

ALIF AILAAAN
MIDTERM **REPORT CARD**
FOR MEMBERS OF THE
PROVINCIAL ASSEMBLY
BALUCHISTAN

Alif Ailaan Midterm Report Card for Members of the Provincial Assembly - Balochistan

May 11, 2013 to November 11, 2015

On November 11, 2015, Pakistan's four provincial assemblies and the National Assembly reached the midterm mark in their tenure. The Alif Ailaan campaign has tried to gauge every MNA and MPA through the performance of their respective constituencies since the 2013 elections against four indicators for education and awarded grades in each category, as well as an overall grade to each MNA, each MPA, and the assemblies. The grades do not reflect the state of education in a given constituency, but rather the demonstrable change in each constituency since the 2013 election.

This document contains the Alif Ailaan Midterm Report Card for MPAs of the Balochistan Assembly.

What the MPAs are graded on?

The four indicators on which MPAs have been graded on are:

- a) The state of school facilities (with the highest grades for those constituencies that made the most progress in the provision of boundary walls, electricity, drinking water and toilet facilities since the 2013 election)
- b) The state of gender parity (the ratio of boys to girls or girls to boys – with the highest grades for those constituencies that have shown the greatest movement towards gender parity since the 2013 election)
- c) The student to teacher ratio (with the highest grades for those constituencies with the largest improvement in student teacher ratio since 2013 – where low student to teacher ratios are considered better)
- d) The retention rate between class IV and class II (with the highest grades awarded to those constituencies with the highest improvement in the retention rate since 2013)

Data limitations

The compilation of the report card of the grades is not based on ideal indicators, but rather on indicators made from official government data on education that was available, as well as being representative of a desirable outcome in education. The four indicators were thus chosen to reflect the four key areas where government actions can produce direct and immediate results, namely: school building infrastructure, equal provision of education to girls and boys, the provision of sufficient teachers to meet student numbers, and the ability of the system to retain students within the primary level. The grades do not reflect the state of education in a given constituency, but rather the demonstrable change in each constituency since the 2013 election. Finally, the most recent available official government data that can be reported by constituency is from the end of 2014 – therefore the grades will not reflect any changes to the education landscape during the current calendar year.

How to read an MPA's grades

Each MPA has scored grades on school facilities, gender parity, student to teacher ratio and retention. The grades represent the quantum shift made in the given constituency for all public sector schools since the 2013 election. The allocation of grades has been standardised to a normal distribution. The highest possible grade is A+ and the lowest is E.

A low grade does not necessarily mean that a given constituency is very badly placed and a high grade does not necessarily mean that a given constituency is doing very well. Instead, grades reflect the level of progress made within a given constituency. What a low grade does however show, is that a greater effort by a given MPA may have led to a better grade, whereas a high grade shows that measurable improvement was shown in a given MPA's constituency.

Highlights of the Midterm Report Card for MPAs of the Balochistan Assembly

The report card for the Provincial Assembly Balochistan shows that across the entire population of 51 elected MPAs, only three MPAs can lay claim to constituencies where there is evidence of real overall progress since the 2013 general election. Regional divides continue to feature prominently in the Balochistan education landscape, with most of the constituencies from southern Balochistan featuring prominently among the worst performing constituencies, suggesting continued widespread neglect in this region. Nushki, Kharan, Washuk have the only constituencies with overall A grades. All three of Killa Abdullah's constituencies receive a B grade. The Chief Minister Dr. Abdul Malik Baloch's constituency scores an overall B grade. Nasirabad has the worst performing constituencies overall with 1 C and 1 D grade.

The overall grade for the Provincial Assembly of Balochistan is a B.

School facilities: Constituencies from Nushki, Kharan, Washuk, Kech and Kachhi have shown the most improvement in terms of school facilities. Nasirabad and Panjgur have performed worst in amenities' improvements with both constituencies in each district scoring D grades. All six of Quetta's constituencies received three Bs and three Cs, respectively. None of Jafferabad's three constituencies scored a grade above C, while both of Lasbela's two constituencies received C grades. The majority of constituencies appear not to have improved in terms of facilities, with 55% of constituencies receiving a C or D.

Retention rates: In terms of student retention, PB-23 Kohlu is the most improved constituency with the only A+ grade. PB-14 Loralai, PB-21 Sibi, and PB-29 Nasirabad are the worst performers in terms of student retention, with E grades. Two out of three constituencies in Pishin (PB-9 and PB-10) have received A grades in student retention. The chief minister's constituency (PB-48) received a C grade. 51% of constituencies in Balochistan have scored a B or above in student retention, suggesting only slight improvement overall in the province.

Gender parity: The most improvement in gender-parity in Balochistan has been shown in two constituencies; PB-5 Quetta-V, and PB-27 Jaffarabad-III. The worst performing constituencies were Moulvi Muazullah Musakhail's (PB-15 Musakhail), and Muhammad Khan Lehri's (PB-29 Nasirabad-II). Both of Kachhi's two constituencies scored a D grade while none of Quetta's six

constituencies receive a grade below B. All of Killa Abdullah's 3 constituencies received B grades. The Advisor to CM on Finance Mir Khalid Langau's constituency (PB-36 Kallat-I) scores a D grade. There is a slight improvement across the province on parity between the genders, with 59% of MPA constituencies in Balochistan scoring a B or above.

Student-teacher ratio: The spread of constituency performance in terms of student/teacher ratio is relatively equally distributed across the north and south. Constituencies from Killa Abdullah, Loralai, Jhal Magsi, Chagai, Kharan and Washuk appear to have made the greatest movement toward improved student teacher ratios. Some constituencies from the southern districts appear to have deteriorated considerably than others in terms of student/teacher ratio, with constituencies from Dera Bugti, Jafferabad, Nasirabad, Kech, Kohlu and Sibi receiving D or E grades. All of Killa Abdullah's three constituencies receive a B or above, while all three constituencies of Jafferabad's score a C or below. All of Khuzdar's three constituencies receive a B. There appears to be scant improvement in the province overall, with over 53% of constituencies scoring a C or below.

Homework for MPAs who want to improve

Every MPA in the province is performing below par. Even recipients of A grades would not send their own children to a government school. The grades here are being awarded to the state of government schools. This report card clearly shows that there is not only a lot of room for improvement in the state of government schools overall, but a lot of room for improvement in the effort that MPAs invest in improving education. Further, MPAs can help improve education through data collection, openness and reporting. Acquiring, processing, cleaning and presenting the data for this exercise is an incredibly resource-intensive exercise that government should be doing itself.

Government also must begin to produce data faster, and across a richer array of variables – particularly data on learning outcomes and education quality.

All MPAs can easily pad their grades by insisting on timely and effective improvements in school facility provision, on which government has a rich and detailed database. The recent focus on the roll-out of a much-improved data-regime by the Balochistan government is a step in the right direction. The MPAs need to make sure that the new data-regime provides accurate and timely information not only on the basis of administrative and geographical boundaries, but along political ones as well.

MPAs can also affect better student to teacher ratios by insisting on rational allocations of teachers, rather than postings and transfers that suit their patronage of political actors in their constituencies.

Encouraging girls enrolment and ensuring that practices like corporal punishment are prevented will help MPAs improve gender parity and better retention rates.

The ultimate report card for MPAs will be delivered in 2018 – when the time for re-election comes around. Alif Ailaan hopes to ensure that when it does, voters across the country will be

strict and demanding examiners. Much stricter, than the rigorous methodology used to develop this midterm report card!

Balochistan MPA Report Card:

Name of the constituency	Balochistan MPA	Political party	Facilities grade	Retention grade	Gender parity grade	Student-teacher ratio grade	Overall grade
PB-1 QUETTA-I	Tahir Mehmood Khan	Pakistan Muslim League (N)	C	B	B	C	B
PB-2 QUETTA-II	Syed Muhammad Raza	Majlis-e-Wahdat-e-Muslimeen Pakistan	C	B	B	C	B
PB-3 QUETTA-III	Nawab Muhammad Ayaz Khan Jogezeai	Pukhtoonkhwa Milli Awami Party	C	C	B	C	C
PB-4 QUETTA-IV	Raza Mohmmad Barech	Pukhtoonkhwa Milli Awami Party	B	B	B	C	B
PB-5 QUETTA-V	Nasrullah Khan Barech	Pukhtoonkhwa Milli Awami Party	B	C	A+	B	B
PB-6 QUETTA-VI	Manzoor Ahmed Kakar	Pukhtoonkhwa Milli Awami Party	B	B	B	B	B
PB-7 ZIARAT	Gul Muhammad Khan Dummer	Jamiat Ulama-e-Islam (F)	C	C	B	C	C
PB-8 PISHIN-I	Agha Syed Liaquat Ali	Pukhtoonkhwa Milli Awami Party	B	B	B	B	B
PB-9 PISHIN-II	Haji Abdul Malik Kakar	Jamiat Ulama-e-Islam (F)	C	A	C	C	B
PB-10 PISHIN-III	Sardar Gulam Mustafa Khan Tareen	Pukhtoonkhwa Milli Awami Party	B	A	B	B	B
PB-11 KILLA ABDULLAH-I	Hamid Khan Achakzai	Pukhtoonkhwa Milli Awami Party	B	D	B	B	B
PB-12 KILLA ABDULLAH-II	Zamrak Khan	Awami National Party	B	C	B	B	B
PB-13 KILLA ABDULLAH-III	Abdul Majeed Khan Achakzai	Pukhtoonkhwa Milli Awami Party	C	C	B	A	B
PB-14 LORALAI-I	Sardar Dur Muhammad Nasir	Pakistan Muslim League (N)	C	E	C	A+	C
PB-15 MUSAKHAIL	Muazullah Moulvi Musakhail	Jamiat Ulama-e-Islam (F)	B	B	E	B	C
PB-16 LORALA-II	Ubaid Ullah Jan Babat	Pukhtoonkhwa Milli Awami Party	C	C	C	B	C
PB-17 BARKHAN	Sardar Abdul Rehman Khetran	Jamiat Ulama-e-Islam (F)	B	C	A	C	B
PB-18 SHERANI-ZHOB	Mufti Gulab Khan Sheikh Jaffar Khan Mandokhail	Jamiat Ulama-e-Islam (F)	B	C	B	C	B
PB-19 ZHOB		Pakistan Muslim League	C	B	B	C	B
PB-20 KILLA SAIFULLAH	Maulana Abdul Wasi	Jamiat Ulama-e-Islam (F)	D	B	B	B	B
PB-21 SIBI-I	Sarfaraz Chakar Domki	Pakistan Muslim League (N)	B	E	C	D	C
PB-22 HARNAI--SIBI	Abdul Rahim Ziaratwal	Pukhtoonkhwa Milli Awami Party	C	B	B	C	B
PB-23 KOHLU	Nawabzada Jangaiz Marri	Pakistan Muslim League (N)	C	A+	D	D	C
PB-24 DERA BUGTI	Sarfaraz Ahmed Bugti	Pakistan Muslim League (N)	C	C	B	D	C
PB-25 JAFFARABAD-I	Mir Jaan Muhammad Jamali	Pakistan Muslim League (N)	C	B	C	C	C
PB-26 JAFFARABAD-II	Rahat Jamali	Pakistan Muslim League (N)	D	C	B	C	C
PB-27 JAFFARABAD-III	Mir Izhar Hussain Khoso	Pakistan Muslim League (N)	C	D	A+	D	C
PB-28 NASIRABAD-I	Mir Abdul Majid Abro	Pakistan Muslim League (N)	D	C	B	D	C
PB-29 NASIRABAD-II	Muhammad Khan Lehri	Pakistan Muslim League (N)	D	E	E	B	D
PB-30 KACHHI-I	Mir Muhammad Asim Kurd Gello	Pakistan Muslim League (N)	B	B	D	C	C
PB-31 KACHHI-II	Mir Aamir Khan Rind	Pakistan Muslim League (N)	A	C	D	C	C
PB-32 JHAL MAGSI	Nawabzada Tariq Magsi	Independent	C	C	B	A+	B
PB-33 KHUZDAR-I	Nawab Sanaullah Khan Zehri	Pakistan Muslim League (N)	C	C	B	B	B

Name of the constituency	Balochistan MPA	Political party	Facilities grade	Retention grade	Gender parity grade	Student-teacher ratio grade	Overall grade
PB-34 KHUZDAR-II	Sardar Muhammad Aslam Bizenjo	National Party	B	B	A	B	B
PB-35 KHUZDAR-III	Sardar Akhtar Jan Mengal	Balochistan National Party	C	B	D	B	C
PB-36 KALLAT-I	Mir Khalid Langau	National Party	B	B	D	B	B
PB-37 KALLAT-II	Mir Zafar Ullah Khan Zehri	Balochistan National Party (Awami)	B	A	B	B	B
PB-38 MASTUNG-QUETTA	Nawab Mohmmad Khan Shawani	National Party	B	C	B	C	B
PB-39 CHAGAI-I	Mir Amanullah Notezai	Pakistan Muslim League (N)	C	B	D	A+	B
PB-40 NUSHKI	Haji Ghulam Dastagir Badini	Pakistan Muslim League (N)	A+	A	C	B	A
PB-41 AWARAN	Mir Abdul Quddus Bizenjo	Pakistan Muslim League	C	B	A	B	B
PB-42 PANJGUR-I	Remat Ali Baloch	National Party	D	B	C	C	C
PB-43 PANJGUR-II	Haji Muhammad Islam	National Party	D	C	A	B	B
PB-44 LASBELA-I	Prince Ahmed Ali	Pakistan Muslim League (N)	C	B	C	C	C
PB-45 LASBELA-II	Mohmmad Saleh Bhotani	Pakistan Muslim League (N)	C	C	C	C	C
PB-46 KHARAN	Mir Abdul Karim Nousherwani	Pakistan Muslim League	A+	B	C	A+	A
PB-47 WASHUK	Mir Mujeeb-ur-Rehman Muhammad Hasani	National Party	A+	A	D	A	A
PB-48 KECH-I	Dr. Abdul Malik Baloch	National Party	B	C	B	C	B
PB-49 KECH-II	Fateh Mohammad Buledi	National Party	A	C	C	E	C
PB-50 KECH-III	Mir Akbar Askani	Pakistan Muslim League (N)	B	A	A	C	B
PB-51 GWADAR	Mir Hamal Kalmati	Balochistan National Party	C	C	C	C	C
Reserved seats for women							
PB-1 QUETTA-I	Shahida Rauf	Jamiat Ulama-e-Islam (F)	C	B	B	C	B
PB-2 QUETTA-II	Ruqia Saeed Hashmi	Pakistan Muslim League	C	B	B	C	B
PB-2 QUETTA-II	Masooma Hayat	Pukhtoonkhwa Milli Awami Party	C	B	B	C	B
PB-3 QUETTA-III	Spozmi Achakzai	Pukhtoonkhwa Milli Awami Party	C	C	B	C	C
PB-4 QUETTA-IV	Kishwar Ahmed	Pakistan Muslim League (N)	B	B	B	C	B
PB-4 QUETTA-IV	Reheela Hameed Khan Durrani	Pakistan Muslim League (N)	B	B	B	C	B
PB-4 QUETTA-IV	Dr. Shama Ishaq Baloch	National Party	B	B	B	C	B
PB-5 QUETTA-V	Yasmeen Bibi	National Party	B	C	A+	B	B
PB-6 QUETTA-VI	Samina Khan	Pakistan Muslim League (N)	B	B	B	B	B
PB-19 ZHOB	Fariza	Pukhtoonkhwa Milli Awami Party	C	B	B	C	B
PB-39 CHAGHAI-I	Husan Bano	Jamiat Ulama-e-Islam (F)	C	B	D	A+	B
Reserved seats for minorities							
PB-1 QUETTA-I	William Jan Barkat	Pukhtoonkhwa Milli Awami Party	C	B	B	C	B
PB-24 DERA BUGTI	Santosh Kumar	Pakistan Muslim League (N)	C	C	B	D	C

Name of the constituency	Balochistan MPA	Political party	Facilities grade	Retention grade	Gender parity grade	Student-teacher ratio grade	Overall grade
Overall grade			C	B	B	B	B



alifailaan.pk | @alifailaan | facebook.com/alifailaan

