ADDENDUM: a response to List of issues and questions in relation to the eighth periodic report of New Zealand – Addendum Replies of New Zealand

June 2018.
# LIST OF ISSUES – response to Ministry for Women reply

The Issues are from the List of issues and questions in relation to the eighth periodic report of New Zealand\(^1\). The responses that we are responding to are those in the Replies of New Zealand\(^2\).

Overall the responses from the NZ Government tend to be superficial. There should be more detailed and much more informative responses.

## LEGISLATIVE AND INSTITUTIONAL FRAMEWORK

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Issue 1</th>
<th>It is stated in the report (para. 7) that there have been no changes with regard to the State party’s legal framework since its previous report because it already provides comprehensive protection against all forms of discrimination covered under the Convention.(^1) Please clarify the extent to which the legal framework of the State party encompasses the elements of direct and indirect discrimination and seeks to achieve both formal and substantive equality between women and men (CEDAW/C/NZL/CO/7, para. 12). Please also provide examples of cases, if any, where the provisions of the Convention have been invoked by national courts. Please further provide information on specific measures taken to raise awareness and to enhance knowledge of the rights of women under the Convention, including through training for judges and lawyers.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Response 3</td>
<td>We are not clear on the independent institutional structure to which the Ministry for Women (MfW) refers, or its effective enforcement. Some examples would provide more understanding of this statement.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Response 4</td>
<td>The New Zealand Bill of Rights Act 1990 uses sex rather than gender and needs to be more inclusive.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Response 5</td>
<td>The vetting of all new legislation (para 5) is at a very high level, often seen as a tick box exercise.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Response 9</td>
<td>The regional meetings and other forums have very limited attendance. There is no indication given as to how often the meetings were held and how many people attended. Nor is there any information on how promotion of the Convention was made to men.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Response 10 and 11</td>
<td>We are not aware of any such measures being undertaken by the Ministry. Lawyers’ professional development requirements in New Zealand are not</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---


prescriptive in terms of subject, just the number of hours that need to be certified each year within a professional development plan. This is self-directed planning, so it is not systematic coverage, as not all lawyers would opt into these courses.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Issue 2</th>
<th>In accordance with the State party’s obligations under articles 1 and 2 of the Convention and in line with Sustainable Development Goal 5, to end all forms of discrimination against all women and girls everywhere, please provide information on the activities of existing mechanisms mandated to promote, enforce and monitor equality and the principle of non-discrimination on the basis of sex, including direct and indirect discrimination in the private and public spheres, as well as intersecting forms of discrimination, in all areas covered by the Convention. Please also provide information regarding the existing system for the collection, sharing and analysis of data, disaggregated by sex, age, ethnicity and disability, pertaining to all areas covered by the Convention.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Response 13</td>
<td>MfW has not been active around the SDGs, nor have other Ministries apart from the Ministry for Foreign Affairs and Trade (MFAT). It seems likely that there will be cross referencing between the proposed Living Standards Framework led by Treasury and the SDGs. This framework will not have a specific focus on women, and much of the gender related work—as with work related to the benchmarking and changing of gender norms and stereotypes, is being done by NGOs like NCWNZ, not government.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Response 16</td>
<td>Women’s groups do not find data disaggregated to the level required. While there is usually a male / female disaggregation, there is nothing for transgender. For the data that does exist, it is not easy to disaggregate by topic (eg relating to how women with disabilities are faring in comparison to men with disabilities, or in comparison to women without disabilities, rural vs urban disabled women). Nor is it easy to find disaggregated data on victims of domestic violence, poverty levels, uptake of tertiary education, availability of housing for single women/mothers/elderly women. There is still work to be done on Recommendation 6.5 of the Concluding Observations. The Integrated Data Infrastructure(^4) contains many data sets collected from across government agencies including the Disabilities Surveys from 1996 to 2013. Previously undertaken on a five-yearly cycle, this survey will in future be on a ten-year cycle.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Issue 3</th>
<th>It is indicated in the report (para. 10) that the Ministry for Women, the principal adviser on achieving better outcomes for women, focuses on four priority areas. Please provide information on how the implementation of those priority areas is monitored, considering that the State party has not adopted an action plan for women. Please clarify whether the State party has gender focal points in ministries and government departments to implement and monitor progress on gender-mainstreaming activities, including in Tokelau. Please also provide information on the progress made in implementing gender-responsive budget activities, and on steps taken to increase the budget allocation for the Ministry for Women, thereby enabling it to carry out its activities as the national machinery for the advancement of women effectively (CEDAW/C/NZL/CO/7, para. 18). Please provide information on the situation of women and girls in Tokelau.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Response 22 | While Cabinet papers before the Cabinet Social Wellbeing Committee have a Gender Impact Statement, the Committees\(^5\) listed below are not required to have papers with Gender Impact Statements despite the subject material being very relevant to the status of women:  
- Cabinet Appointments and Honours Committee  
- Cabinet Business Committee  
- Cabinet Priorities Committee  
- Cabinet Crown/Māori Relations Committee  
- Cabinet Economic Development Committee  
- Cabinet Environment, Energy and Climate Committee  
- Cabinet External Relations and Security Committee  
- Cabinet Government Administration and Expenditure Review Committee  
- Cabinet Legislation Committee.  
Even where the requirement does exist, the gender impact statement requirement tends to have been treated as a tick-box exercise. We are not aware of any systematic and consistent training given to civil servants outside the MfW on these requirements. As a result, important policies and law changes that impact on women are not given the scrutiny that they deserve.  
We are also not aware of any gender focal points within Ministries for policy purposes. |
| Response 23 | While it is appreciated that there was an increase for MfW in the 2016 Budget, $1.83 million over 4 years barely equates to four salaries. This is insufficient, given the scale of work that needs to be done. |

## ACCESS TO JUSTICE

| Issue 4 | Information before the Committee indicates that there has been a steady decline in the number of lawyers providing legal aid and that changes in the legal aid system disadvantage women, particularly migrant women. Please provide information on specific measures being taken to ensure access to justice for women, particularly migrant women, in line with general recommendation No. 33 (2015) on women’s access to justice. Please also provide information on steps being taken to ensure that legal aid is available to women and girls, particularly from disadvantaged groups such as Māori, Pasifika and migrant women and women with disabilities. |
|-----------------------------------------------|

### Response 28

While free legal assistance is available from community law centres, it should be noted that these centres are not available in every town and were suffering significantly from funding problems through the reporting period. For example, Community Law Centres Aotearoa chief executive officer Elizabeth Tennet stated in 2015 that:

… while the cost of running the service has gone up over the years, static funding - which was capped at $10.97 million in 2008 due to the global financial crisis - has led to great cost cutting across the board. … the Consumers Price Index (CPI) has increased by 11.14% and community law centres have lost 11.14% of their purchasing power over that time. Nationally, centres have lost $1.22 million in purchasing power from 2008 to 2014 as a result of static funding. If their funding had kept pace with the CPI, they should now be receiving funding of $12.19 million per year...

Recent changes to the legal aid system have disadvantaged women in general and migrant women in particular. The number of lawyers offering legal aid has declined steadily since 2012. The current system continues to exclude a large number of women from appropriate services and from seeking appropriate advice to fight for their rights. As stated in the NGO submission, there should be a review of the legal aid system to ensure that it is accessible to those currently disadvantaged.

Lack of resources to support migrant women going through the justice system remains a concern, with urgent attention needed to address this. Migrant women’s leadership programmes and targeted training can help to turn around some of these statistics.

Court closures around the country have also impacted on women being able to access justice services.

---


### TEMPORARY SPECIAL MEASURES

**Issue 5**

It is stated in the report that temporary special measures are not the best way to address inequalities between women and men (para. 35). Please provide information on the introduction of any measures aimed at accelerating the realization of de facto equality between women and men in the State party, in accordance with article 4 (1) of the Convention and the Committee’s general recommendation No. 25 (2004) on temporary special measures.

The previous government was against temporary special measures. The present government has not yet presented its views on them.

### STEREOTYPES AND HARMFUL PRACTICES

**Issue 6**

Please provide information on measures being taken to change social and cultural patterns that lead to stereotyping and the reinforcement of traditional roles of women and men in the family and society, particularly targeting the media, which perpetuate discrimination against women and girls (CEDAW/C/NZL/CO/7, para. 21). Please provide an update on progress and challenges in combating cyberbullying following the entry into force of the Harmful Digital Communications Act in 2015, and in eliminating harmful practices such as child marriage. Please also describe the impact such measures have had in eliminating stereotypical perceptions and attitudes regarding the roles of women in the family and society.

**Response 33**

Insufficient information is provided on who the “diverse range of communities” are and in which sectors they are operating, or what resources are being provided.

**Response 35**

MfW has no outreach services beyond website and social media. Media releases have increased since the change of government in 2017.

**Response 36**

The research report referred to is a starting point – the sample size was very small at 12 focus groups in the main centres with 95 16-17 year olds participating. The focus groups were only run in schools.

**Issue 38**

New Zealand secondary schools have a high level of cyberbullying. A recent forum convened by the Human Rights Commission (HRC) on Hate Speech indicates this is an area of real concern.

### GENDER-BASED VIOLENCE AGAINST WOMEN

**Issue 7**

It is indicated in the report that violence against women in the State party is widespread and takes many different forms, including
Women Experiencing Discrimination 2016 – Addendum July 2018

physical, sexual and psychological abuse (para. 195), and that, although there has been a decline in the annual prevalence rate of partner violence and sexual violence against women since 2005, Māori women are twice as likely to experience gender-based violence as other groups of women (para. 197). Please provide information on the challenges and successes encountered in combating gender-based violence against women, including domestic violence, and particularly among Māori women, since the establishment of the Ministerial Group on Family Violence and Sexual Violence in 2014. Please provide an update on the status of the implementation of laws and policies designed to prevent violence against women, including domestic violence, and the findings of the Ministerial Group, which was due to submit a report to the Cabinet in June 2016.

Issue 8
According to information before the Committee, ethnic minority women who are brought to the State party for marriage are listed as “dependants” on their partners’ visas and, as a result, may suffer violence and abuse, including the threat of deportation. Please provide information on steps being taken to protect such women by ensuring appropriate monitoring of their situations until their marriages are registered and they are granted residency status in their own right. Please also provide data on protection orders issued during the reporting period, violations of those orders and the sanctions imposed as a result. Please also provide data, disaggregated by age and type of offence, on cases of violence against women reported to the police, the number of cases brought to court and the number of prosecutions and convictions resulting from those cases. Please provide information on the availability, accessibility and funding of shelters for women and girls who are victims of violence, particularly in rural areas (para. 206).

More marginalised women are invisible
In the context of demographic information8 9 10, significant numbers of New Zealand women are impacted by services and systems which do not serve them well. There are no specialist domestic or sexual violence services for disabled women; very limited culturally specific services for Māori, Asian, Pasifika and MELA women; and no specialist services for lesbian, bisexual and trans women. The Government must continue to consider the needs of all women when developing legislation, policy responses and services to women. The more marginalised women are invisible in this.

8 NZ Census data for 2013 for ethnicity and disability
10 Lucassen MFG, Clark TC, Moselen E, Robinson EM, Adolescent Health Research Group. 2014. Youth '12 the health and wellbeing of secondary school students in New Zealand: Results for young people attracted to the same sex or both sexes, Auckland: The University of Auckland.
Over-reliance on administrative data

An over-reliance on administrative data from the criminal justice system, when it is widely accepted that most survivors of family and sexual violence in New Zealand do not report violence, means that current policy is being driven by poor data. This point was addressed by 6.4 and 6.5 of the NGO Alternate Report. This impacts on all women, particularly more marginalised women, though in different ways. The institutional racism inside the criminal justice system means Māori and Pasifika are more likely to be criminalised at every stage of the criminal justice process. Disabled women and LGBTI women are less likely to be seeking help due to lack of support services and information specifically targeting their needs. Women from Asian and MELA backgrounds, particularly newer migrants, may not have access to appropriate language information about their rights, and may face challenges in reporting to the police related to culture and belonging.

There is no routine collection of demographic information of women going through the criminal justice system who have experienced violence, in particular in relation to disability, sexuality and gender identity, and even to a certain extent, ethnicity.

It is not feasible to know the prevalence rates of violence because New Zealand does not have a national victimisation survey; it relies on administrative data.

Implementation of legislation

Many advocates raised serious concerns with the current implementation of legislation. For example, current multi-agency initiatives in family violence work well when women’s safety is central, and when women’s refuges and organisations can monitor decision-making. Advocates caution against measures of “success” for new initiatives that do not consider women’s safety; for example, measuring re-offending by reported rates of violence decreasing, even though Refuges report families are still seeking safe housing from them, but are not reporting to the police.

This implementation issue impacts on how many women will seek help. In particular, it is widely agreed that the reporting process for victims of sexual violence is retraumatising; it is also widely acknowledged that the Family Court is not currently implementing domestic violence legislation in ways which increase the safety of women and children after separation from abusive perpetrators.

Response 47

A new integrated, consistent and effective approach to family and sexual

---


violence is well-supported by advocates seeking a national strategy to address family and sexual violence.

Advocates cautioned that new services, laws and policies must be appropriate for more marginalised groups of women – as noted in the NGO Alternate Report\textsuperscript{15}, there are currently no dedicated violence prevention services for lesbian, bisexual and trans women; none for disabled women; one Refuge and no sexual violence services for Pasifika women; and inadequate services for ethnic minority women.

There is also concern that in the last 10 years, many community services that previously were first point of contact for women experiencing violence have disappeared through funding withdrawal or reduction. For example, Women’s Centres\textsuperscript{16} and Relationship Services Aotearoa\textsuperscript{17} (the single largest provider of government funded stopping violence programmes) are organisations forced to close or significantly reduce services.

There is a history of inadequate funding for kaupapa Māori responses to violence. We note the example in the government response, E Tū Whānau, is a government project, not a community led project. Such under-funding not only does a disservice to the 15\% of New Zealanders who identify as Māori, it is inconsistent with the government’s obligations under the UN Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples and the Treaty of Waitangi.

A focus on preventing violence, particularly primary prevention, is most welcome, but must be developed in consultation with community to meet the diverse needs of different populations. It is imperative this moves beyond the existing violence prevention sectors to ensure the needs of under-served groups are better considered.

The desire for appropriate measures of family and sexual violence prevalence rates is keenly felt by all working with survivors. It is imperative data is disaggregated by disability, ethnicity, sexuality and gender identity.

\textbf{Response 48}

The Family and Whānau Violence Legislation Bill is welcomed, but advocates wish to see the legislation adequately implemented. Current problems with implementation make women and children more unsafe as protections are not implemented properly. There is a need to invest in workforce development infrastructure and education for all working in the criminal justice sector including judges, lawyers and other professionals in addition to those working in health and social services. There are also specific implementation needs for more marginalised women such as ensuring that access to protection orders is understood inside the LGBTI/Rainbow community and ensuring that legal protections for family and sexual violence are available and accessible as part of settlement.


\textsuperscript{16} \url{https://www.radionz.co.nz/news/national/334494/women-s-centre-funding-whisked-away}

\textsuperscript{17} \url{https://nzfvc.org.nz/news/relationships-aotearoa-close-funding-models-and-issues-spotlight}
packages for new migrants to New Zealand.

Disability advocates remain concerned that the new Bill does not make it possible for disabled women to seek protection from caregivers from whom they may experience a range of abuse. This change has been long sought by the disability sector, as disabled people are vulnerable to abuse from caregivers, and are frequently in situations in which home care involves deeply personal activities such as bathing, dressing and support with medical needs. This omission is a major oversight in the proposed new legislation and fails to protect people with disabilities.

The Backbone Collective\(^{18}\) raised very serious concerns in relation to the safety of women and children after separation from abusive fathers, building on many reports in this area. These concerns about Family Court processes and decision-making are not addressed by the new legislation.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Response</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Response 49</strong></td>
<td>Advocates noted that the Family Violence Interagency Response System (FVIARS) was introduced as a multi-agency community response in 2006/07, but has never received co-ordination funding. This system was a partnership between NZ Police, then Child, Youth and Family, and community groups led by Women’s Refuge. Newer pilots of “joint responses” are all NZ Police led, with funding and direction decided by NZ Police. Other agencies are often unable to voice concerns for fear of losing contracts and this approach is not favoured by advocates who cite examples of critiques being shut down. These new “joint responses” have yet to be evaluated. Advocates note that large amounts of funding going into such pilots means all of their focus has to go on women who are reporting to the Police – a small percentage of women they work with – and has serious impacts for developing more appropriate services for more marginalised groups of women.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Response 50</strong></td>
<td>Advocates welcome the use of video interviews and other tools to help victims reduce secondary victimisation in sexual violence. NZ Police seem more willing to work on victim-related concerns, and are involved in making other digital resources available as well as seeking victim feedback in sexual violence cases.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Response 51</strong></td>
<td>It is not victims’ lack of knowledge which is creating attrition in sexual violence cases, it is legal protections not being well utilised in court-rooms, and fear of juries adherence to rape myths stopping cases meeting the “evidential threshold”. Advocates in sexual violence believe – and this has been recommended in multiple reports including two by the Law Commission – that little short of a major re-think of the current adversarial model in NZ courts will address attrition. Rape cases are four times less likely to go to court than other types of physical assaults(^{19}).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

\(^{18}\) [https://www.backbone.org.nz/](https://www.backbone.org.nz/)

| Response 52 | These frameworks are supported by advocates, but they miss information about disabled women entirely, as the timeframes for disabled communities to feedback were inadequate. |
| Response 54 | This funding was welcomed by advocates, but was offered as an interim solution to a funding crisis. Sustainable long-term funding agreements are critical to allow services to plan and grow their services to better respond to more marginalised women. There are no culturally specific sexual violence services for Pasifika women, ethnic minority women, disabled women or lesbian, bisexual and trans women. Many existing services are actively inappropriate or unsafe for these groups of women and can be retraumatising. |
| Response 55 | The new sexual harm service is welcomed by those working with women who are currently not able to access appropriate services from existing services. In particular, the service has the potential to better support women in rural communities, LGBTI/Rainbow survivors; disabled survivors; women from ethnic minority backgrounds, Māori and Pasifika women. Advocates from these communities have not been consulted on the development of this service, a major oversight and undermines the potential considerably. For example, there is no easy-to-read material online for people with intellectual impairments; and no clear connection to services such as Language Line. There has been no training for this service in responding appropriately to sexuality and gender diverse populations. There is no routine collection of demographic information meaning we will not know who is seeking help. |
| Response 56 | The ISR model is led by NZ Police, with funding and direction decided by NZ Police. See points under Response 49. |
| Response 57 | The new elder abuse response service is not well known. Funding for the Youthline service has been reduced. |
| Response 58 | This new position is welcomed by the family and sexual violence sectors, and those working with more marginalised communities. |
| Response 59 | The new multi-agency team with links to the non-government sector must develop relationships with under-served communities. Advocates query who is advising this group on violence inside LGBTI/Rainbow communities; disabled communities and ethnic minority communities. |
Response 60 | The changes to the national crime survey do not address concerns raised about the limits of asking questions in a crime survey about experiences which are shameful for many women; may involve talking about violence with someone they are living with, in front of a stranger, and do not ask a range of questions about sexual violence. Many survivors of family and sexual violence do not consider what happened to them a crime. Both on-the-ground and international evidence suggests crime surveys under-count victimisation. This is an area where community groups ask for victimisation surveys at a population level, rather than inclusion in crime surveys, and ask specifically that such surveys collect demographic information about ethnicity, gender and sexuality diversity, and disability.

Response 61 | There is no transparency for this family violence prevention advisory board – no members, activities or reports have been made public. Advocates ask for transparency, and input from more marginalised groups.

Response 63 | Some groups on campus are particularly vulnerable to sexual violence. There are concerns about generic strategies not being appropriate for LGBTI/Rainbow students; for international students’ wives, who may be a very isolated group; and for disabled students.

Response 64 | These figures come from a 2016 cabinet paper which largely focused on family and sexual violence strategic work in the criminal justice arena, rather than acknowledging that most women do not report most violence. While we agree we need better quality evidence from national victimisation surveys, using existing administrative data to “target interventions” is likely to produce discriminatory results as Māori and Pasifika are much more likely to be involved with the criminal justice systems. We must continue to learn, but investment in existing services, and the development of services to be more responsive to more marginalised groups, needs to happen now.

Response 65 | The Victims of Domestic Violence Policy is an important protection for women with insecure immigration status. Advocates query how women in these communities find out about this policy; whether it is well-understood in resettlement programmes; and how many use the policy compared with women with insecure immigration status experiencing violence. This protection is meaningless if we do not know if women know about it, and existing services for ethnic minority women in New Zealand experiencing

---


| **Response 66** | As above – both Shakti and Shama Ethnic Women’s Centre do not cover the whole country. |
| **Response 67** | The administrative data for these points is not disaggregated by disability, ethnicity, age, sexuality or gender identity. |
| **Response 68 and 72** | The problems with using administrative data for family and sexual violence when most women do not report violence have already been described. In addition, NZ Police no longer capture family violence incident data based on the relationship of the abuser to the victim, and the New Zealand Family Violence Clearinghouse is no longer funded to produce annual data summaries of existing administrative data. This means a gender lens is often not available, and data can be misrepresented by those with different agendas (for example, to argue that women are as violent as men). |
| **Response 73** | Concerns about funding Women’s Refuge includes inadequate funding; funding which is not long-term enough to develop services; and inadequate or completely non-existent services for the most marginalised women, including Māori, Pasifika and ethnic minority women; LGBTI/Rainbow women; and disabled women including those with mental health issues. Recent funding increases are very welcome, but this must translate to broadening and longevity of quality services. |

## PARTICIPATION IN POLITICAL AND PUBLIC LIFE

| **Issue 11** | It is stated in the report that the gender representativeness of Parliament has increased significantly since the advent of the mixed member proportional voting system in 1996, although it still has some way to go before it reflects the gender balance in society (para. 47). Although there has been some improvement in the representation of women in decision-making bodies, including in Parliament and the public service, women remain underrepresented in the judiciary, and on statutory boards and private-sector boards. Please provide information on steps envisaged to increase the number of women in elected and appointed decision-making bodies, including local councils, and statutory and private-sector boards, with a view to achieving equal representation of women in political and public life, including through the adoption of temporary special measures, in accordance with article 4 (1) of the Convention and general recommendation No. 25. Please also provide information on any incentives used by political parties and the private sector to increase the representation of women, particularly in decision-making positions |
This is a very general statement that does not provide any specific information. Women’s representation as MPs in Parliament has increased since the 2017 general election from 34% to 38%. If women were to be equally represented in the New Zealand Parliament, the proportion of women should be between 40 and 60%.

All political parties need to engage in strategies to ensure that women are candidates for safe seats in the next election or equally represented at the top of their parties' lists. Both the Labour Party and the Green Party have adopted deliberate strategies to improve women’s representation in Parliament. 75% of Green Party MPs and 45.6% of Labour MPs in 2018 are women. In 2018 New Zealand has women in the positions of Prime Minister, Deputy Speaker and Assistant Speaker. With the Minister for Women being a Minister outside Cabinet, the advocate for attention to the gendered implications of all political decisions is not present at the highest level of decision-making.

In 2015 NCWNZ recommended in a submission on the Inquiry into the 2014 General Election that Parliament had to become more ‘family friendly’ if women were to fully participate in political decision-making. Two of the MPs elected in late 2017 were parents of babies who have visited the House in order to be close to their mothers. Both the Prime Minister and the Minister of Women’s Affairs are expecting children in 2018. The prospects of the New Zealand Parliament becoming more ‘family friendly’ have increased in the last 8 months. This has the potential to encourage women who are parents of young children to put themselves forward as candidates for parliament.

MfW has produced very specific information on women’s representation in decision-making and public life though this information is not disaggregated by ethnicity. Nor does it indicate how many women sit on multiple boards. It would be useful if the NZ Government could refer more specifically to its gender-sensitive data collection and the trends indicated over the last 10 years.

Much of the work done to increase women’s representation in decision-making in the private sector is done by non-governmental organisations such as the Women on Boards Division of Governance New Zealand. It is not clear what support the New Zealand Government gives to these organisations.

There is no information provided on any specific actions that have been taken.

---

Response 90

Response 91 and 92

Response 93

Response 95

---


pursued in the last five years, nor on what new initiatives are planned. New Zealand has a declining number of women on boards / leadership roles in the private sector and is ranked one of the worst in the world\textsuperscript{24}. Grant Thornton International's annual Women in Business report\textsuperscript{25} showed women made up 31 per cent of senior teams in 2004, but this has dropped to 20 per cent by 2017, and reduced to 18 per cent in 2018.

Response 96

MiW does not identify how it acts as a connector. There is no information on any specific programmes run and what support and information is offered to which sets of women.

**EDUCATION**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Issue 12</th>
<th>It is acknowledged in the report that Māori and Pasifika women are less likely than their European and Asian counterparts to complete tertiary education (para. 88). It is also indicated that men continue to dominate the fields of information technology and engineering (para. 90). Please provide information on steps being taken to address the issue of Māori and Pasifika women and girls dropping out of school and measures to encourage girls to pursue courses in science, technology, engineering and mathematics, and whether the Curious Minds science initiative targets women and girls to that end. Please also provide information on the degree of access to education enjoyed by women and girls with disabilities in the State party.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Issue 13</td>
<td>Please provide an update on the impact of the implementation of programmes aimed at reducing the high rate of teenage pregnancy, particularly the better public service target programme (paras. 142 and 143). Please provide data on dropout rates for girls owing to pregnancy and the levels at which they occur, the number of teenage mothers who returned to school after childbirth during the reporting period, and the impact of indirect education costs (“voluntary donations”), which reportedly impede the access of women and girls to education. Please provide an update on progress and challenges relating to the delivery of age-appropriate education programmes on sexual and reproductive health and rights at all levels of education in the State party (para. 137).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Response 99</th>
<th>The Ministry statement is silent about the Better Public Service targets(^{26}), which meant the Ministry officials were required to focus on increasing participation. The BPS targets were to be met by 2017.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Response 107</td>
<td>The new Government has overturned the previous Government’s decision to close Salisbury School which provides quality education and life skills programmes for female students with intellectual impairment. Many students have disabilities, including physical, learning and emotional, and some have experienced physical and sexual abuse.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Response 108</td>
<td>It is very difficult to access the learning support in education.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### EMPLOYMENT

| Issue 14 | It is indicated in the report that, although women are better qualified than in the past, they are overrepresented in minimum-wage jobs and that Māori and Pasifika women and young mothers are vulnerable to low-wage employment (para. 98). Please provide information on the measures being taken to reduce the concentration of women, particularly Māori and Pasifika women, in low-paid employment and improve their participation in fields traditionally dominated by men, especially construction work, fishing, renewable energy and transport. Please also provide information on measures in place to enforce the principle of equal pay for work of equal value, in line with the International Labour Organization Equal Remuneration Convention, 1951 (No. 100), with a view to closing the wage gap between women and men, which contributes to post-retirement poverty among women (para. 113). Please further provide information on measures being taken to address the high unemployment rate among Māori and Pasifika women (para. 100). Please indicate what steps are being taken to address the shortage of childcare facilities and encourage the use of flexible working arrangements (para. 110). Please provide information on the status of the draft law, under which paid parental leave would be extended to 26 weeks, and steps to abolish the Minimum Wage Act of 1983, which empowers inspectors from the Ministry of Business, Innovation and Employment to issue minimum wage exemption permits for workers whose disabilities limit their capacity to carry out the requirements of their work and has reportedly been used to exclude workers, including women, with disabilities from equal remuneration. |
| Response | Increased ECE participation by 2017 was one of the Better Public Service (BPS) targets set in 2011. Considerable effort was made to engage more |

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>136</th>
<th>families to enrol their child in ECE services with vacant places.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Response 137, 138</strong></td>
<td>Targeted Assistance for Participation (TAP) funding was important for increasing the number of places. It was only one initiative of several to increase participation in recent years. There are two other participation programmes which have helped to raise participation of children in Early Childhood Education (ECE):</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| 137, 138 | - The Engaging Priority Families (EPF) Initiative provides Coordinators to help three and four year old children into ECE. They support the hardest to reach families, helping them to find the right early learning option for them, encouraging regular attendance, supporting learning at home and helping them with the transition to school. The Ministry currently contracts 12 providers across the country, working in communities with the most need. These providers will engage and support almost 850 children from priority families at any given time.  
- The Supported Playgroups (SP) initiative provides an ECE option for communities with large numbers of children who don’t participate because parents want to stay with their children or where there are significant barriers to setting up and sustaining an ECE service. A supported playgroup is a certificated playgroup, with regular support from a Kaimanaaki or Playgroup Educator to ensure the provision of quality ECE and encourage involvement by families. The Ministry currently contracts 12 Supported Playgroups in targeted areas. |
| 142 | There needs to be an alternative to the Minimum Wage Exemption Permits (MWEPs) and that in particular, the situation of disabled women is addressed. |
| 143 | The Government responses itemise actions and programmes looking for better alternatives to the Minimum Wage Exemption Permits (MWEP) which were introduced in 2007. Many disabled people lost employment at the time and “shelter workshops” for the disabled closed as they contravened the law. |
| **Additional** | The Domestic Violence - Victims' Protection Bill[^27][^28][^29] is a private members bill that was introduced by a Green MP under the previous Government. |

comment and supported by all political parties through to the Select Committee stage of Parliament. Amongst other changes, the Bill:

- introduces up to 10 days' "domestic violence leave" for victims of domestic violence, to be funded by employers;
- enables the employee to request flexible working arrangements for the purposes of dealing with the effects of domestic violence (e.g. changing work locations or hours of work)
- introduces “being a victim of domestic violence” as a prohibited ground for discrimination under the Human Rights Act 1993; and
- amends the definition of “hazard” in health and safety legislation to cover actions stemming from domestic violence.

**HEALTH**

**Issue 15**

It is indicated in the report that significant gaps remain in health outcomes, with Māori and Pasifika communities, persons with disabilities and socioeconomically disadvantaged groups generally experiencing worse health outcomes than other groups (para. 125). Please provide information on progress and challenges in addressing that phenomenon, attributed in the report to differences with regard to access to and use and experience of health services, as well as differences in exposure to risk (para. 126). Information before the Committee indicates that Māori and Pasifika women continue to suffer high rates of breast and cervical cancer, mental illness, suicide, sexually transmitted infections, teenage pregnancy and drug and alcohol abuse. Please provide information on the impact of the programmes and other initiatives adopted to address those issues. Please also provide information on measures being taken to remove barriers to access to health-care services by disadvantaged groups of women, including women with disabilities, migrant and refugee women and older women. Please also provide information on the extent to which the Protection of Personal and Property Rights Act of 1988 has been used to have women and girls with intellectual disabilities sterilized without their consent, on the grounds that it is in their best interest.

**Issue 16**

Please provide information on the incidence of unsafe abortion and its impact on women’s health, including maternal mortality. Please also provide information on measures being taken to amend the Crimes Act in order to expand the grounds for legal abortion to include rape, and revise the Contraception, Sterilization and Abortion Act of 1977 with a view to easing the onerous procedure for procuring an abortion, under which women are required to obtain certificates from two certified medical consultants, and which reportedly creates long waiting lists for women and girls. Please further provide information on steps being taken to shift oversight of abortion laws, policies and services from the Ministry of Justice to the Ministry of Health. Please also provide an update on the status of
the national sexual and reproductive health action plan being developed by the Ministry of Health, and the extent to which relevant stakeholders have been involved in its elaboration.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Response 150</th>
<th>While the new HPV screening has the potential for women to self-take a sample, which could address cultural sensitivity where women are not comfortable with a vaginal examination by a health practitioner, this approach will not be routine and there is no expectation that all women would have the option to self-sample. Additionally, if there are symptoms, a woman must have a physical examination. There is no expectation that cost will be altered as the procedure itself is the same. It is important that government continue to work to address barriers to accessing sexual and reproductive health care and cervical screening including cost, transportation, health literacy, access to culturally appropriate services and lack of coordination across health care providers.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Response 151 | While it is good news that HPV vaccination rates are high among priority groups, vaccination must be coupled with high screening rates among these groups. The Government and the sector must continue to address barriers to accessing health care for Māori and Pacific women, including cervical screening. High vaccination rates alone are insufficient to reduce inequity in cancer rates. 

“The vaccines alone won’t wipe out cervical cancer, because they don’t cover all types of cancer-causing HPV and many women are already infected.”

The Government has introduced a Bill to enable health professionals and other relevant staff to access information directly from the National Cervical Screening Programme register (NCSP register). If it becomes law, it will be a positive change, which should support improved efficiency and likely better recall for timely cervical screening. |
| Response 152 | Lower breast cancer screening rates for Māori women, alongside lower rates of cervical screening, highlights inequity in access to services for these priority groups. There is ample evidence of inequitable access across primary care. For example, the New Zealand Health Survey found that “one in five Māori (22%) adults had not visited a GP due to cost. Māori adults were more likely than non-Māori adults to not visit a GP due to cost, after adjusting for age and sex differences”. Women were more likely than men to not visit a GP due to cost.


| Response 155-163 | The responses include an acknowledgement that challenges persist for disabled women accessing health and disability services. There is an updated New Zealand Disability Strategy 2016-2026[^34] with a rollout of a prototype in July 2018 for a new system of services specific to disabled people. |
| Response 160 | We are not aware of any evidence of unsafe abortion in New Zealand. Research shows that abortion is safest the sooner it is done[^35]. Under current abortion law, due to inequitable service provision and the need for two certifying consultants to authorize an abortion, women experience unnecessary delays in accessing an abortion. These delays can result in abortions being performed at a later gestational age, which is contrary to best practice standards and can also cause considerable stress to women. |
| Response 161 | The Government’s intention to review abortion law with the aim of treating abortion as a health issue in legislation, not a crime, is supported. Abortion should be removed from the Crimes Act 1961. As a health issue, abortion should be overseen, regulated and funded through the Ministry of Health. Abortion should be provided with a woman’s informed consent. There should not be a certification process. Abortion should be a health care issue between a woman and a qualified health practitioner. Law should not require abortions to be provided in hospitals or specially licensed facilities. Most abortions can be provided through community health care clinics, and medical abortion pills can be safely taken at home once women have been provided the information and support they need. No other statutory requirements that restrict and delay access to abortion services (eg. waiting periods or parental notification) should be introduced through new legislation. |
| Response 162 | The draft Sexual and Reproductive Health Action Plan (SRHAP) is now two years old and is still not finalised. Most of the sector has not been consulted about the Plan for a significant period of time, and little information has been provided about the process or steps necessary to complete the plan. The Ministry of Health should go back to the sector to consult on the current draft to promote partnership and accountability. The Plan should reflect any changes to policy and service delivery during the past two years. |
| Response 163 | We are not aware of a MOH national sexual and reproductive health work programme, its goals, focus or activities. It would be useful for the Ministry of Health to inform stakeholders such as Family Planning Association of New Zealand about the work programme. |


### Issue 17

Information before the Committee indicates that, in 2010, the State party withdrew funding from adult community education classes, which reduced learning opportunities for rural women. Please list the programmes in place aimed at facilitating the availability to rural women of training and education, including adult education; health care, including sanitation and transport for access to services such as free cancer screening; and employment and agricultural opportunities. Furthermore, please provide information on progress made towards the implementation of programmes designed to improve rural women's access to information, modern technology and social protection.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Response 164</th>
<th>There is a lack of reliable, affordable fast internet and mobile phone access (only 50% of New Zealand’s geography is accessible)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Response 166</td>
<td>Controls were not in place to ensure the $50 boost remained with the students and according to the media some at least of these has merely passed to landlords via rent rises of $50 a week. This disproportionately affects rural women and girls because there are limited options to do tertiary study and remain in their homes as tertiary students compared to if they lived in the city.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Response 167</td>
<td>In addition to internet access issues, there are skills shortages, with parts of the population struggling to cope with the increased use of technology, for example in health and education. There are good examples of adult education being available online but this is no help to rural women who do not have good computer skills because they haven't previously had internet access. It should be noted that internet access is intermittent at best in rural New Zealand.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Response 168</td>
<td>We are not aware of any funding for literacy and numeracy programmes made available to rural women and girls. No information is provided on the programmes or where they were provided</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Response 169</td>
<td>Rural Education Achievement Programmes (REAP) are not available to all rural women and girls. There has been no reporting or monitoring on the delivery of the programmes.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Response 170</td>
<td>Thanks to lobbying by Rural Women NZ, these programmes are available to more rural women. Challenges lie with dental health, maternity services, and mental health which are all under resourced.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Response 172</td>
<td>Making a video available via a website is not suitable for those without access to technology or a reliable internet connection to view it.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Response</td>
<td>There are some good projects offered through the Sustainable Farming</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Fund but none are specifically for rural women and girls.

Response

There is no Targeted Women's Group Project at the link.

Presumably this is the Regional Development Fund. We’ve not heard anything specifically aimed at rural women nor in answer to any of the challenges facing rural women and girls.

While it is pleasing that rural proofing is on the agenda, health and education decisions are being made without any regard to impact on rural communities.

**DISADVANTAGED GROUPS OF WOMEN**

**Issue 18**

Please provide information regarding access to social housing for women, particularly those with disabilities, single mothers and migrant and older women, and on what is being done to protect such women from rising housing costs, overcrowding and long waiting lists for social housing. Please also provide examples of existing social protection programmes aimed at reducing the economic burden on women with disabilities, older women, households headed by women, and single and young mothers. Please provide information on the extent to which the fixed annual quota for refugees under the Refugee Quota Programme has been used and whether the State party is considering increasing it.

Response

Over the year to 31 March 2018, the Salvation Army (SA) provided 378 families with accommodation - 41,993 bed night units. The families are various sizes and shapes from single people to two parents with five children settings. The bed night numbers include the number of beds for each person (parents and children).

Client demographics:

- Female 62%  Male 37.5%
- Age group predominantly is 20-59 years - 88.5%
- 47.3% are parents with children
- 20.3% are single men
- 13.8% are single women
- 68.9% are on a benefit
- 53.9% of clients are renting

The remaining client group are in mixes of emergency housing, boarding, living with relatives or friends etc.

Once people are in Salvation Army’s transitional/emergency housing programmes, they have a long wait for find accommodation from Housing New Zealand. Many more of the client group would benefit from social housing but are not placed high enough on the grading scale to qualify. Clients pay up to 25% of their income in rent while in SA housing. The 12
week timeframe is used to assist families to look at issues that are affecting their ability to stay in accommodation and access suitable housing for their family.

Although some of the SA housing stock is suitable for those with disabilities, there is minimal uptake of this due to the specialist services available.

The SA does not specifically provide services for Refugee groups as there are specialist agencies for this client group. The SA has provided accommodation for recent immigrants to NZ especially those on the quota system from Pacific islands, who are not eligible for social housing - often they do not have an income so finding permanent accommodation is very difficult.

Clients in SA housing units have access to a wide range of programme delivery all designed to enhance their well-being. Strong advocacy is provided for clients with Work and Income, Housing NZ, Oranga Tamariki, Health services, community groups, education groups, etc. to ensure clients have all entitlements financially, socially and educationally, aiming to improve their opportunities with housing, financially, and socially.

The aim is to provide accommodation that is adequate, affordable and safe for all those who are in SA housing. Many of the clients live in overcrowded and/or unsuitable housing e.g. up to 6 people living in a bedroom or two or three families in the house, people living in garages or unsuitable situations such as boarding houses while they have children in their care. An example is where two young teenage boys, because of overcrowding and no space left in the house, had to sleep under the house on the ground - there was a carpet provided and sleeping bags.

Overcrowding has many steps leading to it occurring - cost of rentals is too high, families cannot maintain housing on their own, evictions, cultural issues, lack of housing, lack of finances to maintain housing, etc.

Response
182-187
People with disabilities struggle to access information. Most people, especially women who are less inclined to ask for assistance, have to take a support person with them to get any response to requests for extra assistance. In a climate where it is difficult for people with disabilities to find employment that provides for quality of life, including adequate warm, safe housing at a reasonable cost. Qualifying for the SuperGold Card at age 65 gives a feeling of security, being able to access travel and other discounts.

WOMEN IN DETENTION

Issue 20
According to information before the Committee, Māori and Pasifika women and girls experience disproportionately high rates of incarceration and are overrepresented at all levels of the criminal justice system. Please provide information on the extent to which
initiatives to address that situation, such as the “Turning of the Tide: A Whānau Ora Crime and Crash Prevention Strategy”, take gender into account. Specifically, please clarify what is being done to address the root causes of repeat offending among Māori and Pasifika women and girls; involve traditional leaders and structures in efforts to address the high levels of Māori and Pasifika incarceration; and fully use non-custodial measures, in line with the United Nations Rules for the Treatment of Women Prisoners and Non-custodial Measures for Women Offenders (Bangkok Rules).

Response 197
A gender impact should be mandated in any assessment of government service. It is believed that the Turning the Tide strategy\(^{36}\) has failed. Just Speak\(^{37}\) is receiving favourable support.

Response 203
Four of 10 women on the Māori Focus Forum of iwi Leaders.

Response 204
There is no indication of the gender make-up of the Corrections Māori advisory board.

MARRIAGE AND FAMILY RELATIONS

Issue 21
It is indicated in the report that the State party prohibits marriage under the age of 16 years and that a person aged 16 or 17 years require consent from their parents or from the Family Court before the Registrar can issue a marriage licence (p. 51). It is further stated that prohibiting people from marrying under the age of 18 years may constitute age discrimination under the Human Rights Act of 1993, which prohibits discrimination on grounds of age from 16 years onwards (p. 51). Please provide information on the mechanisms in place to prevent forced marriage and to amend the law in order to eliminate child marriage in the State party. Please also provide data on the extent of polygamy in the State party and measures to combat the practice (CEDAW/C/NZL/CO/7, para. 38).

Response 210
The New Zealand Parliament is currently considering the Marriage (Court Consent to Marriage of Minors) Amendment Bill k\(^{38}\). The Select Committee has reviewed the Bill and recommended to Parliament that it be progressed with a few key changes. The Select Committee have agreed to the Bill’s proposal to amend the law so that any marriage of a 16 or 17 year old would require the consent of a Family Court Judge rather than the

---


The matters that a Family Court Judge will consider before giving consent include:

- the person’s age and maturity
- the person’s views
- any views held by the person’s parents or guardians that can reasonably be ascertained
- any other information available to the court relevant to the application.