Information on Kyrgyzstan for Consideration by the Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women at its 76th Session (22 June - 10 July 2020)

Introduction:

1. We respectfully submit this letter for consideration during Kyrgyzstan’s fifth periodic review by the Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women (‘the Committee’) during its 76th Session (22 June – 10 July 2020). Equality Now, the Human Rights Movement, Bir Duino-Kyrgyzstan (BDK), Public Association “Ensan Diamond” and PA “Alga” (Chui oblast) request that this letter be used to supplement Kyrgyzstan’s 5th periodic State Party report to the Committee. Our joint submission details our concerns with regard to laws related to rape and other forms of sexual violence and procedures and practices which effectively deny access to justice for survivors of sexual violence. Specifically, Kyrgyzstan’s legal system provides a number of opportunities for perpetrators to escape criminal liability or punishment, namely through the way sexual violence crimes are defined; allowing for the direct release of a perpetrator from liability or punishment in certain circumstances; and through the way sexual violence crimes are investigated and prosecuted, including with respect to adolescent girls.

Information about the authors of the submission

2. Equality Now is an international human rights NGO with the mission to achieve legal and systemic change that addresses violence and discrimination against women and girls around the world. Founded in 1992, Equality Now has offices in London, New York, Nairobi and Beirut, as well as consultants based in various parts of the world. Ending sexual violence, ending sex trafficking, ending harmful practices and achieving legal equality are the main areas of Equality Now’s work. This submission is in reference to Equality Now’s 2019 report, “Roadblocks to Justice: How the Law is Failing Survivors of Sexual Violence in Eurasia” which identified gaps in the law, thereby allowing for actual and potential impunity for perpetrators of sexual violence crimes.

3. The ‘Human Rights Movement, Bir Duino-Kyrgyzstan’ (BDK) was founded in May 2000 and has as a mission to protect human rights, with a particular focus on the freedom of association and advocacy for the protection of human rights defenders in Kyrgyzstan through culture and art. The main goal of the BDK is to support the practical implementation of the humanitarian articles of the Helsinki Declaration of 1975 and other international legal documents, as well

1 https://www.equalitynow.org/roadblocks_to_justice
as calling for the implementation of Kyrgyzstan's international obligations in the field of human rights and basic freedoms.

4. The Public Association, ‘Ensang Diamond’ works in the field of women’s rights and gender studies, with a particular focus on violence against women and women’s health. It advocates for a place where women can participate equally in politics, society and in the family, and works towards achieving gender equality in the country.

5. The organisation ‘PA “Alga” (Chui oblast)’ has as a mission to improve the socio-economic status and living conditions of rural women through leadership development and women’s potential, increasing opportunities for their self-realisation, as well as through increasing women’s participation in sustainable development and protecting their rights. The organisation provides comprehensive support to rural women, their families and rural communities through the development of various skills, providing information and training, as well as developing social partnerships and undertaking advocacy.

6. The legal provisions and practices detailed in our submission highlight the failure of the State to comply with its duty to provide equal protection under the law to survivors of sexual violence (Article 2(c) of CEDAW); failure of law enforcement to protect women from sexual violence (Article 2(c) and (e)); and that the decisions and failings of the authorities and their agents constitute demonstrable direct and indirect discrimination against women (Article 2(d)); as well as failing to recognise and identify the gender dimension of sexual violence during the prosecution of the accused and in the punishment of this crime (Article 2(e)). In violation of the Convention, Kyrgyzstan has also failed to enact criminal law provisions to effectively prosecute sexual violence and gross manifestations of violence against women (Article 2(b)). We submit that the root cause of the failures of the State is its non-compliance with the obligation to transform gender hierarchies and stereotypical attitudes towards women, contrary to Articles 2(f) and 5(a) of the Convention and the obligation to combat violence against women and provide access to justice to survivors, as described in General Recommendations 19, 33 and 35 of the CEDAW Committee.

7. We reiterate the Concluding Observations on the fourth periodic report of Kyrgyzstan and underscore, in particular, the recommendations urging the government of Kyrgyzstan to ensure that perpetrators of violence against women and girls are prosecuted and adequately punished and to develop a strategy to address bride kidnapping and forced marriage to ensure the effective investigation, prosecution and conviction of perpetrators. Moreover, we also reiterate the List of Issues put forward by the Committee requiring information from the State on the measures taken to ensure that courts do not use reconciliation procedures as a basis for discontinuing criminal prosecution, as well as information on whether any steps have been taken to amend the Criminal Code to criminalise all forms of gender-based violence, including marital rape, and to ensure the mandatory and ex officio prosecution of such violence.

Definitions of sexual violence crimes enabling impunity for perpetrators

8. Despite reforms to Kyrgyzstan’s Criminal Code in January 2019, it still provides an inadequate and limited definition of sexual violence crimes leaving many of the coerced and non-consensual acts of a sexual character without any punishment. Article 161(1) of the Criminal Code defines rape as sexual intercourse with the use of violence not threatening life or health, or of a threat thereof, with respect to the victim or with the use of the helpless state of the victim. Rape is defined and understood as penile-vaginal

---

2 Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women, 11 March 2015, CEDAW/C/KGZ/CO/4
3 CEDAW/C/KGZ/CO/4 no 18(a)
4 CEDAW/C/KGZ/CO/4 no 20(a)
5 CEDAW/C/KGZ/Q/5, para 9
penetration and does not recognise penetration by objects or other body parts. A series of aggravating factors and increased punishment is also foreseen. Examples include when sexual intercourse is combined with the threat of violence that poses danger to life or health; is committed with particular cruelty towards the victim or her relatives; and results in pregnancy. However, any kind of violence or threat of violence should also be considered aggravating circumstances rather than constituting elements of rape, while extreme cruelty should be considered an aggravating circumstance.

9. Compulsion to perform sexual relations, Article 163, is classified as a less serious crime than the ones provided above. It envisages “compulsion to Perform Sexual Actions, Compulsion of a person to enter into sexual relations, pederasty, lesbianism, or the commission of other sexual actions by means of blackmail, threat of destruction, damage, or taking of property, or with the use of material or any other dependence of the victim, in the absence of indicia of crimes provided for by Articles 161 and 162 of this Code.”

10. The above articles fall short of international human rights standards in a number of ways. According to Kyrgyz law, violence and threat of violence, as elements of rape, are in practice interpreted only by physical means, rather than also psychological or economic harm or of any other form of coercion. There is no definition of economic violence under the Civil or Criminal Codes. In addition, ‘threat of violence’ is interpreted as entailing an expression of intention to immediately use physical violence. The threat can be expressed verbally or through actions, such as for example the showing of weapons or other objects that could cause harm, and must be perceived by the victim as real and imminent, while ignoring threats directed to the future (as opposed to immediate threats) that could paralyse and overcome the resistance of the victim.

11. In cases where rape is alleged but there is no additional serious physical harm, the courts often dismiss the case as they will interpret the lack of additional physical violence as consent to sexual intercourse. It is common practice that nobody, including law enforcement and the courts, will believe that a rape was committed when there is no shouting, witnesses, resistance or additional injuries. The “helpless state of the victim” is included in the law as an alternative element to the requirement for additional violence on the part of the perpetrator, but there is no definition or explanation in the law as to what this entails. In practice, this element has often been applied in cases where the victim has a physical disability or compromised mental faculties (for example, if she has dementia, a mental disorder, or is unconscious). The court will, in these cases, question whether the victim had the ability to understand the situation enough to be able to resist the perpetrator. In these cases, the perpetrator has the responsibility to be aware of her “helpless state”. Therefore, “helpless state” has very limited application and does not even cover the clear situations where the perpetrator could overcome the will of the victim (e.g. perpetrator subjecting victim to systematic rape within the context of domestic violence and making her helpless, or taking her to a deserted area where there was no point of resisting sexual violence).

12. Contrary to international and regional human rights standards, Articles 161, 162 and 163 do not include the lack of voluntary and genuine consent on the part of the victim as a constituent element for sexual violence crimes. As well as neglecting the importance of willing consent, the reviewed sexual violence laws do not enumerate a wide range of coercive circumstances that can paralyse the will and the actions of the victim, such as abuse of trust and authority and situations of dependence as highlighted above, but also

---

6 However, reference to economic violence is made in the Law on the Prevention and Protection from Family Violence, and is defined as the deliberate failure of one family member / equivalent family member to carry out the maintenance of another family member / equivalent person, and also intentionally depriving or limiting the right to receive dispositions of property or income intended by law to a person, and / or the use of funds and property by a trustee to the detriment of the principal.
deceit. This in practice means that the prosecution of rape is overwhelmingly limited to situations where the victim has the physical evidence of injuries and can prove physical resistance to sexual intercourse. When such evidence cannot be secured, or when sexual violence was committed without using additional physical force, there is very little chance that the perpetrator will be brought to justice. These provisions run counter to CEDAW’s General Recommendation 35 which provides that States should ensure that a “definition of sexual crimes, including marital and acquaintance or date rape, is based on the lack of freely given consent and takes into account coercive circumstances”

7 CEDAW, CEDAW/C/GC/35, General Recommendation No. 35 on gender-based violence against women, updating general recommendation No. 19.

and as further defined in the CEDAW Communications of Vertido v The Philippines8 and R.P.B. v The Philippines.9

Legal provisions allowing impunity for perpetrators of sexual violence

13. Contrary to international human rights standards, Kyrgyz law allows impunity for perpetrators of sexual violence if they have ‘reconciled’ with the victim. According to Article 61 of the Criminal Code, a perpetrator can be exempt from criminal liability if he “reached an agreement with the victim and redressed the damage caused”. This Article may be applied for the “less serious crimes” which have been provided for by Article 23 of the Criminal Procedure Code, including offences defined in Article 163 of the Criminal Code (‘Compulsion to sexual acts’) and Article 161(1) on rape without any aggravating circumstances. There appears to be a conflict between the Criminal Code, which classifies rape as a serious offence, for which reconciliation would not normally be possible. In addition, since the Criminal Procedure Code provides that rape is subject to public-private prosecution which applies for ‘less serious’ offences, this also leaves room for reconciliation to be reached. These discrepancies essentially help to ensure that the offender can be released from criminal liability for rape without any aggravating circumstances and should be amended so that rape, irrespective of whether there are any aggravating circumstances, is always considered a ‘serious’ crime and subject to public prosecution.

14. Reconciliation is often used and abused with the result that perpetrators of sexual violence escape any form of criminal punishment or repercussions for their criminal behaviour, including avoiding a criminal record. In practice, lawyers and relatives of the accused make various attempts to obstruct the victim’s access to justice and force the victim and her relatives to reconcile. There has been evidence where investigators do not prevent such interference. Further examples include where relatives and representatives of the accused visit the victim at home or in hospital with the purpose of influencing the victim and forcing her to withdraw her complaint. This takes the form of offering money, buying property and negotiating with more influential relatives of the victim, often through the assistance of a lawyer.

15. In a number of cases involving adolescent and younger girls, many parents are not able to withstand such pressure and come to an agreement with the accused or his family. In such cases, law enforcement bodies fail to take any active measures to protect survivors of sexual violence from coercion throughout criminal justice processes. Neither do they examine whether reconciliation was the expression of free will, or the result of pressure. We reiterate CEDAW’s recommendations from its last review of Kyrgyzstan to “ensure that women and girls who are victims of violence have access to immediate means of redress and protection and that perpetrators are prosecuted and adequately punished”.10

7 CEDAW, CEDAW/C/GC/35, General Recommendation No. 35 on gender-based violence against women, updating general recommendation No. 19.
16. In addition, victim-blaming attitudes and sympathy towards perpetrators, prevalent in the society and law-enforcement, pose serious obstacles in reporting sexual violence. In situations not as serious as the ones resulting in death, members of the local community try to justify the actions of the perpetrator as they don’t want him to be sent to prison with a lengthy sentence, where fellow inmates from the “criminal world” could severely abuse him as a form of retribution for committing sexual violence. There have also been examples where victims’ lawyers have faced intimidation, physical abuse and threats, and were even physically assaulted during court sessions by friends and relatives of the defendant. Such beliefs and practices therefore serve to undermine and prevent survivors of rape and sexual violence from seeking justice.

Failure to provide mandatory prosecution for sexual violence

17. The lack of mandatory (ex officio) prosecution for sexual violence in the law denies justice to survivors and is contrary to international human rights standards. As noted by the CEDAW Committee in its General Recommendation 35, states should “ensure effective access of victims to courts and tribunals; ensure authorities adequately respond to all cases of gender-based violence against women, including by applying criminal law and as appropriate ex officio prosecution to bring the alleged perpetrators to trial in a fair, impartial, timely and expeditious manner and imposing adequate penalties”.  

18. Article 23 of the Criminal Procedure Code provides that crimes of rape (Article 161(1) of the Criminal Code) and compulsion to perform sexual actions (Article 163 of the Criminal Code) qualify as crimes of private-public prosecution. This means they are initiated upon a claim by the victim and can be terminated by a victim, for example, in cases of reconciliation with the defendant, or because the victim faces too much pressure and feels compelled therefore to withdraw. Such legal provisions deny justice to survivors because the survivor, rather than the state, is required to bear the burden of the criminal proceeding, including when it comes to the collection of evidence required to prove the circumstances of the crime. According to a report by UNDP, local law enforcement authorities are seen to discourage women from filing such claims from the outset and put pressure on her to withdraw the complaint if she has managed to file it, and to postpone initiation of investigation, anticipating in practice that one way or another, a woman is likely to withdraw her claim. Moreover, victims are under great pressure by their close relatives, influential acquaintances, representatives of authorised state bodies working in the protection of the rights of children, as well as doctors and lawyers to either withdraw their complaint or not file a complaint. The law enforcement bodies fail to protect survivors from such pressures, maintaining the barriers to reporting.

19. Burdensome evidence requirements, gender stereotyping and secondary victimisation throughout the legal proceedings further deny justice to survivors. There are no clear criteria or adequate awareness by authorities and investigators to evaluate the impact of rape on a victim’s psychology and the subsequent trauma she endures, which may influence her behaviour throughout the criminal proceedings. The victim is often blamed for having “provoked” the rape. There have been examples of situations where the Prosecutor orders a psychiatric examination for the victim to determine her propensity to lie and fantasise. If the psychiatrist determines that she does, then the case will be dropped. Additionally, when the same victim has experienced several forms of violence, the perpetrator is more likely charged for the crimes not constituting sexual violence, which then is ignored. Such

---

11 CEDAW, CEDAW/C/GC/35, General Recommendation No. 35 on gender-based violence against women, updating general recommendation No. 19.

12 Analysis conducted within the framework of the UNDP project ‘Prevention of gender-based violence in Kyrgyzstan’, implemented with financial support from the US State Department.
prevailing attitudes undermine the importance of gender-sensitive proceedings in ensuring access to justice for survivors. The CEDAW Committee emphasised the fact that “the secondary victimisation of women by the criminal justice system has an impact on their access to justice, owing to their heightened vulnerability to mental and physical abuse and threats during arrest, questioning and in detention”.  

We underscore the obligation of Kyrgyzstan to create a supportive environment, which encourages women to claim their rights and actively participate in the criminal justice process and obtain justice and redress.  

20. Additional barriers for survivors include the common practice that investigators collude with the accused’s lawyers and there are also examples where the perpetrators were themselves police officers. Compounding this is the lack of understanding of the gendered nature of the crime of rape and the negligible number of female investigators and gender-sensitive men who work in law enforcement.

21. According to the Law on State Guaranteed Legal Aid, free legal assistance in criminal cases can be provided for victims if they have a very low income, as well as persons with certain forms of disability, single mothers raising a minor, and minors. Therefore, victims of sexual violence, if they don’t meet the “very low income” criteria, are not eligible for free legal aid. According to a study on judicial practice, the majority of victims of sexual violence were found not to have been granted legal aid because of not meeting the above criteria, while the accused party had at least one legal counsel and, in some cases, even three. Most often, complainants are left without legal assistance due to their inability to pay for the services of a lawyer. While the prosecutor should bear the responsibility of properly prosecuting the crime and therefore protect the interests of the complainant, private-public prosecution rules place the burden on the victim and, in practice, there are a number of cases where the accused was convicted only after intervention had been made by the centres for the protection of the rights of victims, which provided legal assistance and support in court. This shows the ineffectiveness of the prosecution in defending the interests of the victims, while most of the victims don’t have financial means to hire private lawyers, which puts them in a disadvantageous position as compared to the defendant.

22. The sexual history of the victim, as well as her relationship status with the accused, often comes under scrutiny at all stages of the proceedings. This information, deliberately or not, is evaluated to assess whether she is a “worthy” victim and has been truly damaged by the rape. Often victims are asked personal questions that are not related to the case and which suggest the victims themselves were to blame for the attack. Until 2018, the recommendations for the investigation of crimes against sexual integrity and sexual freedom highlighted the importance of determining the moral character and psychological status of the victim. A practical guide developed in 2018 establishes guidelines more in line with international standards but further efforts need to be made to bring the guidelines into full compliance with human rights standards and train investigation officers to ensure its correct and effective implementation.

Further harm to adolescent girl survivors of sexual violence and forced marriage

23. Kyrgyz criminal law views the crime of sexual intercourse with a person below 16 years (statutory rape) in the context of morality and the spiritual health of a person rather than a gross violation of human rights (Chapter 26 of the Criminal Code (Crimes against Spiritual

---

14 Ibid 10
15 ПРАКТИЧЕСКОЕ ПОСОБИЕ Под общее редакцией Первого заместителя министра внутренних дел Кыргызской Республики генерал-майора полиции Омурзакова С.А. для сотрудников следственной службы ОВД Кыргызской Республики по эффективному расследованию гендерных преступлений, совершенных в отношении женщин и несовершеннолетних.
and Moral Health of a Person). Article 164 defines sexual intercourse with a person under sixteen years of age by a person who has reached the age of eighteen years as an “action of sexual character with a person who has not reached the age of sixteen years”. This definition fails to consider the crime as a serious violation of a minor’s right to sexual inviolability (while framing it as a crime against morality), and in practice has derogatory implications that the minor herself consented, wanted or even initiated sexual intercourse for which a man is ‘falsely’ being held accountable. The crime can only be committed by an adult over the age of eighteen who knew that the victim was under the age of sixteen.

24. Bride kidnapping (kidnapping of a person with the purpose of marriage, Article 175) is treated as a distinct crime to forced marriage (Article 177) and to compulsion to enter into actual marital relations (Article 176), which is in line with the requirements of the Council of Europe Convention on preventing and combating violence against women and domestic violence (Istanbul Convention). In April 2019, amendments to the Criminal Code entered into force and the punishment for kidnapping a bride without her consent is punished with 10 years of imprisonment and a fine of 3,000 US dollars. Despite this improvement in the legal framework, it is often the case that bride kidnapping will end with the woman or girl marrying the man because she believes she has no other option and her chances of being able to find a husband otherwise will have been significantly reduced if she was held overnight at the perpetrator’s house. More must be done by the government in terms of public education about the equality of women and the wrongs of bride kidnapping. Bride kidnapping is frequently followed by rape which is used as a tool for preventing the victim from leaving. In such situations, the ‘family’ is then considered to have been ‘created’, so rape is not investigated, effectively ignoring the fact that the woman has been forced to marry and thereby exonerating the rape.

25. According to data released in 2018 by the Ministry of Internal Affairs, over the past five years, there have been 895 reports of bride kidnapping, however only 168 cases were investigated as criminal cases. Despite the existing legal framework, weak implementation of the law and prevailing social norms, which the state fails to effectively address, leaves forced marriage and bride kidnappings prevalent in Kyrgyzstan. These practices disproportionately affect adolescent girls, giving rise to further gender-based and sexual violence offences. Bride kidnappings and the lack of adequate response by authorities became very evident in May 2018, when 19-year-old Burulai Turdalieva complained about having been kidnapped and was subsequently stabbed and killed by her abductor at the police station. Moreover, we emphasise the immediate need to adhere to the recommendations by the CEDAW inquiry on bride kidnapping, which found that the Kyrgyz state should urgently make sure that rape is considered to be a grave crime and be prosecuted ex officio.

26. According to research, more than 20% of marriages in the Kyrgyz Republic were as a

---

16 May 27, 2019 marks exactly one year since the tragic death of Burulai Turdalieva, a young woman who was stabbed in the police office. It was a widely covered case. Near Bishkek, a 30-year-old bus driver Mars Bodoshev and his friends kidnapped 19-year-old Burulai. The girl was kidnapped not far from the parental home, almost in front of her relatives. Parents immediately appealed to the police. The car was detained, the abductors and their victim was taken to the ROVD (district police office). The police left the kidnapper and Burulai alone in the same office. Mars Bodoshev took advantage of the situation and killed his ‘failed’ bride. In February 2019, the city court sentenced the perpetrator to 20 years in prison and the collection of more than $11,000 in favour of the family of the victim as moral and material damages.

17 CEDAW Committee Inquiry concerning Kyrgyzstan under Article 8 of the Optional Protocol to CEDAW, 21 September 2018, CEDAW/C/OP.8/KGZ/1, para 92.a.

result of bride kidnapping and the proportion of forced marriages (as defined in Article 177) was 6%. The abduction of women for marriage in rural areas occurs almost two times more than in urban settlements. Marriages conducted through the abduction of women without their consent are noted throughout Kyrgyzstan, to varying degrees. The practice takes place more commonly among girls who have either had no education or only primary education, and among poorer households.

27. The age of marriage is 18 years for both sexes (Article 14 of the Family Code) and violating the age of marriage is criminally punishable in all circumstances (registered, non-registered, de facto, religious). However, there is no available information about how often the prohibitions (Art. 176-178 of the Criminal Code) are enforced. In a study conducted by UNFPA, cases of early marriage among girls were noted in all regions, but particularly prevalent in Naryn and Chui oblasts (around 13%), while 2% took place in Bishkek. Early marriages in rural areas are 2.5 times more common than in urban areas.

Suggested Recommendations for Kyrgyzstan

We respectfully urge the Committee to make the following proposed recommendations to the government of Kyrgyzstan regarding the violations of the Convention addressed in this submission:

a) Amend Articles 161, 162 and 163 of the Criminal Code to ensure that the definitions of sexual violence crimes are in compliance with standards developed by the CEDAW Committee and cover all forms of sexual violence acts committed without the victim’s voluntary, genuine and willing consent, and envisage a wide range of coercive circumstances; ensure that sanctions for these crimes correspond to the gravity of the crimes;

b) Amend Article 23 of the Criminal Procedure Code to ensure ex officio (public) prosecution of all sexual violence crimes and abolish the requirement that a victim has to initiate criminal proceedings (private-public prosecution);

c) Amend Article 61, 23 and 26 of the Criminal Code to abolish the possibility for discontinuing sexual violence cases based on reconciliation of the parties;

d) Ensure that investigators, prosecutors and judges are trained according to a gender-sensitive methodology for investigating and prosecuting sexual violence;

e) Ensure deterrent sanctions for perpetrators and effective remedies and rehabilitation for survivors;

f) Abolish burdensome evidence requirements to prove sexual violence and investigative practices that contribute to secondary victimisation of women (such as examining prior sexual history of the victim) and that are not absolutely necessary for establishing the facts of the case;

g) Ensure awareness raising campaigns, including among law-enforcement, about the criminal nature of all forms of sexual violence (including marital rape and statutory rape) and that violence is not justified in any circumstances;

h) Design and implement effective criminal and other policies to fight child marriages and bride kidnappings and sexual violence resulting from these practices;

19 Отчет по результатам исследования “Гендер в восприятии общества” (2018 год).
i) **Ensure that the intersecting forms of discrimination are understood** of women and girl survivors of sexual violence belonging to vulnerable groups (including women with disabilities, ethnic minorities, women in prostitution, LBT women) and that they can access justice without obstacles;

j) **Collect and publish disaggregated statistics on forced marriages, bride kidnappings and marital rape**, as well as comprehensive statistics about all forms of sexual violence desegregated by victims’ sex, age, relationship to the perpetrator, ethnicity and belonging to any vulnerable groups;

k) **Adopt an Anti-Discrimination Law** prohibiting all forms of discrimination and ensuring effective legal mechanisms for protection.