

#BlockSidewalk

October 20, 2019

A Tapestry of Concerns

Public statements by 65+ Toronto-area individuals and organizations on Sidewalk Labs' proposed test-bed neighbourhood on Toronto's waterfront

In July, a group of “30 civic leaders” in Toronto added their names to a public letter circulated by the Toronto Regional Board of Trade, with assistance from Sidewalk Labs, calling for Torontonians to support the Sidewalk Labs proposal.¹ The letter reduced concerns with the project to “details” around “data governance...and a final path to rapid transit financing.”

Torontonians' concerns about Sidewalk Labs' proposed test bed on public waterfront land, however, move well beyond “details,” and by the time TRBOT published its letter, expressions of concern had already outnumbered expressions of unreserved support by a large margin.

Below are brief quotations from concerns about the Sidewalk Labs proposal circulated publicly by Toronto-area residents and organizations, written in their own words and made public at their own behest. The authors speak from different perspectives, walks of life and political persuasions, but all evidence thoughtfulness, care and a commitment to the future of our city. Waterfront Toronto would do well to listen to these voices.

“[D]o we really need a coup d'état to get transit and nice paving stones?”
-*Toronto waterfront resident Julie Beddoes*²

“The building designs illustrated could not be more conventional, not to say boring,”
-*Jack Diamond, five times winner of Governor General's Medal in Architecture*³

“[F]rustratingly abstract,” “unwieldy and repetitive,” and “overly focused on the ‘what’ rather than the ‘how.’”
-*Waterfront Toronto Digital Strategy Advisory Panel members*⁴

#BlockSidewalk

“The issues that can’t be captured by the [Sidewalk Labs] plan, they’re the real problem. It’s what’s happening outside the lines. Fundamentally, this company is taking a run at our governments.”

-Bianca Wylie, Co-Founder, Tech Reset Canada⁵

“The majority of respondents...say they would not like to live in Sidewalk Toronto... Most respondents ...do not trust Sidewalk Labs to collect data on its residents...”

-Forum poll, July 19, 2019⁶

“Of all the misguided innovation strategies Canada has launched over the past three decades, this purported smart city is not only the dumbest but also the most dangerous.”

- Jim Balsillie, former Chairman and co-CEO of Research In Motion⁷

“Should this plan get approved, it will set an extremely disturbing precedent for the country as a whole, compromising the principles of transparency and accountability.”

-Acorn Canada, September 2019⁸

“One of the biggest concerns with a project such as Sidewalk Toronto (and the reason why it's had such global coverage) is we are a test lab in many ways for a larger initiative that can be brought into other cities across the world. And it is our civic responsibility to ensure that we are not a test bed to something that is not equitable and that is not justice focused.”

-Nasma Ahmed, Digital Justice Lab⁹

“The digital governance proposals set out in the [Sidewalk proposal] raise several concerns, including: a lack of independent public oversight, a cumbersome mandate that overlaps with that of my office and the federal Privacy Commissioner, and an insufficient role for the City given its experience delivering municipal services in the public interest.”

-Brian Beamish, Ontario Information and Privacy Commissioner¹⁰

#BlockSidewalk

“Sidewalk Labs received more information from Waterfront Toronto prior to the RFP than other parties that would be responding to the RFP.”

-Bonnie Lysyk, Ontario Auditor General¹¹

“Imbued with neoliberal, colonial, and positivistic logics, the smart city risks further eroding democracy, privacy, and equity in favour of promoting privatization, surveillance, and an increased concentration of power and wealth among corporate and state elite. While the publicized promise of the smart city may continuously shift to reflect and co-opt oppositional narratives, its logics remain static, and its beneficiaries remain few.”

-Sahar Raza, Communications and Culture program, Ryerson University¹²

"Canada is not Google's lab rat. We can do better. Our freedom from unlawful public surveillance is worth fighting for."

-Michael Bryant, Executive Director, Canadian Civil Liberties Association¹³

“The revelations left me very highly disturbed because all along the understanding was that this project was for a smart city for the 12 acres, and it’s very clear that they want to control the destiny of the Port Lands. That’s never been in any kind of agreement.”

-Paula Fletcher, City Councillor, Toronto Danforth¹⁴

“We must ask: does the Sidewalk proposal deliver on the promise of creating more affordable housing? That’s a hard no.”

-Jennifer Keesmat, former Chief Planner, City of Toronto¹⁵

“Sidewalk deploys a thicket of buzzwords to explain why we should do away with local control. “Smart Cities”; “pioneering a 21st-century mobility network”; and, that old stand-by, “innovation.” Don’t buy it. It’s just the latest entity that thinks it knows how to run a city better than the city’s inhabitants do.”

-Toronto City Councillor Gord Perks¹⁶

#BlockSidewalk

“The Sidewalk Labs Waterfront project in Toronto may produce the world's smartest city, but experts believe any IP generated from the project will be owned by Alphabet. Last year, some of the country's biggest cities lined up to court Amazon for their HQ2 project, offering massive incentives. Separate from the question of IP is a sobering fact: Foreign companies can pack up their Canadian operations at any moment.”

-Allen Lau, co-founder, Wattpad¹⁷

“Torontonians and Canadians must be skeptical of this project. Canadians have a right to live free from being watched all the time by both the government and the private sector. Smart cities can be good, but a privatizing experiment in surveillance capitalism is not the way forward for Toronto, or for Canada.”

-Min Sook Lee, NDP Candidate for Toronto—Danforth¹⁸

“There are existential problems with the Sidewalk Labs proposal. To dismiss them as "details" is not just insulting but a big red flag that we are being railroaded.”

- Adam Chaleff, community activist¹⁹

“This project was never about a small 12-acre site on Toronto’s waterfront, and the plan Sidewalk Labs has presented us with is proof of that. This is about Google trying to get access to hundreds of acres of Toronto’s prime waterfront public land. This is as much about privatization and corporate control as it is about privacy.”

-#BlockSidewalk Media Release²⁰

“Yet amidst all the focus on the physical form and the data collection systems hard-wired into the development plans, I’m most struck by Sidewalk’s ideas about how this piece of Toronto should be governed. Taken together, these proposals reveal the company’s desire to push back the City of Toronto’s ability to plan, build, finance, and manage the proposed growth in those waterfront precincts.”

-John Lorinc, journalist²¹

#BlockSidewalk

“Substantively, their data governance proposal is more of a workflow for granting licenses to collect data without public consent, than a credible steward of the public’s interest amidst a massive increase in surveillance.”

-Sean MacDonald, Lawyer²²

“Not all communities in this Toronto neighbourhood or beyond have agreed to participate in Google’s privacy petri dish – and we know that marginalized and racialized communities are affected most by surveillance. Supporting the call to reset this project as proposed is crucial. It’s time to shift the conversation to fundamental human rights. The Sidewalk Labs project gives us reason to be vigilant. “

-Daniella Barreto, digital/human rights activist²³

“We find ourselves forced into a disorienting loop where resident and local, national, and global tech community concerns are ignored, and willful misdirection has thus far been endorsed through Waterfront Toronto’s silence.”

-Saadia Muzzafer, founder, Tech Girls Canada²⁴

“The Sidewalk Labs proposal is a hot mess of futurist technologies like taxibots, self-driving cars and gondolas. Most of these projects are either underway, unviable or unnecessary when put into the context of existing public transit needs.”

-Milan Gokhale, transit activist and tech worker²⁵

“Sidewalk Labs, a Google subsidiary, has designs on Toronto’s Waterfront. In addition to unaffordable development and invasive data collection, Sidewalk Labs plans to disrupt public transit as we know it. They’re proposing more private transit and expanded ride-sharing for their Quayside neighbourhood.”

-TTC Riders leaflet²⁶

#BlockSidewalk

“What appears to be “smart” is nothing else but an attempt to sell us technology to predict human interaction, to direct human action and to remove the unforeseen, the spontaneity from city life. It is an attempt to privatize public land, under the banner of “innovation,” to replace the human at the heart of the city with algorithms that feed off our personal data, algorithms that, at the same time, rely on humanity to produce applications devoid of it (think of self-checkouts or driverless cars).”

-Thorben Wieditz, urban geographer²⁷

“...[T]his project represents a huge economic opportunity to transform the Canadian economy to higher a value digital economy, but we are basically giving away this opportunity to a foreign tech giant, Google. Sidewalk Labs will generate smart city technology ideas and applications which will be tested in the Toronto Waterfront and rolled out globally by Google who will then attain a dominant share of the global smart city technology sector estimated to be worth \$2-3T by the year 2025.”

-Paul Beck, retired hydrogeologist²⁸

“This smart-city proposal is not smart government policy. The Civic Data Trust as proposed by Sidewalk Labs is overwhelmingly to Alphabet’s advantage and to the disadvantage of Canada’s innovation system.”

– Dan Ciuriack, Economist²⁹

“While Waterfront Toronto called for proposals for a 12-acre site, Sidewalk Labs responded with a proposal for a 190-acre “IDEA district” on predominantly publicly-owned lands. There has been no public procurement for any of these additional lands. Waterfront Toronto should not be evaluating any proposals that aren’t explicitly called for in its Quayside RFP.”

-Unifor Local 2003 E³⁰

“The most critical question, however, is whether having a smart city will make us meaningfully better at solving urban problems. Data and algorithms alone don’t actually add very much on their own.”

-Shoshana Saxe, Engineer, University of Toronto³¹

#BlockSidewalk

“Google’s governance structures has no details, and no clarifications about how failures in experimental technology will be managed. Technologies associated with smart cities are evolving so rapidly that it is impossible for cities to regulate them, especially when Google is lobbying so hard to write [regulations] itself.”

-Zeesy Powers, artist/videographer³²

“And Sidewalk hasn’t come close to allaying concerns that it will be in the business of surveillance; its director of sustainability recently boasted that the company would send residents of its “Quayside” neighbourhood alerts if they throw out too much garbage. Such creepy diktats only scratch the surface of what a tech giant could do with detailed information about people’s daily movements and intimate behaviour.”

– Globe and Mail editorial board³³

“But certain actors are more able to capitalize upon data than others. Companies with significant stores of proprietary data, algorithmic modelling capacity and commercial distribution infrastructure have a distinct market advantage. Simply put, Sidewalk Labs is in a privileged position as it can draw upon Google’s vast resources in data analytics.”

-Natasha Tusikov, York University³⁴

“A corporate-designed mini-city is tearing down democracy in Canada. Toronto’s Port Lands, our waterfront, is prime real estate and can be an opportunity for us to create low-carbon, deeply affordable housing. But we can do it without Sidewalk. Google are not the government – they must make a profit off this development. Let’s ensure our community priorities do not get lost in this process.”

-Diana Yoon, NDP Candidate for Spadina—Fort York³⁵

“There is a tremendous economic opportunity in building smart cities, but Waterfront Toronto’s current management of the IP locks Canadians in as rent payers to their new and smarter IP landlords.”

– Nathalie Raffoul and Jim Hinton, attorneys³⁶

#BlockSidewalk

“There was an element of [Sidewalk Toronto’s Residents’ Reference Panel] that felt like a sales job – we were instructed not to choose whether we wanted this project or not, but to provide specific feedback on elements of it.”

-Cybele Sack, *journalist and researcher*³⁷

“It’s remarkable that, after 20 months of public presentations, lobbying and “consultations” by the company – a process that gave it access to public officials that other real estate companies never get – I still don’t know, really, what Mr. Doctoroff means.”

– Alex Bozicovic, *The Globe and Mail architecture critic*³⁸

“We are faced with a remarkable situation in which a conglomeration of private companies both own a significant part of modern social infrastructure, but are also lobbying to extend that power into other spheres: urbanism, education, governance and more.”

-Navneet Alang, *technology and culture writer*³⁹

“Sidewalk is asking for unprecedented, almost governmental power over the public realm, so we should have full public transparency. Let the public know who’s getting paid: every contractor hired, every lobbyist, every crisis communication firm, every architect, every planner, every thinker. Everyone who stands to benefit financially from Sidewalk’s proposal.”

– Shawn Micaloff, *Toronto Star columnist*⁴⁰

“This [Sidewalk proposal] is the same type of policy that developing countries like Mexico adopt in order to convince transnational corporations to set up manufacturing facilities: lax labour and environmental standards in exchange for low-wage jobs. It has the effect of locking these countries into a subordinate position in the global economy, making it harder for them to rise up the global value chain. It is not the type of policy pursued by strong, economically vibrant countries.”

-Blayne Haggart, *Political Scientist*⁴¹

#BlockSidewalk

“There’s here’s a kind of manifest destiny to Google’s plans: they spill out beyond Quayside to encompass 190 acres of the Port Lands. Such a monolithic district, on such a massive piece of land, could disrupt Waterfront Toronto’s efforts to create a coherent and continuous public realm.”

-Bruce Kuwabara, Architect⁴²

“There are so many more questions than answers when it comes to the big plans for Google’s Sidewalk Labs. There’s a term for these massive scale “smart city” projects – surveillance capitalism. It is the marketization of human behaviour in a way we’ve never seen and will open the door to so many unknowns.”

-Brian Chang, NDP Candidate for Toronto Centre⁴³

“I live in Toronto, and the last thing I want is a smart city of surveillance. I’m on the International Council of Smart Cities, and so many of these new spaces—in Shanghai, in Dubai—are cities of surveillance. Privacy forms the foundation of our freedom. You cannot have free and democratic societies without it”

-Ann Cavoukian, former Ontario Information and Privacy Commissioner⁴⁴

“At Amnesty International, the [Sidewalk Labs] project raises flags about protecting rights to privacy, equality, and non-discrimination. Increased data collection and mass surveillance can significantly impact groups who are marginalized already and replicate oppressive power structures. Rights to freedom of expression and freedom of association. Surveillance can have a chilling effect that undermines activism and political dissent, damaging social and political movements.”

-Amnesty Canada campaign⁴⁵

“Sidewalk Labs proposing the laws that will regulate their behavior is like the fox proposing the design of the hen house”

-Melissa Goldstein, housing activist⁴⁶

#BlockSidewalk

“The consideration of any potential violation of the data privacy of minors may present a point of legislative challenge to Sidewalk Toronto, especially considering the lack of transparency as to how data is collected. How Quayside’s data foraging will distinguish between data generated by minors and those over the age of digital consent is unknown. Sidewalk Toronto has made no mention of minors in any public documents to date.”

- *Siobhan O’Flynn, University of Toronto*⁴⁷

“This, to me, is clearly Sidewalk Labs saying, ‘We will own and control all of the intellectual property.’”

- *Myra Tawfik, University of Windsor*⁴⁸

“Let’s call it out: Sidewalk has no legal obligation to make their corporate games visible in Canada. And we should not keep hoping against hope that Sidewalk will somehow go against type and decide to be transparent and benevolent. But there is a large, long-established public agency whose staff and board are by law supposed to serve the public interest. This entity is Waterfront Toronto. They should not be allowed to evade their responsibilities. And, if they continue to do so, the governments that created WT must rein in the project.”

-*Mariana Valverde, Professor of Socio-Legal Studies, University of Toronto*⁴⁹

“I do not believe it was the intention of the three levels of government to allow a single limited company to become our filter, our gatekeeper and our agent. Yet through an unconventional and an opportunistic series of circumstances, I feel we have allowed this to happen.”

-*Julie Di Lorenzo, Developer and former Waterfront Toronto board member.*⁵⁰

“...on publicly owned land we should do a lot for people unable to afford what the market has to offer. Five percent (deep affordable) is laughable – it’s not serious. ... Google, like many firms, (doesn’t) have much interest in people who don’t have much money. They have an interest in having middle and high income people.”

-*David Hulchanski, University of Toronto*⁵¹

#BlockSidewalk

“Speaking in my professional capacity as a dystopian science fiction writer, I’m here to tell you that it is *obviously* a terrible idea to let vast, opaque multinational corporations privatise huge swathes of our city, webbing them with surveillance sensors and subjecting them to opaque, unaccountable algorithmic analysis and interventions. Honestly, it’s alarming that this even needs saying.”

-Cory Doctorow, author⁵²

“Let’s build cities from our civic needs up, not from the internet on down. Corporations tend to build dystopias, not communities”

-Roger Keil, York University⁵³

“Silicon Valley has shown its destructive potential by obliterating cultural and information industries – especially quality news. But now they’re jumping off the screen, and all Canadians should be concerned. We live in an era where a hotel is not a hotel, a broadcaster is not a broadcaster, and a developer isn’t a developer. By rolling out the red carpet for unaccountable and exploitative American tech firms, our government is ceding Canadian sovereignty to Silicon Valley. It’s time to BlockSidewalk. It’s time for Canadian leaders to enforce our laws and protect the rights of Canadian citizens. When it comes to our democracy, we get to choose.”

-Daniel Bernhard, Friends of Canadian Broadcasting⁵⁴

“The complex proposal is based on the acquisition of some of the most prime real estate in North America secured with public transit subsidies, tax cuts, the privatization of public services, and enhanced surveillance.”

-Steven Tufts, York University⁵⁵

“They create these big maps and show them to the public – and it’s like the World Fair or Disneyland. It gives the public misconception that all the land is theirs. It’s not.

-Chris Guerrieri, owner, Cherry Beach Sound⁵⁶

#BlockSidewalk

“On the other hand, we have Toronto's Sidewalk Labs, where the city has pretty much given over all control to the Google sibling Sidewalk Labs and allowed it to develop...in great secrecy—more secrecy than many Torontonians and digital authorities would like...”

-Peter Kent⁵⁷

“There is a great risk of a ‘privatopia’ of private and profit-driven governance, a virtual fourth level of government, accountable to no one. We see this in the suggestion of a private authority for transit and potentially other services like health care. Public services, public sector jobs and public governance must prevail.”

-Good Jobs For All.⁵⁸

“In the absence of public leadership and robust legislative protections, we are ceding the power to design Canadian data governance to a company. We are already seeing Sidewalk Labs step in to fill this void, with their proposal to create a Civic Data Trust to manage data collected in Quayside’s public spaces. There’s nothing wrong with considering data trusts as an option. What feels wrong is that this is a singular proposal coming from a private company, without leadership from public institutions or space for meaningful public debate.”

-Sam Burton, Mozilla Foundation⁵⁹

“What Sidewalk reps do not publicly discuss is the company’s drive toward using autonomous vehicles (AVs) as a wedge to privatize, automate and deregulate Toronto’s waterfront.”

-Rosemary Frei, journalist⁶⁰

“...Sidewalk Labs has actually presented an omnibus plan under the guise of an urban planning proposal. ... Will Sidewalk’s plan fall in line with a handful of other visionary plans that never reached fruition, or will it see the light of day?”

-Jeff Biggar, University of Toronto, Scarborough⁶¹

[An expanded Sidewalk Labs plan is] “a terrible deal for taxpayers.”

-Premier Doug Ford⁶²

#BlockSidewalk

“I believe that Sidewalk Labs is a corporation with a range of profits as their goal. They do not have the public’s interest as their priority. Recent developments and investigations have shown the enormous risks to the public that these large digital based platforms pose. We have gathered enough data to study for years to come. We don’t need more. Let us move forward using digital technology for our greater good.”

-Jenny Baboolal, Toronto artist⁶³

“We need the waterfront to be a place built for the needs of Toronto residents, not a private corporation – to be a place that can offer good jobs, truly affordable housing and a safe, inclusive community for all Torontonians.”

-Alejandra Ruiz Vargas, housing activist⁶⁴

“I can understand how tempting it is to offload the burden of planning to an organization with big goals and deep pockets. If Sidewalk’s proposals to date are any indication, the agreement gives them freedom from many of the constraints of normal city processes.

-Tom Slee, University of Waterloo⁶⁵

“The entire process of selecting Sidewalk Labs as the “partner,” the behaviour of Sidewalk Labs and the content of its 1500 plus page Master Innovation and Development Plan (MIDP) all raise serious issues about how we plan and develop our waterfront. Behind all the glitz and “future tense” technology are some very basic issues. Whose priorities are being served? Whose needs are at the centre of the discussion and in whose interests are we about to build on the waterfront?”

-David Robertson, retired union activist⁶⁶

“Sidewalk offers a steady stream of persuasion and dissuasion, truth and half-truth, logos and websites, romance and realism, hands-on workshops and tangible showrooms. It also offers insufficient public consultations, “problematic” data governance, dense development plans, high-profile resignations, non-disclosure agreements, “black box” mysteries and mad dashes for public land, revenue and regulatory capture.”

-Michele Champagne, researcher and designer⁶⁷

#BlockSidewalk

“Giving these big technology companies free access to smart-city data will allow them to accrue significant value without any obligation to citizens or the local economy. Having paid for the infrastructure and provided the raw material – city data – citizens will see much of the resulting value literally given away to U.S.-based multinationals. If the goal is egalitarianism, this massively misses the mark.”
-Kurtis McBride, CEO, Miovision⁶⁸

Note: These quotes were curated from publicly available sources by #BlockSidewalk. Sources include public articles, Op-Eds, self-published material, public social media postings, leaflets circulated at public meetings and public submissions to the City of Toronto and Waterfront Toronto.

#BlockSidewalk was launched in late February of this year by a group of about thirty Torontonians who care deeply about the city and its future. What we all share is a belief that democracy is not for sale and that Google affiliate Sidewalk Labs is the wrong partner for Waterfront Toronto. The campaign now has over 1,500 supporters and is growing rapidly. We are calling for a re-set of the Quayside planning process so that future development is controlled by public bodies, in the public interest.

#BlockSidewalk

Don't just take our word for it, see for yourselves:

- ¹ <https://twitter.com/TorontoRBOT/status/1146764371026173953>
- ² <https://www.thestar.com/news/gta/2019/04/02/toronto-group-wants-google-sister-company-removed-from-quayside-project.html>
- ³ <https://windsorstar.com/technology/early-facebook-backer-urges-toronto-to-abandon-smart-city-project-with-googles-sidewalk-labs/wcm/91e210ac-b370-41f9-8b8b-bcc03030d4ef>
- ⁴ https://waterfrontoronto.ca/nbe/wcm/connect/waterfront/30c682ff-8172-49dc-bf63-09b2a2f1845a/DSAP+Preliminary+Commentary+-September+10%2C+2019.pdf?MOD=AJPERES&CONVERT_TO=url&CACHEID=30c682ff-8172-49dc-bf63-09b2a2f1845a
- ⁵ <https://medium.com/@biancawylie/democracy-or-sidewalk-toronto-you-can-have-one-but-you-cant-have-both-a40e41d8daa>
- ⁶ <https://poll.forumresearch.com/post/3002/sidewalk-toronto-july-2019/>
- ⁷ <https://www.bbc.com/news/world-us-canada-47956760>
- ⁸ Leaflet circulated at October 1, 2019 Good Jobs for All meeting
- ⁹ <https://www.cbc.ca/radio/spark/414-1.4906733/toronto-s-smart-city-needs-to-address-privacy-and-equity-1.4907046>
- ¹⁰ <https://beta.theglobeandmail.com/business/article-sidewalk-labs-toronto-projects-lacks-independent-oversight/>
- ¹¹ http://www.auditor.on.ca/en/content/annualreports/arreports/en18/v1_315en18.pdf
- ¹² Sahar Raza, "Toronto's not so "smart" city: Dismantling the tech "utopia" and building stronger communities." Ryerson University, September 2019 (forthcoming: <https://digital.library.ryerson.ca/>)
- ¹³ <https://www.bbc.com/news/world-us-canada-47956760>
- ¹⁴ <https://www.thestar.com/news/gta/2019/02/15/google-vision-for-port-lands-a-no-go-with-ontario-government-source-says.html>
- ¹⁵ <https://torontolife.com/city/sidewalks-affordable-housing-isnt-really-affordable/>
- ¹⁶ <https://torontolife.com/city/toronto-needs-to-maintain-control-of-its-transit-planning/>
- ¹⁷ <https://www.theglobeandmail.com/business/small-business/startups/article-the-government-needs-to-favour-homegrown-tech-companies-over-foreign/>
- ¹⁸ <https://www.brianchang.ca/sidewalklabs>
- ¹⁹ <https://twitter.com/AdamCF/status/1146792119161556992>
- ²⁰ <https://www.blocksidewalk.ca/media>
- ²¹ <http://spacing.ca/toronto/2019/06/25/lorinc-sidewalk-labs-and-the-problem-of-smart-city-governance/>
- ²² <https://medium.com/swlh/midp-the-data-governance-proposal-55272767dd40>
- ²³ <https://nowtoronto.com/news/sidewalk-labs-privacy-human-rights/>
- ²⁴ <https://www.theglobeandmail.com/business/article-saadia-muzaffar-resigns-from-waterfront-toronto-advisory-board-over/>
- ²⁵ <https://medium.com/@milang/on-sidewalk-toronto-and-transit-innovation-7ce20c94be77>
- ²⁶ Leaflet circulated at October 1st Good Jobs for All meeting
- ²⁷ <https://www.thestar.com/opinion/contributors/2019/05/22/lets-not-be-dazzled-by-googles-master-plan-for-toronto.html>
- ²⁸ <https://quaysideto.ca/wp-content/uploads/2019/09/R1-Feedback-Report-Appendix-3.-Written-Submissions.pdf>
- ²⁹ <https://www.theglobeandmail.com/business/commentary/article-sidewalk-labs-new-data-plan-still-leaves-canada-at-a-disadvantage/>
- ³⁰ <https://quaysideto.ca/wp-content/uploads/2019/09/R1-Feedback-Report-Appendix-3.-Written-Submissions.pdf>
- ³¹ <https://www.nytimes.com/2019/07/16/opinion/smart-cities.html>
- ³² <https://vimeo.com/364499737>
- ³³ <https://www.theglobeandmail.com/opinion/editorials/article-globe-editorial-what-does-sidewalk-labs-really-want-from-toronto/>
- ³⁴ <https://theconversation.com/sidewalk-torontos-master-plan-raises-urgent-concerns-about-data-and-privacy-121025>
- ³⁵ <https://www.brianchang.ca/sidewalklabs>

#BlockSidewalk

- ³⁶ <https://www.theglobeandmail.com/business/commentary/article-for-economic-outcomes-of-sidewalk-toronto-we-need-to-talk-about/>
- ³⁷ <https://nowtoronto.com/news/google-smart-city-big-data/>
- ³⁸ <https://www.theglobeandmail.com/arts/art-and-architecture/article-sidewalk-labs-toronto-project-plan-offers-a-thousands-details-but/>
- ³⁹ <https://beta.theglobeandmail.com/opinion/article-silicon-valley-isnt-just-a-technostate-its-something-much-bigger/>
- ⁴⁰ <https://www.thestar.com/opinion/contributors/2019/07/05/if-sidewalk-labs-wants-a-piece-of-our-waterfront-they-should-show-us-their-payroll.html>
- ⁴¹ <https://blaynehaggart.wordpress.com/2019/08/12/liveblogging-sidewalk-labs-master-innovation-and-development-plan-entry-24-the-midp-volume-1-the-plans-chapter-3-economic-development-introduction-part-1-accelerating-development/>
- ⁴² <https://torontolife.com/city/sidewalk-needs-to-integrate-with-the-waterfront/>
- ⁴³ <https://www.brianchang.ca/sidewalklabs>
- ⁴⁴ <https://torontolife.com/city/de-identifying-data-at-the-source-is-the-only-way-sidewalk-can-work/>
- ⁴⁵ <http://www.amnesty.ca/smart-city-human-rights-concerns>
- ⁴⁶ <https://www.businessinsider.com/sidewalk-labs-master-plan-criticism-2019-6>
- ⁴⁷ <https://nationalpost.com/pm-news-pmn/protecting-childrens-data-privacy-in-the-smart-city>
- ⁴⁸ <https://www.theglobeandmail.com/business/article-experts-say-sidewalk-labs-patent-proposals-dont-go-far-enough/>
- ⁴⁹ <https://cfe.ryerson.ca/blog/2018/12/mystery-waterfront-how-smart-city-allure-led-major-public-agency-toronto-reckless-deal>
- ⁵⁰ https://www.thestar.com/news/city_hall/2018/08/02/waterfront-toronto-deal-with-google-sister-company-is-shortchanging-city-says-board-member-who-quit.html
- ⁵¹ <https://www.pressreader.com/canada/toronto-star/20190323/281492162659689>
- ⁵² <https://www.blocksidewalk.ca/supporters>
- ⁵³ <https://www.blocksidewalk.ca/supporters>
- ⁵⁴ <https://www.blocksidewalk.ca/supporters>
- ⁵⁵ <https://www.thestar.com/opinion/contributors/2019/09/11/pension-plans-should-not-invest-in-companies-that-harm-working-people.html>
- ⁵⁶ <https://www.theglobeandmail.com/business/small-business/managing/article-as-sidewalk-labs-moves-forward-on-plan-toronto-port-lands-businesses/>
- ⁵⁷ <https://openparliament.ca/committees/ethics/42-1/135/peter-kent-1/only/>
- ⁵⁸ Good Jobs for All leaflet circulated at the July consultations of Waterfront Toronto.
- ⁵⁹ <https://medium.com/@SamBurton/sidewalk-toronto-is-bigger-than-quayside-bigger-than-google-33164bf03071>
- ⁶⁰ <https://nowtoronto.com/news/google-sidewalk-labs-port-lands/>
- ⁶¹ <https://www.thestar.com/opinion/contributors/2019/07/28/time-is-now-to-have-your-say-on-sidewalk-labs-bold-vision-for-toronto.html>
- ⁶² <https://www.thestar.com/politics/provincial/2019/08/12/ford-warns-an-expanded-sidewalk-labs-community-is-a-terrible-deal-for-taxpayers.html>
- ⁶³ Submission to #BlockSidewalk via website
- ⁶⁴ <https://www.blocksidewalk.ca/supporters>
- ⁶⁵ <https://twitter.com/whimsley/status/1136260290549624833/photo/1>
- ⁶⁶ 10 reasons to say no: A primer on Sidewalk Labs' plan for the Waterfront. David Robertson, September 2019 (circulated at the October 1, 2019 Good Jobs for All meeting): <https://socialistproject.ca/2019/10/ten-reasons-to-say-no-sidewalk-lab-toronto/>
- ⁶⁷ <https://failedarchitecture.com/where-the-image-flows-how-sidewalk-labs-public-relations-came-to-dominate-journalism/>
- ⁶⁸ <https://www.theglobeandmail.com/business/commentary/article-free-city-data-a-giveaway-to-big-tech/>