

**Manchester City Council
Report for Resolution**

Report to: Executive – 8 March 2017

Subject: Evaluation of phase 1 and 2 of 20mph programme

Report of: Interim Director of Highways

Summary

This report provides an overview of the impact of the 20mph speed limits introduced over the last 2 years on speeding and accidents.

Recommendations

Executive is recommended to:

- 1 Note the results of the evaluation of the phase 1 and 2 roll outs of the 20mph limits.
 - 2 Complete Phase 2 of the 20 mph programme.
 - 3 Continue supporting completed Phases 1 and 2 of the 20 mph scheme as approved at the Executive meetings of 14th March 2012 and 29th May 2013.
 - 4 Monitor and review road safety and if necessary prioritise funding on alternative road safety schemes through the creation of tailored community lead projects, which will be evaluated over time to help inform future decisions about where investments should be placed to achieve reduced accidents and an improved sense of place.
 - 5 Subject to grant approval processes, approve the reallocation of existing funding from the development of new 20mph schemes to alternative types of road safety measures involving speed reduction.
 - 6 Delegate authority to the Interim Director of Highways, in consultation with the Executive Member for the Environment, to determine what future evaluation is required and subject to constitutional limitations, use of existing funding reallocated to alternative types of road safety measures as they think necessary.
-

Wards Affected

All

Manchester Strategy outcomes	Summary of the contribution to the strategy
A thriving and sustainable city: supporting a diverse and distinctive economy that creates jobs and opportunities	Our transport network has a vital role to play in Manchester's economic vitality. Safe access to employment and retail opportunities will have a positive impact on growth.
A highly skilled city: world class and home grown talent sustaining the city's economic success	Regeneration aspirations will rely on effective transport links to enable employees and visitors to access new homes and workplaces.
A progressive and equitable city: making a positive contribution by unlocking the potential of our communities	A safe local road network will ensure that those people in most need of access to local services have the best ease of movement, whilst also facilitating the support to vulnerable people within their own communities.
A liveable and low carbon city: a destination of choice to live, visit, work	Safe roads is one of the factors that people consider in deciding whether to live in an area. Providing safe access to education, healthcare, employment, leisure and social opportunities enables people to make the most of life, supporting stronger communities. Encouraging walking through the investment in safe routes will reduce the carbon footprint of the city.
A connected city: world class infrastructure and connectivity to drive growth	A safer road network will be more accessible. We want to encourage more walking to schools and places of work to reduce congestion and ensure that residential communities are more connected and encouraged to use local facilities.

Full details are in the body of the report, along with any implications for

- Equal Opportunities Policy
- Risk Management
- Legal Considerations

Financial Consequences – Revenue

None

Financial Consequences – Capital

The City Council is able to apply for a further £687k grant funding from TfGM for Road Safety Schemes. This funding may, subject to grant conditions, be applied to other schemes which has the primary purpose of improving road safety.

Contact Officers:

Name: Kim Dorrington
Position: Director of Highways
Telephone: 07885 540244
E-mail: k.dorrington@manchester.gov.uk

Name: Rachel Christie
Position: Strategic Lead Public Realm
Telephone: 07747 876325
E-mail: r.christie@manchester.gov.uk

Background documents (available for public inspection):

The following documents disclose important facts on which the report is based and have been relied upon in preparing the report. Copies of the background documents are available up to 4 years after the date of the meeting. If you would like a copy please contact one of the contact officers above.

Report to The Executive 14 March 2012: 20mph speed limits on non-major residential roads.

Report to The Executive 29 May 2013: 20mph speed limits on non-major residential roads.

1.0 Introduction

- 1.1 Between 2003 and 2012, 20mph zones were installed outside 138 schools at a cost of £8.3m (at an average cost of £60k / scheme). This work included both the setting of speed limits and the introduction of speed reduction measures.
- 1.2 In February 2012 the Council passed a motion for officers to produce a report to the Executive on the feasibility of installing a city-wide 20mph limit on residential roads, excluding major routes as appropriate. The Executive considered this report in March. The report stated there was evidence which suggested that lower vehicle speeds resulting from 20mph speed limits would contribute to a reduction in the number of casualties. However, the report also stated that this is a relatively new policy area and there is not enough reliable evidence to make firm predictions of the impact in Manchester. On considering this report the Executive agreed to investigate the potential funding mechanisms to implement 20mph speed limits on all C and U class roads in Manchester with a view to installing the proposed speed limits, subject to public consultation, and available funding. In 2013 officers reported to Executive that public health funding was available to support the roll out of 20mph limits and Executive agreed a set of principles so that officers could determine where the funding should be prioritised. Officers reported that these speed limits would be installed without any associated speed reduction measures and that roll outs would be accompanied by a communication campaign which would seek to enlist public support for the limits, with the intention that so that the new speed limits would in effect be self policing.
- 1.3 Phase 1 of the roll out of 20mph limits then commenced and this covered 3 defined areas (approximately 20% of the city) where 20mph speed limits were introduced on residential roads in Ancoats and Clayton, Bradford, Fallowfield, Gorton North, Gorton South, Hulme, Longsight, Miles Platting and Newton Heath, Moss Side and Rusholme. This work was completed in August 2014. Speed monitoring was undertaken in advance of implementation. There was a good level of media coverage and a wide diversity of community campaigning including roadshows with Key 103, and on street consultation lead by University Students. The City Council also provided community grants for communities to put on their own support events.
- 1.4 In 2014 a further £500k was allocated to 20mph roll out from DfT local growth funds. This funding was used for the roads in between the existing three areas in phase 1 as well all wards in the south of the city (north of the M60), together with the city centre to be subject to 20mph limits. This created one 'super' area covering all of central, east and south Manchester. The scheme was implemented by January 2016. This phase was complemented by roadshows.
- 1.5 For both phases speed monitoring was undertaken in advance of implementation. In order to evaluate the impact of the scheme additional speed assessments were undertaken for 1 week in late September 2016 on the same roads.

2.0 Evaluation of Speed Monitoring Results

- 2.1 The results showed that on most roads there is only a marginal change, both up and down in road speeds. There are also a handful of roads where the degree of change is so significant. These results are provided in Appendix 1.
- 2.2 The results of the evaluation show an average 0.7mph speed reduction on roads where 20mph speed limits were introduced. Experience of speed reduction from the introduction of 20mph limits in other cities is similar. The London Borough of Islington has reported that following implementation of 20mph limits (from 2002 to 2009) there has been an average 1mph reduction on non-principal roads. Bristol have reported a 0.9mph reduction (they commenced rolling out 20mph limits from 2010 and completed the roll out in 2014) Bristol have also stated that 65% of roads monitored saw a reduction in speed (compared to 53% in our sample). Bristol are now carrying out monitoring over a 6 month period to gain a more comprehensive understanding of the impact of the limits on speed.

3.0 Impact on Accidents

- 3.1 The evaluation of the impact on accidents has been undertaken against phase one only - the impact at phase 2 cannot be evaluated accurately yet as this has been in force for only twelve months.

The areas evaluated for phase one are:

- Area 1 – Gorton North & South
- Area 2 – Miles Platting & Newton Heath
- Area 3 – Moss Side & Fallowfield

The summary of the results for these three areas are given in the table below and have been compared to the citywide average reduction. The figures are comparing periods in 2012/14 with 2014/16. The numerical figures are given in brackets.

3.2

Casualty Type	Rate Citywide	Rate Area 1	Rate Area 2	Rate Area 3
Pedestrian	-29% (673 to 444)	-23% (34 to 26)	-16% (12 to 10)	-14% (7 to 6)
Cyclist	-42% (475 to 274)	-16% (12 to 10)	-12% (8 to 7)	-12% (8 to 7)

- 3.3 Overall the results show that casualties in the phase 1 20mph area have not reduced as much as the casualty numbers citywide. We would need to evaluate data over a longer time to get data that is more statistically relevant. In addition the vast majority of accidents occur along main roads and junctions and in the city centre; so a more accurate comparison would perhaps be with a similar sized residential area with no 20mph limits.

4.0 Enforcement and Compliance

- 4.1 GMP run many enforcement days of action under the banner of 'Operation Considerate' which has the aim of making all road users 'considerate' of each other and the respective risk. This enforcement is rotated through Greater Manchester and focuses on moving traffic offences. Since the implementation of the 20mph scheme, there have been 251 recorded offences at School Lane, Didsbury and 101 drivers have been caught speeding on Nell Lane. GMP are also working with communities to create speed watch areas. GMP's experience of traffic enforcement is often that the people they are fining are people who live locally.
- 4.2.1 GMP have also been working with local communities to take action against anti social drivers; those who drive at speeds well in excess of the speed limits, often late at night. GMP have used their powers to confiscate vehicles which sends a powerful message to those drivers that these type of offences will not be tolerated.
- 4.3 For the past three years, GMP have also focused on improving awareness of driving standards amongst younger drivers through the 'Safe Drive Stay Alive' campaign, which culminates in an annual stage presentation late in the year. This is run in conjunction with other emergency services and looks at young drivers' behaviour and the consequences of poor driving, linking in with Greater Manchester schools and colleges. In 2015, 6940 young people attended the presentations and an evaluation report can be found on the website, <http://safedrivegm.co.uk>.
- 4.4 GMP has developed the Community Speedwatch scheme over the past year, which utilising funding from TfGM, has seen sites set up by community volunteers where the thresholds for regular speed enforcement are not being met.

5.0 Conclusions from the evaluation results

- 5.1 In terms of the speed reduction results and casualty reduction levels for phases 1 and 2 may be less than anticipated, however, the speed reductions are comparable to those outcomes in other cities. Even small reductions in speed are estimated to have a relatively good outcome in terms of casualty reduction and the Royal Society of the Prevention of Accidents estimates that for a 1mph reduction in speed there is a 6% reduction in accidents. In conclusion the datasets are small and there is a need to monitor over a longer period of time to gain a more meaningful data set which can guide future decisions.
- 5.2 In terms of impact what the evaluation to date has not captured is whether the 20mph limits have had an impact on the sense of place within our neighbourhoods. There are a number of cases where communities are already taking a leadership role in trying to change behaviours but what is not known is whether this has had an impact on driver behaviour and whether any impact

has been sustained. Signs are only the start, not the end, in terms of achieving speed reduction. Community engagement and ownership of the issue, concurrent with the Our Manchester approach, could be argued to be just as, if not more important, than signs.

6.0 Current Funding Allocation

- 6.1 The scheme has not had the impact that the Council would anticipated and whilst ongoing evaluation is being undertaken there are alternatives that the Executive may wish to consider to improve safety to ensure the Council uses a range of appropriate tools rather than just 20MPH. The Council will be undertaking a general review of road safety and would look to prioritise funding on road safety schemes to protect local communities. Currently we have the potential to access transport funds of £800k. £113k is required to complete the signage for phase 2 but the remaining £687k could be, subject to meeting grant conditions, allocated to other appropriate road safety schemes.

7.0 Contributing to the Manchester Strategy

(a) A thriving and sustainable city

- 7.1 Our transport network has a vital role to play in Manchester's economic vitality. Regeneration aspirations will rely on effective transport links to enable employees and visitors to access new homes and workplaces.

(b) A highly skilled city

- 7.2 Regeneration aspirations will rely on effective transport links to enable employees and visitors to access new homes and workplaces.

(c) A progressive and equitable city

- 7.3 A safe local road network will ensure that those people in most need of access to local services have the best ease of movement, whilst also facilitating the support to vulnerable people within their own communities.

(d) A liveable and low carbon city

- 7.4 Safe roads is one of the factors that people consider in deciding whether to live in an area. Providing safe access to education, healthcare, employment, leisure and social opportunities enables people to make the most of life, supporting stronger communities. Encouraging walking through the investment in safe routes will reduce the carbon footprint of the city.

(e) A connected city

- 7.5 A safer road network will be more accessible. We want to encourage more walking to schools and places of work to reduce congestion and ensure that residential communities are more connected and encouraged to use local facilities.

8.0 Key Policies and Considerations

(a) Equal Opportunities

- 8.1 A safe road network will improve access for pedestrians and cyclists, contributing to making the environment accessible to all.

(b) Risk Management

- 8.2 Where appropriate a risk management approach will be undertaken.

(c) Legal Considerations

- 8.3 There are no legal considerations arising from this report.

Appendix 1

Phase 2

Road	Current Speed Limit (mph)	Before Mean Speed (mph) (all directions)	After Mean Speed (mph) (all directions)	Change in speed (mph)
Alexandra Road South	30	28.7	28.9	0.2
Buckingham Road	20	21.4	22.3	0.9
Burton Road	30	22.4	22.8	0.4
Cringle Road	20	23.8	21.8	-2
Daisy Bank Road	20	24.2	22.3	-1.9
Demesne Road	20	18.9	14.1	-4.8
Gordon Avenue	20	21	20.1	-0.9
Great Western Street	20	22.4	22.4	0
Hathersage Road	20	23.8	24	0.2
Kingshill Road	20	16	17.9	1.9
Louisa Street	20	24.1	24.1	0
Manor Road	20	25.7	24.3	-1.4
Meltham Avenue	20	23	13.6	-9.4
Old Hall Lane	20	23.1	23.5	0.4
Parkhouse Street	20	26.7	25.3	-1.4
Rylance Street	20	28	21	-7
Stephens Road	20	21.3	19.3	-2
Upper Park Road	20	21.9	21.9	0

Phase 1

Road	Current Speed Limit (mph)	Before Mean Speed (mph) (all directions)	After Mean Speed (mph) (all directions)	Change in speed (mph)
Winsford Road	20	22.9	19.8	-3.1
Wembley Road	20	25.6	25.2	-0.4
Varley Street	20	28.9	28.2	-0.7
Ten Acres Lane	20	25.7	25.8	0.1
Stovell Avenue	20	22.2	21.4	-0.8
Stanley Grove	20	26.5	26.3	-0.2
Scotland Hall Road	20	20.9	24.7	3.8
Riverpark Road	20	33.7	32.8	-0.9
Ravensbury Street	20	24.1	18.7	-5.4
Platt Lane	20	27.8	26.3	-1.5
Palmerstone Street	20	21	20.4	-0.6
North Road	20	25.4	25.2	-0.2
Moss Lane East	20	25.7	25.3	-0.4
Moss Lane East	30	26.6	25.4	-1.2
Lloyd Street South	20	22	22.3	0.3
Lloyd Street North	20	25.8	24.6	-1.2
Levenshulme Road	20	24	24.3	0.3

Road	Current Speed Limit (mph)	Before Mean Speed (mph) (all directions)	After Mean Speed (mph) (all directions)	Change in speed (mph)
Landcross Road	20	19.8	17.4	-2.4
Laburnum Road	20	21.9	22.2	0.3
Kirkmanshulme Lane	30	32.1	30.6	-1.5
Hemmons Road	20	18.3	19.5	1.2
Greenheys Lane	20	22.1	26.5	4.4
Droylesden Road	20	25.6	26.2	0.6
Dickenson Road	30	23.9	23.2	-0.7
Chapman Street	20	23.3	24.5	1.2
Cambrian Street	20	22.9	23.1	0.2
Butler Street	20	28.4	28.3	-0.1
Broadfield Road	20	19.7	20	0.3
Briscoe Lane	20	24.3	24.4	0.1
Bowes Street	20	26.7	25	-1.7
Bower Street	20	29	30.8	1.8
Bank Street	20	24	24.1	0.1

Total	Average change on 20mph roads	-0.7
	Average change on 30mph roads	-0.6
	Number of 20mph roads where speed has increased	18
	Number of 20mph roads where speed has fallen	24
	Number of 20mph roads where speed has stayed the same	3