GOOD JOBS IN A CLEAN ENERGY ECONOMY THROUGH THE CLEAN POWER PLAN

Lead Authors: Jaimie Worker, Sebrina Owens-Wilson & Ben Beach
ABOUT THE AUTHORS

Jaimie Worker, Policy Analyst at the Center for Community Change, Sebrina Owens-Wilson, Campaign Director and Ben Beach, Legal Director, at the Partnership for Working Families served as the primary authors of this material.

The mission of the Center for Community Change (CCC) and its sister organization, Center for Community Change Action, is to build the power and capacity of low-income people, especially low-income people of color, to have a significant impact on improving their communities and the policies and institutions that affect their lives. CCC strengthens, connects, and mobilizes grassroots groups to enhance their leadership, voices, and power. We believe vibrant community-based organizations, led by the people most affected by social and economic injustice, are key to creating social change.

The Partnership for Working Families is a national network of 17 powerful city and regional affiliate groups based in major urban areas across the country. We leverage cities’ power to organize communities and pass smart policies so all working people have a voice in our community, access to family-sustaining jobs and a healthy environment. Our network’s successful, bottom-up campaigns create a new vision of what is possible and a path toward a just society on a national scale. The Partnership has won construction careers agreements and policies in 10 cities across the country, establishing worker standards and targeted hire agreements for $114 billion in publicly-funded construction.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

Many thanks to the following organizations for their critical input: Asian Pacific Environmental Network, Emerald Cities Collaborative, Green for All, Los Angeles Alliance for a New Economy, Los Angeles Black Worker Center, National Employment Law Project, People’s Action Institute, OneAmerica, Sierra Club, and Strategic Concepts in Organizing and Policy Education.
ABOUT THIS TOOLKIT

This toolkit is part of a series created by the Clean Power for All Collaborative convened by Green for All. The Clean Power for All Collaborative includes People’s Action Institute, Center for Community Change, Clean Energy Works, Green For All, National Housing Trust, Natural Resources Defense Council, NextGen Climate America, Sierra Club, State Innovation Exchange, Union of Concerned Scientists, and U.S. Climate Action Network. The views and opinions expressed in this toolkit are those of the authors and do not necessarily reflect the endorsement of every member of the Clean Power for All Collaborative.

The toolkit provides concrete solutions to state officials and advocates for the effective implementation of the Clean Power Plan (CPP). Each toolkit in the series addresses a set of questions and concerns about equity and fairness, and provides tangible solutions to ensure that the communities hardest hit by poverty and pollution are not overlooked in the development of state plans.

To access this toolkit and other topics online, visit www.thecleanpowerplan.com.

ABOUT THE CLEAN POWER PLAN

The Clean Power Plan (CPP) is the first national effort to regulate greenhouse gases in the United States by limiting carbon dioxide emissions from existing power plants, which account for nearly 40 percent of greenhouse gas emissions in the country. The CPP is designed to reduce carbon dioxide emissions by about 32 percent below 2005 levels in the nation’s electricity sector. The Environmental Protection Agency (EPA) set state by state targets for carbon reduction by 2030 based on each state’s existing energy production sources and carbon output. The regulations limit the carbon output of existing power plants, but leave the design and implementation of the state plan up to state officials. The CPP initially required states to submit their plan for approval or ask for an extension in September, 2016, and imposed a final deadline to submit final plan in September, 2018. Compliance requirements for covered power plants are set to begin in 2022 and end in 2030. On February 9th, the U.S. Supreme Court stayed the CPP until the D.C. Circuit Court of Appeals rules on the merits of the Plan and the Supreme Court either rules on the merits or denies a petition to review the lower court’s decision. The stay has paused the effects of the rule, and therefore the September deadline no longer applies. However, the stay does not speak to the merits of the rule and does not prevent states from continuing to plan for compliance or investing in a just transition away from fossil fuels that will protect people and the planet.1
GOOD JOBS IN A CLEAN ENERGY ECONOMY THROUGH THE CLEAN POWER PLAN

Lead Authors: Jaimie Worker, Sebrina Owens-Wilson & Ben Beach
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Page</th>
<th>Section</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Introduction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td><strong>Best Practice:</strong> Provide access to high quality jobs in renewable energy and energy efficiency for job seekers from frontline communities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td><strong>Case Study:</strong> Clean Energy Works Portland</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td><strong>Case Study:</strong> Green Jobs Green New York</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td><strong>Best Practice:</strong> Develop robust workforce development strategies and career pathways in clean energy and energy efficiency implementation that reach underrepresented communities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td><strong>Case Study:</strong> Los Angeles Department of Water and Power and IBEW Local 18’s Entry-level Utility Pre-Craft Trainee program</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td><strong>Case Study:</strong> The Construction Careers Campaign, Los Angeles County</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td><strong>Best Practice:</strong> Ensure effective monitoring and enforcement mechanisms using strong partnerships with community-based organizations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21</td>
<td><strong>Case Study:</strong> Los Angeles Crenshaw/LAX Transit Project</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23</td>
<td>Key Terms</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27</td>
<td>Key Resources</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29</td>
<td>References</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
INTRODUCTION

Current and forthcoming Clean Power for All Toolkits describe how frontline communities bear the brunt of our environmental crisis and why there should be concerted efforts to engage frontline communities, clean-up hot spots, and harness the value of the Clean Power Plan for public benefit. Frontline communities also bear the brunt of our economic crisis and the Clean Power Plan has the potential to provide environmental and economic benefits for these communities as well. These economic benefits are generated in part through equitable investments in underserved communities, as discussed in Clean Power for All Toolkit: Fair & Just Investments for Frontline Communities through the Clean Power Plan.

This Toolkit discusses strategies that deliver high quality jobs with career pathways accessible to workers in low-income communities and communities of color. The following best practices with examples from across the country discussed below illustrate how, done well and with concerted effort from key stakeholders, states can use the Clean Power Plan to build a clean energy economy and unlock opportunities for frontline communities:

- Provide access to high quality jobs in renewable energy and energy efficiency for job seekers from frontline communities;
- Develop robust workforce development strategies and career pathways in clean energy and energy efficiency implementation that reach communities underrepresented in the economy;
- Ensure effective monitoring and enforcement mechanisms using strong partnerships with community-based organizations.

As the primary implementers of the CPP, state governments play a critical role in ensuring that the expansion of renewable energy and energy efficiency creates good jobs for low-income communities. Whether state governments are creating rules for Clean Power Plan programs and projects, directly awarding contracts or granting funds to local governments, there are a range of actions they can take to require or encourage the use of the job quality and access standards discussed throughout this toolkit. The strongest action that states can take to ensure the creation of good jobs is to establish requirements of both contractors and local governments working on or receiving funds for CPP projects.
“As the primary implementers of the CPP, state governments play a critical role in ensuring that the expansion of renewable energy and energy efficiency creates good jobs for low-income communities.”

For example, states can require that local governments utilize targeted hire programs in order to receive funding for CPP projects. States can also structure the bidding process to require contractors and subcontractors to meet specific job access requirements and job quality standards in order to bid on a project. Short of establishing requirements states can also create grant programs that are designed to incentivize the use of job quality and job access standards by, for example, promoting best value contracting and contractor pre-qualification approaches that incorporate these standards, or providing financial or other incentives to localities that adopt these and other approaches discussed in greater detail below.
As investments in the clean energy sector grow to meet the demands of the Clean Power Plan, states have the opportunity and the obligation to simultaneously combat climate change and economic and racial inequality through a focus on jobs. This starts with ensuring access to high quality jobs and careers in energy efficiency and renewable energy for job seekers from low-income communities and communities of color. In the coming years, we will create jobs to retrofit existing buildings, meet increased energy efficiency standards on new buildings, and install and manufacture solar panels, wind turbines and other materials needed for improved energy efficiency and renewable energy. These new jobs have the potential to pay good wages, provide benefits that help families make ends meet, and improve health outcomes by advancing renewable energy and energy efficiency. These new jobs also have the potential to employ workers in places where racial bias, exclusion, and sustained disinvestment have produced communities of concentrated poverty. However, without critical measures that ensure both job access and job quality, these investments may instead result in low-quality seasonal and temporary jobs that fail to benefit frontline communities and workers from fossil fuel industries directly affected by the transition to a clean energy economy.

Best Practice:

Provide access to high quality jobs in renewable energy and energy efficiency for job seekers from frontline communities.

In this section:
- Pre-apprenticeship and Apprenticeship Programs
- Targeted and Local Hiring Measures
- Project Labor Agreements for Construction Jobs
- High Road Structures for Government Contracting
“These new jobs have the potential to employ workers in places where racial bias, exclusion, and sustained disinvestment have produced communities of concentrated poverty.”

Over the last decade, local governments and community organizations have successfully designed a series of programs and policies that meet these challenges and offer important lessons for the work ahead. These efforts point to four key strategies for advancing access to good jobs: strong, inclusive pre-apprenticeship and apprenticeship programs; targeted and local hiring measures; project labor agreements (PLAs) for construction jobs; and smart approaches to government contracting.

**Pre-apprenticeship and Apprenticeship Programs**

Creating access to good jobs and high-road careers starts with ensuring workers have the skills they need, especially in fields like construction, manufacturing and engineering. Particularly in the construction sector, high quality pre-apprenticeship and apprenticeship training programs have proven to be an essential element of an effective jobs access strategy. Apprenticeship programs provide workers with paid, on the job training experience, and related instruction to learn the skills and knowledge required for an occupation and career. Joint labor-management apprenticeship programs are run by unions and contractors and are funded by contractors and workers who pay into an apprenticeship and training fund that is used to cover the costs of the program. These kinds of apprenticeship programs have proven to be the most effective at both enrolling women and people of color and graduating participants into journey-level status.8

Pre-apprenticeship programs recruit and prepare participants for apprenticeship programs. These programs provide orientation to an industry, job readiness training, and financial support to address needs such as related tools and equipment, transportation and child care. The strongest pre-apprenticeship programs partner closely with high-road apprenticeship programs and employers to ensure their training prepares participants for the next level. The North America’s Building Trade Unions have prepared a Multi-Craft Core Curriculum for pre-apprenticeship programs that supports such programs.
Local workforce development agencies may also partner with pre-apprenticeship and apprenticeship programs to provide intake and job readiness screening and other services and support for jobs seekers, including for example, job seekers from immigrant communities who may require language access support when seeking job opportunities and training programs. Partnerships with community-based organizations, including worker centers, are often critical to reach job seekers from low-income communities and communities of color and address language access needs as well.

BIG STEP is an example of a pre-apprenticeship program started by the Milwaukee Building and Construction Trades Council and Milwaukee Public Schools. The program later merged with the Wisconsin Regional Training Partnership (WRTP) with the mission of improving employers’ and unions’ ability to recruit, train and develop qualified community residents for skilled trades and industries. BIG STEP/WRTP focuses on serving communities of color and other marginalized populations. The majority of participants are African-American or have an arrest or conviction history. The program provides hands on pre-employment training certificates, individual tutoring, and job readiness training with 50% to 75% of graduates being placed in apprenticeship programs.

Targeted and Local Hiring Measures

Local and state governments and community organizations have made effective use of targeted and local hiring measures on major economic development and construction projects to deliver good jobs for those who need them most. These measures typically require employers to set aside a portion of jobs for local and/or disadvantaged residents, and sometimes include requirements to obtain job applicants from a particular source, such as a workforce agency. The ample experience of targeted hiring programs across the country suggests employing the following approaches when using targeted hiring measures to require employers to include jobs seekers from low-income communities and communities of color:

- Clearly define the categories and percentage of beneficiaries to be hired;
- Create a well-supported pipeline of high quality pre-apprenticeship and apprenticeship programs;
- Ensure that a certain percentage and/or total of first-year apprentices include job seekers from disadvantaged communities;
- Monitor and track specified goals and requirements with processes for problem solving and compliance.

Targeted hiring measures can focus both on individual characteristics that address barriers to employment for women and workers of color, unemployed or under-employed residents, and people with arrests and convictions histories, or can focus on residency. For example, when Oakland, CA redeveloped a massive former army base into a warehousing and logistics facility, the City required that 50% of all construction work hours be performed by local residents and 25% of all work hours be performed by disadvantaged residents with particular barriers to employment. The City also included protections against hiring discrimination for job applicants with a conviction history. So far, contractors on the project have exceeded both of these hiring requirements.

In addition to identifying the people and communities that will benefit and specifying the numerical goals to be achieved for intended beneficiaries, strong job access standards also describe how the recruitment and hiring process will work. A clean energy jobs program should address the roles and responsibilities of contractors and subcontractors, a centralized coordinator and job centers, apprenticeship programs, and the private developer or public entity managing the project. First source referral centers are community-based organizations and workforce development agencies that function as a clearinghouse for employers and construction union hiring halls, providing them with trained, job-ready applicants.
They operate best when coupled with targeted hiring requirements and require dedicated resources to support the outreach and recruitment of workers as well as standardized skills certification provided by joint labor-management programs discussed above.

For non-construction jobs, such as those in manufacturing, targeted hiring measures should ensure that employers provide first source referral centers first notice of openings, refrain from hiring candidates from other sources for a set period of time and make a good faith effort to hire the worker referred by the program. Partnerships among community-based organizations, workforce development agencies and programs, and unions that work with displaced workers and job seekers from communities of color and high poverty communities are critical to support targeted hiring goals.

**Project Labor Agreements for Construction Jobs**

For construction jobs, project labor agreements (PLAs, also called community workforce agreements when they include job access measures) are legally binding contracts that establish the terms and conditions of a specific project. They are typically used on larger projects, though in some cases local governments have required PLAs on projects as small as those with project costs of $500,000. These agreements address wages and benefits, health and safety trainings, conflict resolution, and can include targeted hiring requirements and procedural measures to support those requirements. PLAs are negotiated and signed by labor unions, general contractors, and the developer or project owner. For workers, the benefits of PLAs go beyond a single project. Once part of a union, members have access to work long after their inaugural project is over. They also gain global credentials, networks that allow them to work in different jurisdictions, and health and retirement benefits that are particularly important in the physically labor-intensive construction industry.

Where it is not possible to use project labor agreements, local governments can use other measures to protect the quality of jobs, including basic standards around total compensation and workplace safety training.

**High Road Structures for Government Contracting**

By structuring their contracting approach to encourage the creation of good clean energy jobs, local and state government hiring policies can help ensure a level, high-road playing field for all contractors participating in an energy efficiency or renewable energy program. **Responsible contractor policies** require contractors and subcontractors to meet specific job access requirements and job quality standards in order to bid on a project. Criteria set forth in these policies can include requirements around wages, benefits, safety, work history, performance, bonding and insurance, compliance with applicable laws, and targeted hiring. Local and state governments can also pre-qualify contractors to perform work as part of an energy efficiency program using high road standards for entry into the pool. Governments can also use **best value contracting**, another approach in which the government evaluates competitive bids based on a range of factors, not just which entity submits the lowest responsive bid. As a part of developing the scoring system, key stakeholders can help assign points in the bidding process for matters such as commitments to meet quantifiable job access and job quality standards on projects. (See also Bundling small or dispersed projects together to improve jobs outcomes)

Monitoring and tracking goals of a project ensure transparency and accountability where community benefits are specified and are a critical component of any job access and job quality strategy. This is discussed in more detail later in this toolkit.
Enhabit, formerly Clean Energy Works Oregon, is a nonprofit that provides energy efficiency upgrades and solar installations to Oregon residents. Enhabit began as a first of its kind pilot program in Portland funded by the Energy Efficiency and Conservation Block Grant (EECBG), part of the American Recovery and Reinvestment Act. The City of Portland’s Bureau of Planning and Sustainability worked with a broad range of stakeholders including Enterprise Cascadia, Multnomah County, Portland Development Commission, Energy Trust of Oregon, NW Natural, Portland General Electric, Pacific Power, Construction Apprenticeship & Workforce Solutions, Worksystems Inc., Portland Housing Bureau, Home Performance Contractors Guild and Green for All to develop a program to reduce financial barriers for saving energy using low-interest, long-term financing to cover upfront costs, and create high quality jobs for historically underserved communities.

The pilot program used best value contracting to incentivize targeted hiring of low-income people, women, and people of color to perform 30 percent of the total hours worked, paying workers 180 percent of the minimum wage and providing health insurance, and hiring from designated training programs. When moving the pilot program to scale as Clean Energy Works Oregon, community, labor, and contractor groups came together to form the High Road Community Contractor Alliance and cover a portion of the Clean Energy Works program under a project labor agreement.

The pilot program provided 584 low-interest loans for complete home energy upgrades and resulted in a 20 percent or greater reduction in energy consumption in most homes. The program paid average wages of about $20 per hour, employed more than 400 workers with people of color working 48 percent of the total hours worked, and doubled state and national rates of participation in women in construction. Today, Enhabit’s jobs employ women and people of color in 55 percent of the total work hours to deliver its services.
“Today, Enhabit’s jobs employ women and people of color in 55 percent of the total work hours to deliver its services.”
People United for Sustainable Housing (PUSH Buffalo) is a local membership-based community organization fighting to make affordable housing a reality on Buffalo’s West Side. PUSH, the Center for Working Families and allies drafted and successfully advocated for an innovative law, the Green Jobs - Green New York Act of 2009, which uses revenue from the sale of carbon emission credits to improve access to energy efficiency programs for low-income households and create high-quality green jobs for New York workers. Through the New York State Energy Research and Development Authority (NYSERDA), Green Jobs - Green New York provides funding for energy assessments, low-cost financing for energy upgrades, and technical and financial support to develop a clean energy workforce in partnership with local community-based organizations such as PUSH Green, a non-profit weatherization and energy efficiency organization founded by PUSH Buffalo. Since 2012, PUSH Green has moved millions of dollars of weatherization funding into Western New York while training local community residents and formerly incarcerated people for high-quality green jobs.
PUSH Green uses a responsible contracting jobs strategy to encourage high road contractors to join their friends and family contractors’ network. PUSH Green’s neighborhood outreach workers find families who qualify for energy upgrades such as insulation or new furnaces and bundles these homes into groups of 5 to 10 homes to give contractors, especially women and minority owned contracting businesses, significant contracts and stable work. In exchange, contractors agree to pay family sustaining wages and benefits and hire local workers. Contractors give PUSH Green the first opportunity to make job candidate referrals (first source referral) for open employment positions. PUSH Green also matches contractors with workforce development programs that train community members on weatherization, solar panel installation, and rain gardens. PUSH Green provides direct training and paid apprenticeships for local job seekers. For example, through its Healthy Homes Demonstration Project with the Center for Employment Opportunities (CEO), an organization that provides employment services to formerly incarcerated people, PUSH Green and CEO provided an OSHA 10 hour certification and hands on construction training to 80 participants as part of a green retrofit of affordable housing within PUSH’s Green Development Zone. The initial pilot effort resulted in over 130 residential retrofits and 77 local residents of Buffalo’s West Side referred to workforce training programs and placements. By organizing the community to advocate for green energy, helping local homeowners access existing weatherization programs, training workers and supporting high road contractors, PUSH Green has created a comprehensive and thriving community jobs pipeline in Western New York.
As discussed above, a focus on local and targeted hiring, project labor agreements, pre-apprenticeships, and apprenticeships is critical to improving job outcomes and job quality wherever clean energy and energy efficiency project investments are made. In addition, choices made by communities, states, and utilities about energy planning and the structure of energy projects can enhance job creation and job quality, and create lasting career pathways.

**Make workforce planning part of state energy policy, planning, and utility negotiations**

Today’s energy workforce is aging, with widespread retirements imminent and a deep need for training and retraining to adjust to changing technology in the energy sector. While the utility industry and many utility regulators recognize this need, there is no consensus yet on how to meet this demand for new workers and how to ensure that a new generation of energy jobs are high quality jobs that reach local communities. As part of state implementation plans under the Clean Power Plan, state integrated resource planning, or state energy or related legislation, stakeholders have the opportunity to push for formal utility workforce planning that involves communities, labor, industry, and workforce and economic development entities. Such planning can lead to investments in training and retraining, pre-apprenticeship programs and apprenticeships, and recruitment and retention of workers from low-income communities and communities of color over the long term. Partnerships with major utilities or unions could also include commitments to targeted hiring and career paths.
Follow best practices in workforce training

Investments in workforce training and education should follow a few basic rules, wherever these workforce development plans and investments are made:

• Leverage existing training providers and training offerings, particularly certified apprenticeship programs, in coordination with state and federal labor agencies;

• Invest in greening traditional occupations, adding new skills to career-track jobs, rather than developing new single skill job classifications (e.g. solar installer);

• Ensure that clean energy job opportunities expand union apprenticeship programs to add new members from frontline communities;

• Incorporate employment nondiscrimination and equal opportunity practices in contracts;²⁵

• Invest in training that leads to a credential or certification that is nationally recognized by industry and public educational institutions;

• Address training needs for new, entry-level workers as well incumbent workers. Incumbent workers may require retraining and can also mentor newly hired workers;²⁶

• Always invest in training interventions in concert with policies connected to long-term career pathways and employment opportunities to avoid training for jobs that do not exist or will not last;

• Bundle small or dispersed projects together to improve jobs outcomes.

Bundling small or dispersed projects together to improve job outcomes

While utility scale clean energy projects and large building efficiency projects are more frequently covered by project labor agreements or higher labor or skills standards, residential efficiency upgrades, rooftop solar installation and similar smaller scale projects may often be carried out by contract workers, in short-term projects. Bundling these smaller projects into larger projects provides the opportunity to couple them with higher negotiated labor standards and longer-term work. Similarly, coupling clean energy or efficiency upgrades with broader building or housing stock upgrades or infrastructure projects can provide a wider and longer term range of job and training opportunities and deliver more extensive benefits to communities.
The Utility Pre-Craft Trainee (UPCT) program is a joint labor-management collaboration between Los Angeles Department of Water and Power (LADWP) and IBEW Local 18 with over 200 workers trained thus far. The pre-apprenticeship program was developed in response to significant challenges facing the nation’s largest municipally-owned utility. LADWP faced waves of retirements and the need to transition to cleaner energy sources. Yet it lacked a pipeline of workers for these positions. At the same time, many communities in Los Angeles suffered from double digit unemployment. The creation of the program was supported by RePower LA, a community coalition anchored by the union, South LA-based Strategic Concepts for Organizing and Policy Education (SCOPE) and Los Angeles Alliance for a New Economy (LAANE). The coalition advocated for the creation of the program, waged a successful campaign to increase investment in the energy efficiency program, and served as a bridge to the utility’s programs, especially for hard-to-reach small businesses and low-income residents.

The goals of the RePower LA campaign – uniting quality job creation with improved services for the city’s underserved residents and environmental benefits – fit perfectly with SCOPE’s long-time mission. Over the past twenty years, SCOPE has advanced a series of job creation along with workforce campaigns linking low-income communities to growth industries in the region.

RePower LA’s advocacy efforts have benefitted from SCOPE’s deep roots and leadership network in South LA, where Latino and Black residents represent 63 percent and 29 percent of the population respectively, and over 30 percent of people live below the poverty line. Several SCOPE members joined the UPCT program. Other members have found training opportunities connected with energy efficiency outreach work. Still other members have benefitted from home upgrades, and SCOPE has also leveraged the campaign to develop grassroots leaders. SCOPE has organized town halls, career days, community events and public testimony that has caught the attention of decision makers. SCOPE and LAANE’s research has also been key to advancing campaign goals.
RePower LA successfully advocated for this innovative labor-management training program that provides pathways into real careers, while helping LADWP address critical workforce needs and meet demands incentivized by state and local policies to remove carbon emissions and increase renewable energy. Key aspects of this training program are worth highlighting:

**Front-loading the supports that are critical to success.** Trainees in an entry-level workforce development program often need a range of supports and services to be successful. In the UPCT program trainees are guaranteed a paycheck. The earn-while-you-learn program enables trainees to gain valuable work experience and earn a living while being introduced to the various career opportunities within the utility. They are also given support while they prepare for civil service exams, a key strategy for workers who might not otherwise have had access to a utility career. Work readiness training, and additional supportive services (e.g. bus tokens, gas money, etc.) are available throughout a worker’s tenure in the program. These supports are critical to removing common barriers to employment for many low-income and entry-level workers.

**Defining what “high quality” employment looks like:** This is particularly important in a sector like residential energy efficiency, where the vast majority of energy efficiency and weatherization programs are implemented through small and mid-sized construction and utility contractors. UPCT supports the union to take on a greater share of energy efficiency work that might otherwise be contracted out to low-road contractors. While most weatherization programs have no wage standards, the UPCT trainee’s wages are $16 an hour with a stipend for health benefits. The UPCT program includes on-the-job and classroom skills training in partnership with a local community college that has well-established technical experience in the utility and construction fields and national accreditation to train in weatherization assistance. Journey-level workers provide key supervision, training, and mentoring for UPCT trainees. The UPCT program reduces silos in the water and power sector and increases access to long-term career paths.
The Construction Careers Campaign, beginning in 2006, developed an effective model for creating jobs in low-income communities and protecting the public’s investment in infrastructure spending. It utilized a strong coalition which included community groups, construction trade unions, and local elected officials to pass and implement Construction Careers Policies at city and county agencies with the explicit intent of ameliorating chronic unemployment and concentrated poverty in low-income, communities of color.

In order to develop a comprehensive jobs program in Los Angeles County, the coalition identified government agencies pursuing significant public investment in public works projects or awarding subsidies to private developers, totaling over $12 billion in construction activity.

THE CONSTRUCTION CAREERS COALITION MEMBERS

Boyle Heights Youth Build
Coalition for Responsible Community Development
Cecil Murray Center for Community Engagement
East LA Community Corporation
East LA Worksource Center/ResCare
Historic Highland Park Neighborhood Council
Los Angeles and Orange Counties Building and Construction Trades Council

Friends Outside
Haven at the VA
Los Angeles Alliance for a New Economy
LA Black Worker Center
LA CAUSA-Youth Build
LA County Federation of Labor
MOVE LA
Pacoima Beautiful
Park Mesa Heights Neighborhood Council

Prevention Institute
Right Way Foundation
South East LA Worksource Center
Transportation for America
PV Jobs
SAJE
SCOPE
WeBuild
WINTER Women
Policy Victories in Los Angeles County (2008-2013)

- Community Redevelopment Agency - Los Angeles (CRA-LA)
- City of Los Angeles Department of Public Works
- Los Angeles County Board of Supervisors-MLK Hospital Ambulatory Center
- Port of Los Angeles
- Exposition Line Construction Authority
- Los Angeles County Metropolitan Transportation Authority (Metro)

In the six Construction Careers Policies negotiated through the advocacy of the Construction Careers Coalition, there were three provisions focused on creating access to apprenticeship programs for individuals in high unemployment zip codes: targeted hire, disadvantaged worker benefits and apprenticeship utilization. These provisions and the regional strategy of the Coalition create opportunities for workers to begin careers in construction, sustain their training, have access to consistent work, and earn family-supporting wages.

Benefits to workers go even further, as workers typically earn health benefits, pension benefits, paid vacation, paid holidays, paid overtime, job training that is portable, and continuing education throughout their careers. First-year apprentices earn an average of $16.52 while contributing to their pension and earning health benefits. These wages increase over their training until they become journey-level workers earning, on average, $31 per hour.32

The earn-while-you-learn model guarantees that apprentices can support their families immediately, while they take the time needed to gain invaluable training, creating a skilled and safety conscious workforce. LAANE estimates that through the life of the Construction Careers Policies, disadvantaged workers earned an additional $129 million in wages and benefits.33

“These provisions and the regional strategy of the Coalition create opportunities for workers to begin careers in construction, sustain their training, have access to consistent work, and earn family-supporting wages.”
Effective monitoring and enforcement mechanisms ensure that policy language, and programs for access to high quality jobs and career pathways for low-income communities and communities of color come to fruition and meet or exceed their goals. Achieving these outcomes requires dedicated resources, staffing, and mechanisms for transparency and accountability that are explicitly incorporated into the range of strategies available to ensure the job access and job quality standards discussed above. Partnerships between community-based organizations and a broad array of project stakeholders are critical to successful outcomes in these areas.

Frequent reporting requirements made publically available

Effective models for community monitoring and oversight include frequent reporting requirements using payroll records or sources of information that are easily generated. Monitoring and data collection should begin immediately with regular reports regarding hiring goals that are made publicly available.34

Proactive investigations and enforcement

Proactive investigations and enforcement provide workers with information about their rights and reduce fear of retaliation. Enforcement actions can also include stop-work orders or seeking compensation for workers and additional monetary relief. Enforcement of certain measures can also be undertaken by workers themselves when they are provided a private right of action. Ideally, enforcement is provided with the support of a state or local public labor standards office or an independent office with dedicated staff and resources. One potential source of funding for enforcement may be fees collected for violations.35

Partnerships with community-based organizations

Community-based organizations may assist with monitoring and oversight of project worksites in partnership with labor unions and state and local labor standards offices. Community-based organizations may also support enforcement activities by engaging and educating workers, assisting workers to file complaints, and engaging with the labor standards office or independent agency as needed to identify trends in violations to prioritize enforcement. Empowering worker organizations to engage with workers for monitoring, oversight, and enforcement activities are powerful tools to establish equal standing for workers with government and employers.36
“Effective monitoring and enforcement mechanisms ensure that policy language, and programs for access to high quality jobs and career pathways for low-income communities and communities of color come to fruition and meet or exceed their goals.”
The Los Angeles Black Worker Center’s (LABWC) mission is to increase access to quality jobs, reduce employment discrimination, and to improve industries that employ Black workers. In Los Angeles, Black unemployment hovers above 21%, and is estimated to be significantly higher for Black men ages 16 to 25, and 30 percent of Black workers are paid less than $12 per hour. Median wages in the construction sector are twice this amount, but Black communities are vastly underrepresented in the construction sector as well as construction trade union and apprenticeship programs.

In 2012, the Los Angeles Metropolitan Transit Authority (Metro) became the first transit agency in the country to adopt a project labor agreement policy for all major construction projects, including the $2.4 billion Crenshaw/LAX Transit Project, an 8.5 mile light-rail line that runs through the heart of LA’s Black community. The policy requires 40% of construction hours be performed by construction workers residing in economically disadvantaged areas, 10% participation of disadvantaged workers, and a 20% participation of apprentices.

LABWC’s Community Compliance and Monitoring Program ensures Metro, contractor, subcontractor, and union compliance under the Project Labor Agreement and Targeted Hire Program. LABWC partnered with IBEW Local 11 and SMART Local 105 and developed a community monitoring tool that uses both observational fieldwork and data collection to provide community oversight of the Crenshaw/LAX Transit Project PLA and ensure contractors conduct effective community outreach and comply with the PLA’s hiring goals. Crenshaw was the first of six rail projects developed under this agreement. In the winter of 2015, Black participation on the Crenshaw/LAX project reached 20 percent, up from no Black participation in the spring of 2015. LABWC community monitoring findings demonstrated the effectiveness of PLAs which include community enforcement models. The findings also supported the call for Metro to take additional steps by establishing a public entity to collect data, investigate claims, and partner with other state and federal agencies and community-based organizations to enforce job access and job quality standards among employers who do business in Los Angeles.
As illustrated throughout this toolkit, including examples from across the country, the Clean Power Plan offers the potential to meet or exceed emission goals for the nation’s existing power plants, while creating high quality, clean energy jobs, particularly for job seekers in low-income communities and communities of color. The policy and programmatic elements highlighted here: strong job access, job quality, workforce development and career pathways, and community oversight and enforcement mechanisms, are critical to ensure meaningful results for frontline communities. By advancing job creation and workforce training using the Clean Power Plan, states can simultaneously take positive steps to address the crises of climate change and inequality confronting our communities.
**KEY TERMS**

**Apprenticeship Programs:** Apprenticeship programs provide workers with paid, on the job training experience and related instruction to learn the skills and knowledge required for an occupation and career. They tend to be run by unions and employers from the relevant industry.

**Best Value Contracting:** A contracting approach in which bidder commitments to job access and job quality standards, and potentially other community benefits, are incentivized through points assigned in the bidding process. Key stakeholders must first come together to agree on the language or terms under which bids and projects will be scored, evaluated and monitored to improve job quality and access in awarding a contract.

**Community Benefit Agreement:** Legally binding agreements between developers and community organizations that define the benefits the developer promises to provide to the community. CBAs may, but do not always include job access requirements and job quality standards.

**First Source Referral:** First source referral systems create a pipeline of qualified low-income workers, workers of color and disadvantaged workers such as displaced workers and formerly incarcerated workers. First source referral agencies are community-based organizations and workforce development agencies that recruit, train, support and match workers. Employers commit to giving first source referral programs first notice of openings and refrain from hiring outside the system for a set period for each job opening. The targeted outreach and additional services and support provided by first source referral programs help disadvantaged job seekers break into the job market.

**Frontline Communities:** Other terms include environmental justice communities, disadvantaged communities and marginalized communities. Frontline communities refer to communities such as communities of color, indigenous communities, low-income communities, and immigrants who tend to experience disproportionate proximity and exposure to pollution burdens and also experience disproportionate barriers to income, employment, education, and language access due to structural and institutional discrimination.

**High-road Standards:** High-road standards include requirements for high-quality wages, working conditions, and benefits as well as training programs that lead to long-term career paths for the collective benefit of workers, employers, and consumers.

**Hiring Hall:** In construction, union hiring halls provide employers with trained, job-ready workers. Project labor agreements or collective bargaining agreement may require employers to treat hiring halls as the primary source of all craft labor, provide hiring halls first notice of openings while refraining from hiring outside for a set period for each job opening.
Integrated Resource Plans/Planning (IRP’s): In many states, the agency that regulates electricity provision – often called the Public Utility Commission (PUC) or Public Service Commission (PSC) – requires that the state’s utilities periodically submit long-term plans for how they will meet the state’s electricity needs. The commission reviews the plans to ensure they serve the public interest in terms of reliability, cost to consumers, equity, environmental protection, benefit to the economy, and other areas. Often, stakeholders, such as community and economic development groups, can also be involved in this review and shape decisions about energy investments and provision in the state.

Pre-apprenticeship Programs: Pre-apprenticeship programs are designed to prepare participants for apprenticeship programs and include orientations to an industry, job readiness training, and financial support to address needs such as related tools and equipment, transportation, and childcare.

Private Right of Action: Private right of action allows individuals and private parties to bring forward a lawsuit where violations occur.

Project Labor Agreement: Project labor agreements are legal-binding documents that establish terms and conditions of a specific project, or specific projects under an agency’s jurisdiction. These terms and conditions may include agreements on targeted or local hiring, wages and benefits, health and safety trainings, and processes for communication and resolving conflicts among stakeholders. PLAs are negotiated and signed by labor unions, general contractors, and the developer or project owner, including government entities.

Responsible Contracting: Responsible contractor policies require contractors and subcontractors to meet specific job access requirements and job quality standards in order to bid on a project so that only these bids are considered and low road contractors are not forced to compete with high road contractors who commit to guaranteeing good wages and benefits and developing career pathways for their workforce.

Stop-Work Orders: Stop-work orders are legal notices that require employers or contractors to immediately suspend all work and business operations not meeting agreed upon job quality and job access standards.

Utility Workforce Planning: Individual utility companies, their associations, labor and other industry stakeholders, as well as energy departments and other government entities, are developing plans or initiatives to ensure that there are enough properly skilled workers to meet the needs of the rapidly changing energy industry and to ensure that the energy jobs pipeline delivers good jobs.
KEY RESOURCES

Ban the Box: Today, nearly 1 in 3 people have an arrest or conviction history and discriminatory policing and incarceration creates barriers to employment, especially among people of color, long after people complete their sentences and return home. The Ban the Box movement was first started by members of All of Us or None, a grassroots civil and human rights organization fighting for the rights of formerly- and currently-incarcerated people and directly affected families.

• For more information on best practices to Ban the Box and address discrimination experienced by formerly incarcerated people and people with arrest and conviction histories see additional resources from Legal Services for Prisoners with Children/All of Us or None and the National Employment Law Project (NELP). 

• PWF and NELP have also put together resources on model hiring agreements that specifically address barriers to employment for people with arrest and conviction histories. Ella Baker Center, PolicyLink, and NELP have also written about the how energy efficiency programs can address barriers to employment for formerly incarcerated people.

Career Pathways in Clean Energy & Energy Efficiency:

• Based at the University of Wisconsin-Madison, Center on Wisconsin Strategies (COWS) is a national think-and-do tank that promotes high road solutions to social problems. These treat shared growth and opportunity, environmental sustainability, and resilient democratic institutions as necessary and achievable complements in human development. COWS research and publications have identified strategies to strengthen local economies and create jobs while also investing in green and resilient infrastructure.

• The Emerald Cities Collaborative is a national nonprofit network of organizations working to advance a sustainable environment for all while creating greater economic opportunities for all. Emerald Cities specializes in strategies to transform the energy efficiency sector by retrofitting building stock, creating high wage jobs, and revitalizing the local economies of our metropolitan regions.

• The University of California Berkeley Center for Labor and Research carries out research on topics such as job quality and workforce development issues, and works with unions, government, and employers to develop innovative policy perspectives and programs.

• The University of Southern California Program for Environmental and Regional Equity (PERE) conducts research and facilitates discussions on issues of environmental justice, regional inclusion, and social movement building.

• The Center for Energy Workforce Development builds the alliances, processes, and tools to develop the energy workforce and includes the energy industry, labor, state workforce investment boards, community colleges and others.
The Political Economy Research Institute at the University of Massachusetts promotes human and ecological well-being through original research. PERI’s approach is to translate what we learn into workable policy proposals that are capable of improving life on our planet today and in the future. PERI’s recent research includes analysis on the employment effects of clean energy investment and prospects for clean energy and energy efficiency.52

The Department of Energy Jobs Strategy Council is a US Department of Energy initiative that focuses on aiding stakeholders and states to meet the energy sector skills gap in ways that continue to build good jobs across the energy industry.51

Community Benefit Agreements and Community Workforce Agreements:

- The Partnership for Working Families (PWF) is national network of leading regional advocacy organizations who support innovative solutions to our nation’s economic and environmental problems. PWF has written extensively about and continues to do leading edge work on Community Benefits Agreements, Community Workforce Agreements and other tools that improve job access and job quality in the construction and energy efficiency sectors.

- The Community Benefits Law Center, a project of the Partnership for Working Families, provides legal assistance to community-based efforts to transform local economies.

Integrated Resource Planning:

- The Regulatory Assistance Project (RAP) helps energy and air regulators and NGOs navigate the complexities of power sector policy, regulation, and markets, so they can most effectively assist in the transition to clean, reliable, and cost-effective energy resources.

Monitoring and Enforcement:

- The Center for Innovation in Worker Organization (CIWO) addresses our nation’s rising economic inequality, precarious workforce, and racial inequality by developing innovative research, strategies and programs. CIWO helps organizations recruit and grow their membership, build the bench of future leaders, innovate strategies for cross-organizational campaigns, and incubate ideas for emerging movements in worker and community organizing.

- NELP is also at the forefront of designing state and local policy solutions to build robust enforcement systems that translate policy wins into real improvements in workers’ lives.54
REFERENCES

1 For more information about the Supreme Court stay see this brief from the Institute for Policy Integrity, found at: http://policyintegrity.org/documents/CPP_Stay_PolicyBrief.pdf

2 Terms in bold text are defined in the Key Terms section of the Toolkit’s Appendix.


5 Visit epa.gov/cleanpowerplan for more information about the Clean Power Plan, its benefits, and the Clean Energy Incentive Program.

6 Front and Centered elevates the voices and interests of people of color and lower incomes to the center of climate policy, community-based education and organizing, and impact investments in Washington State. They provide an excellent statement of Principles for Climate Justice that can be found at: https://www.weareoneamerica.org/sites/weareoneamerica.org/files/Principles for Climate Justice.pdf

7 For more information on policies and pathways for people who work in fossil fuel industries and affected communities see Clean Power for All Toolkit: Just Transition

8 Joint-labor management programs enroll over 110,000 people of color while non-union programs enroll about 37,000 people of color, and union programs enroll 80% of all women that participate in construction apprenticeship programs. In addition, union programs produce a significantly higher number of graduates who become journey level workers: the graduation rate is 42.8% for union apprenticeship programs and 29.5% for non-union apprenticeship programs. Robert W. Glover and Cihan Bilginsoy, “Registered Apprenticeship Training in the US Construction Industry,” Education + Training, Vol. 47 No. 4/5, 2005, pp 342-43; Xiuwen (Sue) Dong, “The Construction Chart Book,” Center to Protect Workers Rights, 2013, p. 31.

9 For more information on examples of tools, such as California’s CalEnviroScreen 2.0 (http://oehha.ca.gov/calenviroscreen/report/calenviroscreen-version-20), to geographically locate frontline communities, target investments, and ensure beneficial impacts please see the Clean Power for All Toolkits: Fair & Just Investments for Frontline Communities through the Clean Power Plan and Cleaning Up Pollution Hotspots


12 City of Oakland, Community Jobs Oversight Commission, “Agenda Packet for Meeting to be Held on January 21, 2016.”

13 Ibid.


Clean Energy Works Portland Community Workforce Agreement is available here: https://www.portlandoregon.gov/bps/50152?a=265161


Enhabit. Retrieved from https://enhabit.org/about/

PUSH Buffalo is an affiliate of People’s Action Institute, a network of grassroots organizations across the country that work to advance a national economic and racial justice agenda


See text to responsible contracting policy at: https://drive.google.com/file/d/0B5MprJ0QUMh3QU9jNHBoZ215emM/view?usp=sharing&pli=1

The Center for Employment Opportunities offers comprehensive employment services exclusively for people with arrest and conviction histories. CEO’s model is based on a highly structured program of life skill education, short-term paid transitional employment, full-time job placement and post-placement services. For more information visit: http://ceoworks.org/

For more information about PUSH Green visit http://www.pushgreenwny.org.

Executive Order 11245 regulates federal contractors to refrain from discrimination and take affirmative steps to ensure that applicants and employees receive equal employment opportunity regardless of race, color, religion, sex, and/or national origin. For more information see http://www.dol.gov/ofccp/regs/compliance/ca_11246.htm

See Clean Power for All Collaborative Toolkit: Just Transition, for more on how to protect workers, their families, and their communities in the event of job loss and plant closures in carbon-intensive-industries.


See http://www.repowerla.org/researchandresources for research from RePowerLA.


31 For more important lessons from this program, please visit this blog post from UC Berkeley’s Carol Zabin: http://blogs.berkeley.edu/2013/03/26/going-green-and-growing-jobs-the-right-way/


33 Ibid.


38 See text to PLA here: http://media.metro.net/about_us/pla/images/agreement_projectlabor_2015.pdf

39 See here for LABWC’s strategies for promoting community outreach and employment opportunities: https://drive.google.com/file/d/0B5MprJ0QUMh3Z0hybjfUDljVVk/view?usp=sharing

40 This utilization report (https://drive.google.com/file/d/0B5MprJ0QUMh3LXg0NTlhQT0QvV3c/view?usp=sharing) is an example of the tracking tools developed as part of the PLA to ensure a transparent process for the general public to be informed about how public investments would support the workforce and community hiring goals.


45 National Employment Law Project, PolicyLink & Ella Baker Center for Human Rights. Retrieved from: http://d3n8a8pro7vhmx.cloudfront.net/greenforall/pages/5046/attachments/original/1430256019/


48 For research and reports on workforce development, green buildings and infrastructure, and pathways to a high road economy see http://emeraldcities.org/.

49 For more on energy efficiency, creating jobs, and training workforce see Beyond Green Jobs: Building Lasting Opportunities in Energy Efficiency by the California Construction Academy and the UCLA Center for Labor Research and Education: http://stem.aihec.org/Projects/NREL/Resource Library/Beyond-Green-Jobs-CCA-UCLA.pdf

50 For more information see: http://dornsife.usc.edu/pere/greenmanufacturing/

51 For additional information on how climate policy can successfully incorporate principles of environmental justice, economic equity, and public accountability see the forthcoming report, Advancing Equity into California Climate Policy, from UC Berkeley, University of Southern California, and Occidental College.

GOOD JOBS IN A CLEAN ENERGY ECONOMY THROUGH THE CLEAN POWER PLAN