive speech function is a bit impaired.

When I initially put your complaint to him on July 6<sup>th</sup>, it seemed to me that his emotions did not match his expression of words of regret – in fact he was smiling while he said how sorry he was and that he did wrong. I wondered if he had ?affect disturbances secondary to his stroke. I inquired from other Friars who knew him at an earlier age – prior to his stroke.

They told me that he was always "that way – a little odd". So I am of the view that perhaps he has a ?personality disorder that manifests in the splitting off/disconnection of his emotions from his actions and may explain why in your reported incident that he ?did not have the capacity to appraise his actions with corresponding emotional expression appropriate to his behaviour.

I have done the archival trawl and I can confirm that there are no records of previous complaints or any information within the anecdotal history of the Friars. Your complaint is the first such complaint.

I am fully aware that such behaviour is often serial, never once off – neither does it diminish with age. We have put very stringent Risk Management monitoring structures in place and in light of Fr McCaffrey's response we are considering whether or not he should present for a comprehensive clinical risk assessment – all too late as it may seem given his age and state of health. But it is being considered.

This by no means is intended to take away or lessen the hurt of the damaging effects of his behaviour on you – I share this information to help you to make meaning of your experience and for you to help us in bringing this matter to resolution with you.

I look forward to when I would hear from you again following the SNAP conference.  
I go on my summer break 30<sup>th</sup> July to 30<sup>th</sup> August. Hopefully I would hear from you before I go.

With grateful thanks and every good wish,  
johanna

**From:** Rosemary E McHugh [<mailto:mchughrosemary@gmail.com>]  
**Sent:** 22 July 2010 05:06  
**To:** johanna merry

To: johanna merry  
Subject: Re: RE : Express Post.

Dear Dr. Merry,

Thankyou for following up. DHL never notified me that they delivered the letter from you to the rental office of the apartment building where I live. Since I had heard nothing and after getting your email today, I went down to the rental office and asked them to check if there was any mail for me in their storage room. Thank goodness they did find the letter and gave it to me.

I plan to contact DHL to ask why I was not notified by them of the delivery. In fact, there is no indication, on their brief address, of the date when it was delivered.

Frankly, it is probably better to send any communication by the regular mail so that the postman will put any of my mail in my mailbox.

I have read what Fr. D. McCaffrey wrote. Did you read the letter? I am sorry to hear that he has had a stroke.

His stroke may account for him getting my first name incorrect, and for incorrectly thinking we had beer. when I prepared a pot of tea, and for other inconsistencies in what he wrote. He called me Rosaleen and my name is Rosemary.

In all honesty, I cannot remember if we actually did take time to drink a cup of tea in my flat, before I drove him to where he lived because, after the shock of being sexually assaulted, I went numb and withdrew emotionally.

I drove him back to the Carmelite Church where he lived at St. Teresa Church on Clarendon Street in the center of Dublin.

As I stated before, I do not remember speaking to him in the car. I could not understand why he, a priest, showed no embarrassment for what he had done, no understanding of my feelings, and no apology.

Johanna, I will be in touch with you after I attend the SNAP Conference that is being held in Chicago in a few weeks. I feel that I need to meet the people who are daily dealing with priest sex abuse cases, to get their input on how I should proceed.

Thank you for all that you are doing. I love our Church and want it to reflect what Jesus would want it to be. I believe it is our responsibility to address the priest sex abuse scandal for the good of the Church.

Sincerely, in gratitude,  
Rosemary Eileen McHugh, M.D.

On Jul 21, 2010, at 4:22 AM, johanna merry wrote:

Dear Dr McHugh,

I am just wondering if the express post has reached you as yet – the Prior posted it on the morning of 14<sup>th</sup> July.

Look forward to hearing from you and if you think that it would be helpful to have a phone conversation – we can make an arrangement to do so.