

**Election 2004: Campaign Contributions to Candidates for Chief Justice and Justice of the Ohio Supreme Court from November 2, 2003- October 13, 2004**

By Catherine Turcer and Brandi Whetstone  
Ohio Citizen Action Education Fund

**October 28, 2004**

**Executive Summary**

---

**Well-funded special interests contributed heavily to their favorite candidates for Ohio Supreme Court.** Hospitals and physicians gave over 99 percent (\$569,259/ \$573,119) of the contributions to the contested Republican candidates. Personal injury attorneys gave over 83 percent (\$738,470/\$884,831) of the contributions to the Democratic candidates and the uncontested Republican.

**The insurance industry has become increasingly active in Supreme Court elections. During the entire 2002 election cycle, the insurance industry contributed \$425,675. Insurance PACs and employees have already contributed \$711,974 to Supreme Court candidates.** Nearly all of these contributions (99.5 percent) were given to the contested Republican candidates.

**The top organizational contributors provide a picture of Election 2004.** The top organizational contributor is an insurance company and the second a personal injury law firm. Corporate law firms Vorys, Sater, Seymour & Pease; Jones, Day, Reavis & Pogue and Porter Wright, Morris & Arthur are also top contributors. George Burke of Burke & McGrath contributed \$50,500 to Nancy Fuerst. He faced no contribution limits because he is her brother-in-law.

**Top Organizational Contributors:**

---

1. Cincinnati Insurance Companies	\$82,633
2. Nurenberg, Plevin, Heller & McCarthy	\$68,130
3. Nationwide Insurance	\$61,761
4. FirstEnergy	\$61,100
5. American Financial Group	\$60,300
6. Vorys, Sater, Seymour & Pease	\$60,020
7. Burke & McGrath, LLC	\$50,500
8. Jones, Day, Reavis & Pogue	\$43,850
9. Porter, Wright, Morris & Arthur	\$39,750
10. Waite, Schneider, Bayless & Chesley	\$38,200

*Includes contributions from PACs, employees and organizations.*

**While decrying the current campaign finance system, together, all the candidates for Ohio Supreme Court generated nearly \$5.8 million from November 2, 2003 to October 13, 2004.** Contributions to both candidates for Chief Justice of the Ohio Supreme Court equal \$1,624,580. Contributions to candidates for Justice total \$4,167,365.

<b>Supreme Court Candidates and money in politics, special interests and restoring confidence in the system</b>		
<b>Candidate</b>	<b>Quote</b>	<b>Top Contributors</b>
<b>Connally \$190,352</b>	“Ohio has become the poster child of the nation.”	1. Nurenberg, Plevin, Heller, & McCarthy, \$23,500 2. Law Offices of Matthew W. Chapel, \$8,000 3. Williams, Jilek, Lefferty, Gallagher & Scott, \$5,500 United Auto Workers, \$5,500
<b>Moyer \$1,434,228</b>	“We have to get money out of the selection of judges in Ohio.”	1. Cincinnati Insurance Companies, \$27,895 2. Vorys, Sater, Seymour & Pease, \$23,070 3. Jones, Day, Reavis & Pogue, \$21,525
<b>Fuerst \$843,862</b>	“I see confidence in the Court as the number one problem with this particular system.”	1. Burke & McGrath, \$50,500 2. Nurenberg, Plevin, Heller, & McCarthy, \$35,000 3. Weisman, Kennedy & Berris, \$26,800
<b>Lanzinger \$1,488,090</b>	“We cannot promise that we are going to vote in a particular way. We can promise impartiality, open mindedness, fairness and following the law.”	1. Cincinnati Insurance Companies, \$27,351 2. American Financial Group, \$24,300 3. FirstEnergy, \$20,550
<b>O’Neill \$61,495</b>	“Money has a corrosive effect on the judiciary. It has to be eliminated.”	1. Sheet Metal Workers Union, \$2,200 2. Intl Brotherhood of Electrical Workers, \$2,110 3. AFSCME, \$2,000 Laborers Int’l Union of North America, \$2,000 Plumbers & Pipefitters Local Union 392, \$2,000
<b>O’Donnell \$1,465,174</b>	“By discharging our duties, by following the rule of law, we lend predictability to the outcome of cases and when we do that we lend great stability to the jurisprudence in the state.”	1. Cincinnati Insurance Companies, \$27,388 2. Nationwide Insurance, \$20,387 3. American Financial Group, \$20,000 FirstEnergy, \$20,000
Candidates remarked on special interests and confidence in the Court at the Judicial Forum sponsored by the League of Women Voters, ONN and Capital University Law School on October 21, 2004.		

## Findings

---

### Contributions to 2004 Candidates for Chief Justice and Justice of Ohio Supreme Court

<b>2004 Candidates for Chief Justice of the Ohio Supreme Court</b> <i>Contributions Raised November 2, 2003- October 13, 2004</i>			
<b>Candidate</b>	<b>Party</b>	<b>Seat</b>	<b>Total</b>
C. Ellen Connally	Democrat	Challenger	\$190,352
Thomas J. Moyer	Republican	Incumbent	\$1,434,228
<b>Total</b>			<b>\$1,624,580</b>
<i>Includes both monetary and in-kind contributions</i>			
<b>2004 Candidates for Justice of the Ohio Supreme Court</b> <i>Contributions Raised November 2, 2003- October 13, 2004</i>			
<b>Candidate</b>	<b>Party</b>	<b>Seat</b>	<b>Total</b>
Nancy A. Fuerst	Democrat	Open/ Primary winner	\$843,862
W. Scott Gwin	Democrat	Open/ Primary loser	\$234,244
Judith Lanzinger	Republican	Open	\$1,488,090
Paul E. Pfeifer	Republican	Incumbent	\$74,500
William O'Neill	Democrat	Challenger	\$61,495
Terrence O'Donnell	Republican	Appointed Incumbent	\$1,465,174
<b>Total</b>			<b>\$4,167,365</b>
<b>Total All Candidates</b>			<b>\$5,791,945</b>
<i>Includes both monetary and in-kind contributions</i>			

Contributions to both candidates for Chief Justice of the Ohio Supreme Court from November 2, 2003 to October 13, 2004 equal \$1,624,580. Contributions to candidates for Justice total \$4,167,365. **Together, all the candidates generated nearly \$5.8 million.**

**The three Republican candidates who are facing challengers have already generated over \$1.4 million: Chief Justice Thomas J. Moyer, \$1,434,228; Judge Judith Lanzinger, \$1,488,090; and Justice Terrence O'Donnell, \$1,465,174.** None of the Democratic candidates has hit the million-dollar mark. Open seat opponents Judge Nancy Fuerst and Judge Lanzinger raised the most comparable amounts. Fuerst raised \$843,862 and received an additional \$200,000 loan from her husband, bringing her total to \$1,043,862. However, Fuerst faced a contested primary. Fuerst reported having only \$17,410 on hand on October 13, 2004. Her opponent Lanzinger reported an available balance of \$79,688. Judge William O'Neill, O'Donnell's Democratic challenger and a fierce critic of the current campaign finance system, has raised only \$61,495. This is only 4 percent of the amount raised by Justice Terrence O'Donnell. Justice Paul Pfeifer, the uncontested Republican, raised more than O'Neill (\$74,500).

## **Contributions and Economic & Ideological Interests**

---

### **Comparison of contributions from the top three Economic sectors for each candidate November 2, 2003- October 13, 2004**

<b>Candidate</b>	<b>Top Sector</b>	<b>Second Sector</b>	<b>Third Sector</b>
C. Ellen Connally/ Democratic Challenger	Lawyers \$92,373	Ideological \$60,346	Labor Unions \$7,500
Thomas J. Moyer/ Republican Incumbent	Lawyers \$456,716	Insurance \$211,114	Health Care \$185,159
Nancy A. Fuerst/ Winning Democrat, Open Seat	Lawyers \$685,801	Labor Unions \$51,275	Business Services \$10,700
W. Scott Gwin/ Losing Democrat, Open Seat	Lawyers \$187,194	Labor Unions \$12,000	Ideological \$3,650
Judith Lanzinger/ Republican, Open Seat	Insurance \$257,815	Lawyers \$254,289	Ideological \$240,089
Paul Pfeifer/ Republican, Incumbent	Lawyers \$64,000	Labor Unions \$10,500	N/A
William O'Neill/ Democratic Challenger	Lawyers \$26,939	Labor Unions \$22,440	Ideological \$7,686
Terrence O'Donnell/ Republican Appointed Incumbent	Lawyers \$305,773	Insurance \$239,180	Health Care \$210,958

**These contributions include organizations, PACs and employee contributions.**

\*Ideological includes political parties, candidate committees and single-issue groups.

N/A means “not applicable.”

Contributions from lawyers, the insurance industry and the health care field accounted for nearly 54 percent of the contested Republicans’ total contributions. Chief Justice Thomas Moyer received 59 percent; Lanzinger 50 percent; and O’Donnell, 52 percent.

The insurance industry has become increasingly active in Supreme Court elections. During the entire 2002 election cycle, the insurance industry contributed \$425,675. Insurance PACs and employees have already contributed \$711,974 to Supreme Court candidates. This is a 60 percent increase. However, there are four seats up for election this year and in 2002, there were only two. The insurance industry strongly supports the three contested Republican candidates.

Lawyers and law firms, the top economic sector for all but one of the candidates, contributed \$2,073,085 to candidates for Ohio Supreme Court. Over forty percent (43%) of the contributions from attorneys were from personal injury attorneys (\$884,831).

**Together, Democratic candidates (\$680,970) and uncontested Pfeifer (\$57,500) received five times more from personal injury attorneys than the contested Republican candidates (\$146,361).** However, both Moyer and O’Donnell received more from personal injury attorneys than their Democratic challengers.

**Over 99 percent of the contributions from hospitals and physicians (\$569,259) were contributed to the contested Republican candidates.**

<b>Comparison of contributions from physicians, insurance companies and personal injury attorneys November 2, 2003- October 13, 2004</b>			
<b>Candidate</b>	<b>Physicians &amp; Hospitals Total*</b>	<b>Insurance Total</b>	<b>Personal Injury Attorneys Total</b>
C. Ellen Connally-D	\$300	\$0	\$67,110
Thomas J. Moyer-R	\$171,509	\$211,114	\$95,686
Nancy A. Fuerst-D	\$2,050	\$1,265	\$454,561
W. Scott Gwin-D	\$1,500	\$2,600	\$140,669
Judith Lanzinger-R	\$208,067	\$257,815	\$29,875
Paul Pfeifer-R	\$0	\$0	\$57,500
William O’Neill-D	\$10	\$0	\$18,630
Terrence O’Donnell-R	\$189,683	\$239,180	\$20,800
<b>Total</b>	<b>\$573,119</b>	<b>\$711,974</b>	<b>\$884,831</b>
<i>Includes contributions from PACs, employees and organizations. *Totals do not include nursing homes</i>			

**Employees and PACs associated with insurance companies contributed \$711,974 to candidates for the Ohio Supreme Court.** Nearly all of these contributions (99.5%) were given to the contested Republican candidates. All the Democratic candidates together received only \$3,865 from insurance industry employees and PACs.

**Three Republican candidates received 16 percent or more of their contributions from the insurance PACs and employees.** Lanzinger received 17% of her contributions from the insurance industry; Moyer 15%; and O'Donnell, 13%; Gwin received 1% and Fuerst, 0.15%. O'Neill, Pfeifer and Connally did not receive any contributions from the insurance industry.

<b>Top Contributions from Insurance 11/2/03-10/13/04</b>			
	<b>Firm</b>	<b>City</b>	<b>Total</b>
1.	Cincinnati Insurance Companies	Cincinnati, OH	\$82,633
2.	Nationwide Insurance	Columbus, OH	\$61,761
3.	American Financial Group	Cincinnati, OH	\$60,300
4.	Ohio National Financial Services	Cincinnati, OH	\$37,350
5.	State Farm Insurance	Bloomington, IL	\$28,652
<i>Includes contributions from PACs and from employees.</i>			

**The Democratic candidates and the uncontested candidate each received at least 30 percent of their contributions from personal injury attorneys from November 2, 2003 to October 13, 2004.** Republican incumbent Paul Pfeifer received 77%, Democratic Primary Loser W. Scott Gwin received 60%, and Nancy Fuerst received 54%. Chief Justice candidate C. Ellen Connally received 35%, and William O'Neill received 30%. Chief Justice Thomas Moyer received 7%, and both Judith Lanzinger and Justice Terrence O'Donnell received 2% or less of their contributions from personal injury attorneys. The Ohio Academy of Trial Lawyers contributed \$22,000 to all of the Democratic candidates and Pfeifer.

<b>Top Contributions from Personal Injury Firms 11/2/03- 10/13/04</b>			
	<b>Firm</b>	<b>City</b>	<b>Total</b>
1.	Nurenborg, Plevin, Heller & McCarthy Co., LPA	Cleveland	\$68,130
2.	Waite, Schneider, Bayless & Chesley	Cincinnati	\$38,200
3.	Weisman, Kennedy & Berris Co., LPA	Cleveland	\$37,400
4.	Spangenberg, Shibley & Liber	Cleveland	\$37,110
5.	Williams, Jilek, Lafferty, Gallagher & Scott	Toledo	\$36,000
<i>Includes contributions directly from the law firms or their PAC and from employees.</i>			

## Individual Contributor Patterns

---

**There were 11,884 contributions from individual donors totaling \$3,322,341.**

The top individual contributor George Burke, Jr. gave Nancy Fuerst \$50,500. Burke is Fuerst's brother-in-law. Fuerst also received a loan of \$200,000 from her husband, John Burke. Family members are not subject to contribution limits. Other than George Burke, contributors who gave \$7,000 or more all gave to each of the contested Republican candidates. Fifty-seven percent (57%) of these contributors also have at least one other family member who gave \$7,000 or more. Prominent family donors include the Boichs, the Brennans, Lindners, and the McConnells.

**The average individual contribution size for Ohio Supreme Court candidates is \$279.59.** Paul Pfeifer only received one contribution of \$1,000 from an individual donor. Nancy Fuerst received a contribution of \$50,000 from her brother-in-law.

**A weighted average removing these extremes is \$275.34.** Nancy Fuerst's average contribution size if the contribution of \$50,000 is removed is \$470.07.

### Average Individual Contributions 11/2/03- 10/13/04

Candidate	Average Contribution
C. Ellen Connally-D	\$205.60
Thomas J. Moyer-R	\$266.97
Nancy A. Fuerst-D	\$525.91
W. Scott Gwin-D	\$777.40
Judith Lanzinger-R	\$253.49
Paul E. Pfeifer-R	\$1,000
William O'Neill-D	\$13.12
Terrence O'Donnell-R	\$263.56
<b>All Candidates</b>	<b>\$279.59</b>

**Cincinnati Insurance Companies Employee Contribution Pattern**

<b>Candidate</b>	<b>Dates of Multiple Contributions</b>	<b>Amount</b>	<b>Number of Contributions</b>
Lanzinger	12/15/03	\$250	1
Lanzinger	7/23/04	\$10,599	37
Lanzinger	7/28/04	\$9,431	70
Lanzinger	7/30/04	\$1,380	14
Lanzinger	8/6/04	\$2,500	23
Lanzinger	8/20/04	\$1,495	25
Lanzinger	8/27/04	\$925	6
Lanzinger	8/30/04	\$120	1
Moyer	12/15/03	\$250	1
Moyer	7/27/04	\$7,696	57
Moyer	7/30/04	\$2,691	22
Moyer	7/31/04	\$1,467	5
Moyer	8/10/04	\$2,600	24
Moyer	8/19/04	\$1,396	11
Moyer	8/26/04	\$1,075	7
O'Donnell	12/15/03	\$250	1
O'Donnell	7/23/04	\$10,598	37
O'Donnell	7/30/04	\$9,789	70
O'Donnell	7/31/04	\$1,335	13
O'Donnell	8/6/04	\$2,700	23
O'Donnell	8/20/04	\$1,995	13
O'Donnell	8/30/04	\$545	6
<b>Totals</b>		<b>\$71,087</b>	<b>467</b>

*The contributions noted as multiples are those, in which at least one contribution was give to multiple candidates on the same day.*

**One hundred seventy-two (172) employees of Cincinnati Insurance Companies gave 499 contributions to the contested Republican candidates, totaling \$82,633. Ninety-two percent gave to each of these three candidates.** None of the employees of Cincinnati Insurance Companies contributed to Democratic candidates.



## Political Party Giving

---

Ohio Republican Party committees contributed 6.6 times more than the Democratic committees. Ohio Republican Party committees contributed \$432,947 to candidates running for the Ohio Supreme Court from November 2, 2003 to October 13, 2004. Ohio Democratic Party committees contributed \$65,496.

This can be compared with the 2002 election cycle, in which the political party committees gave comparable amounts. Democratic Party committees contributed \$378,026, and Republican committees gave \$395,153.

Leadership PACs contributed \$19,000, with the majority also going to the Republican candidates. America's Majority Trust, sponsored by U.S. Rep. Rob Portman (R-Cincinnati), contributed \$15,000. Lanzinger, Moyer and O'Donnell each received \$5,000. Ohio's 17 Star PAC, sponsored by U.S. Senator Mike DeWine (R-Yellow Springs), contributed \$2,500 to Lanzinger. The American Liberty PAC, sponsored by U.S. Rep. Bob Ney (R-St. Clairsville), gave \$500 to Justice O'Donnell. Democracy for America, sponsored by former Governor Howard Dean (D-Vermont), gave \$1,000 to O'Neill.

Candidate committees contributed \$51,562 to Ohio Supreme Court candidates. Republican committees contributed \$42,211 and Democratic committees contributed \$9,351.

### Contributions from political party & candidate committees and leadership political action committees

**11/2/2003-10/13/2004**

<b>Candidate</b>	<b>Total Contributions</b>
Connally-D	\$60,146
Moyer-R	\$90,200
Fuerst-D	\$4,375
Gwin-D	\$3,650
Lanzinger-R	\$239,177
Pfeifer-R	\$0
O'Neill-D	\$7,676
O'Donnell-R	\$163,781
<b>Democrats</b>	<b>\$75,847</b>
<b>Republicans</b>	<b>\$493,158</b>
<b>Total</b>	<b>\$569,005</b>

<b>Contributions from County Parties 11/2/03- 10/13/04</b>	
<b>Committees</b>	<b>Total Contributions</b>
Summit County Democratic Executive Committee	\$2,000
Wood County Democratic Party	\$581
Williams County Democratic Committee	\$375
Mercer County Democratic Party	\$250
Lake County Democratic Party Judicial Account	\$220
Fairfield County Democratic Executive Committee	\$100
Hardin County Democratic Executive Committee	\$100
<b>Democratic Party Total</b>	<b>\$3,626</b>
Hamilton County Republican Party	\$40,000
Columbiana County Republican Judicial Account	\$35,445
Cuyahoga County Republican Party Judicial Fund	\$22,500
Hancock County Republican Executive Committee	\$2,000
Stark County Republican Party Judicial Account	\$955
Mahoning County Republican Party Judicial Account	\$1,000
Lucas County Republican Judicial Account	\$250
<b>Republican Party Total</b>	<b>\$102,150</b>
<b>Total County Party Contributions</b>	<b>\$105,776</b>

**So far this election cycle, county party committees contributed \$105,776 to candidates for Ohio Supreme Court.** Republican county party committees contributed \$102,150, nearly 97% of this total.

**The county party money generated in 2004 exceeds the \$85,241 contributed by county party committees during the 2002 Ohio Supreme Court race.** In 2002 the Republican county party committees gave more than double the amount of the Democratic committees with \$59,950. However, during 2002 the Democratic county party committees were more active than they have been so far this year.

## Television Advertising

---

According to *Buying Time 2004: Television Advertising in State Supreme Court Elections* (Brennan Center for Justice, 2004), which examines Supreme Court advertisements from January 1 to October 17, 2004, Ohio candidates spent \$519,374 on television broadcast ads in Ohio's major media markets. Third party or "issue groups" spent an additional \$797,223 on television related to Ohio Supreme Court elections during this period. This study also examines television advertisements in fourteen (14) other states with high court elections. The Brennan Center estimates that more than \$8 million has been spent on television ads in the states with Supreme Court elections so far this year. Ohio is one of the top three states in spending on Supreme Court television ads: 1) Illinois (\$2.25 million), 2) Alabama (\$1.77 million), and 3) Ohio (\$1.31 million).

## Citizens for a Strong Ohio

---

**Citizens for a Strong Ohio, an affiliate of the Ohio Chamber of Commerce, has been active in the past two Supreme Court elections and has already raised nearly \$2.2 million.**

Contributions to the Supreme Court candidates continue to break records. However, these contributions do not include all the political dollars related to Supreme Court elections in Ohio. Third parties, sometimes called "issue groups," have influenced the past two election cycles. "Issue ads" are distinct from candidate ads. While a candidate's committee sponsors candidate ads, "issue ads" are sponsored by organizations not affiliated with the candidate(s). Some "issue ads" implicitly advocate or oppose the election of a candidate. These ads do not include the words "vote for" or "vote against." But, of course, organizations can make effective campaign commercials that avoid these "magic words."

Citizens for a Strong Ohio has been designated as a 501(c)(4) organization under the Internal Revenue Code. Because it does not engage in advocacy for the election or defeat of political candidates, corporations are permitted to make contributions to further the work of the organization.

Citizens for a Strong Ohio ([www.ohiochamber/citizens/default.asp](http://www.ohiochamber/citizens/default.asp) )

The Ohio Elections Commission has ruled that ads that endorse candidates are subject to regulation. Citizens for a Strong Ohio and the Ohio Chamber of Commerce continue to litigate and assert the "magic words" argument and that they are not subject to regulation.

Citizens for a Strong Ohio voluntarily discloses contributions that it receives. These contributions are from organizations and from corporations, not contributions from individual donors.

Citizens for a Strong Ohio "issue ads" tout Judith Lanzinger and Terrence O'Donnell without using the "magic words." These ads are running on both radio and television.

**Over twenty-eight percent (28%) of the contributions to Citizens for a Strong Ohio came from the Chamber of Commerce affiliates.** Citizens for a Strong Ohio received \$500,000 from the U.S. Chamber Institute for Legal Reform, an affiliate of the U.S. Chamber of Commerce. Citizens for a Strong Ohio also received \$105,000 from its affiliate, the Ohio Chamber of Commerce. The Ohio Chamber of Commerce is a member of the U.S. Chamber of Commerce. In other words, associates of Citizens for a Strong Ohio contributed \$605,000 to the organization.

<b>Comparison of contributions to Citizens for a Strong Ohio (9/10/04-10/21/04) and contributions directly to candidates for Chief Justice and Justice of the Ohio Supreme Court (11/2/03-10/13/04)</b>		
<b>Organization</b>	<b>Contributions to Citizens for a Strong Ohio directly from the organization</b>	<b>PAC &amp; employee contributions to Supreme Court Candidates</b>
U.S. Chamber Institute for Legal Reform	\$500,000	\$0
American Insurance Association	\$250,000	\$4,500
Procter & Gamble	\$160,000	\$29,260
Westfield Group	\$110,000	\$11,835
Ohio Chamber of Commerce	\$105,000	\$13,700
Grange Insurance	\$100,000	\$16,500
Nationwide Insurance	\$100,000	\$61,761
Ohio Casualty Group	\$100,000	\$26,250
State Farm Insurance	\$100,000	\$28,652
Ace American Insurance Co.	\$50,000	\$1,500
Allstate Insurance Co.	\$50,000	\$0
Continental Casualty Co.	\$50,000	\$0
Liberty Mutual Group	\$50,000	\$16,500
Motorists Insurance Group	\$50,000	\$26,905
St. Paul Travelers	\$50,000	\$10,500
State Auto Insurance Co.	\$50,000	\$10,250
United Services Automobile Association	\$50,000	\$9,000
Zurich American Insurance Corporation	\$50,000	\$0
Owens- Illinois Inc.	\$30,000	\$9,450
Timken Co.	\$30,000	\$18,450
Scotts Company	\$25,000	\$4,000
Anthem Blue Cross/ Blue Shield	\$20,000	\$10,000
Safeco	\$15,000	\$0
Ohio Oil & Gas Association	\$10,000	\$3,000
Ohio Society of CPAs	\$10,000	\$16,500
Sprint	\$10,000	\$1,500
Verizon	\$10,000	\$0
Auto-Owners Insurance	\$7,500	\$0
NFIB-Ohio	\$7,500	\$7,975

<b>Organization</b>	<b>Contributions to Citizens for a Strong Ohio directly from The organization</b>	<b>PAC &amp; employee contributions to Supreme Court Candidates</b>
Cooper Tire & Rubber Co.	\$5,000	\$19,100
Ohio Contractors Association	\$1,000	\$4,750
Brotherhood Mutual	\$500	\$0
<b>Total</b>	<b>\$2,156,500</b>	<b>\$555,796</b>

**Comparing contributions from organizations and corporations to Citizens for a Strong Ohio (\$2,156,500) with employee and PAC contributions directly to Supreme Court candidates (\$555,796) is a little like comparing apples to oranges, but it allows us to examine the total impact of political dollars from corporations and organizations and their employees.**

**Corporations gave Citizens for a Strong Ohio \$1,223,000. Only three candidates (Moyer, \$1,434,228; Lanzinger, \$1,488,090; and O'Donnell, \$1,465,174) raised more than the amount given by corporations.**

**Employees and Political Action Committees associated with insurance companies contributed \$711,974 to candidates for the Ohio Supreme Court.** Nearly all of these contributions (99.5%) were given to the contested Republican candidates. All the Democratic candidates together received only \$3,865 from insurance industry employees and PACs. Justice Pfeifer did not receive a single contribution. **Insurance companies gave \$953,000 directly from corporate revenues to Citizens for a Strong Ohio. The American Insurance Association gave an additional \$250,000, totaling \$1,203,000. Nearly fifty-three percent (56%) of all money given to Citizens for a Strong Ohio came from insurance interests.**

**Top 25 Organizational Contributors to Candidates  
for Ohio Supreme Court  
November 2, 2003-October 13, 2004**

	<b>Organizational Contributors</b>	<b>Economic Sector</b>	<b>Amount</b>
1.	Cincinnati Insurance Companies	Insurance	\$82,633
2.	Nurenberg, Plevin, Heller & McCarthy Co., LPA	Law Firm	\$68,130
3.	Nationwide Insurance	Insurance	\$61,761
4.	FirstEnergy	Utility/ Energy	\$61,100
5.	American Financial Group	Insurance	\$60,300
6.	Vorys, Sater, Seymour & Pease	Law Firm	\$60,020
7.	Burke & McGrath, LLC	Law Firm	\$50,500
8.	Jones, Day, Reavis & Pogue	Law Firm	\$43,850
9.	Porter, Wright, Morris & Arthur	Law Firm	\$39,750
10.	Waite, Schneider, Bayless & Chesley	Law Firm	\$38,200
11.	Weisman, Kennedy & Berris Co., LPA	Law Firm	\$37,400
12.	Ohio National Financial Services	Insurance	\$37,350
13.	Spangenberg, Shibley & Liber	Law Firm	\$37,110
14.	Williams, Jilek, Lafferty, Gallagher & Scott Co.	Law Firm	\$36,000
15.	Allen Schulman & Associates	Law Firm	\$34,530
16.	Squire, Sanders & Dempsey	Law Firm	\$33,850
17.	Okey Law Firm	Law Firm	\$32,500
18.	Clark, Perdue, Roberts & Scott Co., LPA	Law Firm	\$32,000
19.	RPM International	Manufacturing	\$31,000
20.	Murray & Murray Co., LPA	Law Firm	\$30,619
21.	Fifth Third Bank	Financial	\$30,550
22.	Boich Companies	Coal/ Energy	\$30,000
23.	Baker & Hostetler	Law Firm	\$29,350
24.	Procter & Gamble	Manufacturing	\$29,260
25.	State Farm Insurance	Insurance	\$28,652

**Organizational contributions include PACs and employees**

**Top Individual Contributors to Candidates for the Ohio Supreme Court  
November 2, 2003- October 13, 2004**

	<b>Name</b>	<b>City</b>	<b>Organizational Affiliation</b>	<b>Amount</b>
1.	George Burke, Jr.	Quincy, MA	Burke & McGrath	\$50,500
2.	Richard Lindner, Sr.	Cincinnati, OH	Rel Group Inc.	\$8,000
3.	Anthony Alexander	Akron, OH	FirstEnergy	\$7,500
	Becky Alexander	Akron, OH	FirstEnergy	\$7,500
	Emeline Boich	Columbus, OH	Boich Companies	\$7,500
	Wayne Boich, Sr.	Columbus, OH	Boich Companies	\$7,500
	Wayne Boich, Jr.	Columbus, OH	Boich Companies	\$7,500
	Douglas Borrer	Columbus, OH	Borrer Homes	\$7,500
	David Brennan	Akron, OH	Brennan Industrial Group	\$7,500
	Ann Amer Brennan	Akron, OH	Brennan Industrial Group	\$7,500
	Dan Carmichael	Mason, OH	Ohio Casualty Insurance Company	\$7,500
	Robert Duvin	Cleveland, OH	Duvin, Cahn & Hutton	\$7,500
	Joyce Farmer	Cincinnati, OH	Cintas	\$7,500
	Richard Farmer	Cincinnati, OH	Cintas	\$7,500
	Charles Jarrett	Pepper Pike, OH	Progressive Casualty Insurance	\$7,500
	William Jurgensen	Columbus, OH	Nationwide Insurance	\$7,500
	Betty Lindner	Cincinnati, OH	Homemaker	\$7,500
	Carl Lindner, Sr.	Cincinnati, OH	American Financial Group	\$7,500
	Carl Lindner, Jr.	Cincinnati, OH	American Financial Group	\$7,500
	Edyth Lindner	Cincinnati, OH	American Financial Group	\$7,500
	Frances Lindner	Cincinnati, OH	American Financial Group	\$7,500
	Keith Lindner	Cincinnati, OH	Chiquita Brands International	\$7,500
	Martha Lindner	Cincinnati, OH	Homemaker	\$7,500
	Robert Lindner, Sr.	Cincinnati, OH	Retired	\$7,500
	S. Craig Lindner	Cincinnati, OH	American Financial Group	\$7,500
	Courtney Linder O'Neal	Cincinnati, OH	American Financial Group	\$7,500
	Edward Lozick	Pepper Pike, OH	Stren, Inc.	\$7,500
	Sheila Markley Black	Canton, OH	Day, Ketterer, Raley, Wright & Rybolt	\$7,500
	John H. McConnell	Columbus, OH	Worthington Industries	\$7,500
	John P. McConnell	Columbus, OH	Worthington Industries	\$7,500
	Robert Murray	Cleveland, OH	Ohio Valley Coal Company	\$7,500
	H.C. Buck Niehoff	Cincinnati, OH	Peck, Shaffer & Williams	\$7,500
	Bernadette Noe	Maumee, OH	Wise & Dorner	\$7,500
	Thomas Noe	Maumee, OH	Vintage Coins & Cards	\$7,500
	David O'Maley	Cincinnati, OH	Ohio National Financial Services	\$7,500
	J. Gilbert Reese	Newark, OH	Reese, Pyle, Drake & Meyer	\$7,500
	Robert Rhein	Cincinnati, OH	Robert C. Rhein Interests	\$7,500
	John Schiff	Cincinnati, OH	John & Thomas Schiff Insurance	\$7,500
	Lynn Schiff	Cincinnati, OH	Cloverhill Farm	\$7,500
	Thomas Schiff	Cincinnati, OH	Cincinnati Insurance Companies	\$7,500
	Max Sovell	Columbus, OH	Boich Companies	\$7,500
	Robert Taft	Cincinnati, OH	State of Ohio	\$7,500
	Leila Vespoli	Akron, OH	FirstEnergy	\$7,500
	Joseph Wesley	Sagamore Hills, OH	Tradesman International Construction	\$7,500
	Les Wexner	New Albany, OH	The Limited	\$7,500
4.	John Chester	Columbus, OH	Chester, Willcox & Saxbe	\$7,000
	Frank Sullivan	Bay Village, OH	RPM International	\$7,000

# Campaign Finance Profiles for General Election Candidates for the Ohio Supreme Court





**C. Ellen Connally**  
**Candidate for Chief Justice of Ohio Supreme Court**  
**Democrat/Challenger**  
**Total November 2, 2003-October 13, 2004—\$190,352**



Average Individual Contribution—\$205.60  
 Political Party and Candidate Committees and Leadership PACs—\$60,146  
 Political Action Committee (PAC) Contributions—\$10,220  
 Unincorporated Givers—\$23,042  
 Labor Unions—\$7,100

<b>Top Organizational Contributors to C. Ellen Connally</b>		
<b>Organizational Contributor</b>	<b>Type</b>	<b>Amount</b>
1. Nurenberg, Plevin, Heller & McCarthy	Personal Injury Law Firm	\$23,500
2. Law Offices of Matthew W. Chapel	Personal Injury Law Firm	\$8,000
3. United Auto Workers	Union	\$5,500
Williams, Jilek, Lafferty, Gallagher & Scott	Personal Injury Law Firm	\$5,500
3. Jeffries, Kube, Forrest & Monteleone	Personal Injury Law Firm	\$5,000
Ohio Academy of Trial Lawyers	Plaintiff Attorneys	\$5,000
4. Larrimer & Larrimer	Personal Injury Law Firm	\$3,000
5. Leesberg & Valentine	Personal Injury Law Firm	\$2,500
Richard Lawrence & Associates	Personal Injury Law Firm	\$2,500
Vorys, Sater, Seymour & Pease	Corporate Law Firm	\$2,500
6. Inscore, Rinehardt, Whitney & Enderle	Personal Injury Law Firm	\$2,000
7. John K. Rinehardt Law Firm	Personal Injury Law Firm	\$1,500
Okey Law Firm	Personal Injury Law Firm	\$1,500
8. Mellino Law Firm	Personal Injury Law Firm	\$1,100
9. Arthur, O’Neal, Mertz & Michel Co., LPA	Law Firm	\$1,000

**Contributions include PACs, employees and other contributions by organization. Totals include both monetary and in-kind contributions.**

<b>Top Political Party, Candidate Committees and Leadership PACs</b>	
1. Ohio Democratic Party	\$56,740
2. Wood County Democratic Party	\$581
3. Celebrezze for Judge Committee*	\$500
Dimora Boosters Committee	\$500
Friends of Raymond C. Pierce	\$500
4. Committee to Elect Patton	\$200
Friends of Frankie Goldberg	\$200

\*This contribution was refunded.

**Thomas J. Moyer**  
**Candidate for Chief Justice of Ohio Supreme Court**  
**Republican/Incumbent**  
**Total November 2, 2003- October 13, 2003—\$1,434,228**



Average Individual Contribution—\$266.97  
 Political Party and Candidate Committees and Leadership PACs—\$90,200  
 Political Action Committee (PAC) Contributions—\$313,505  
 Unincorporated Givers—\$157,610  
 Labor Unions— \$2,000

**Top Organizational Contributors to Thomas J. Moyer**

<b>Organizational Contributor</b>	<b>Type</b>	<b>Amount</b>
1. Cincinnati Insurance Companies	Insurance	\$27,895
2. Vorys, Sater, Seymour & Pease	Corporate Law Firm	\$23,070
3. Jones, Day, Reavis & Pogue	Corporate Law Firm	\$21,525
4. Nationwide Insurance	Insurance	\$21,237
5. FirstEnergy	Utility	\$20,550
6. Janik & Dorman LLP	Corporate Law Firm	\$19,000
7. American Financial Group	Insurance	\$16,000
8. Baker & Hostetler	Corporate Law Firm	\$15,800
9. Porter, Wright, Morris & Arthur	Corporate Law Firm	\$14,530
10. Freund Freeze & Arnold	Corporate Law Firm	\$11,540

**Contributions include PAC's, employees and other contributions by organization. Totals include both monetary and in-kind contributions.**

**Top Political Party, Candidate Committees and Leadership PACs**

1. Ohio Republican Party	\$51,875
2. Hamilton County Republican Party	\$15,000
3. Cuyahoga County Republican Party Judicial Fund	\$7,500
4. Friends of Governor Taft	\$5,500
5. America's Majority Trust (Congressman Rob Portman)	\$5,000

**Nancy A. Fuerst**  
**Candidate for Justice of Ohio Supreme Court**  
**Democrat Primary Winner/Open Seat**  
**Total November 2, 2003-October 13, 2004— \$843,862**



Average Individual Contribution— \$525.91  
 Political Party & Candidate Committees and Leadership PACs— \$4,375  
 Political Action Committee (PAC) Contributions— \$36,175  
 Unincorporated Givers— \$293,406  
 Labor Unions— \$43,425

**Top Organizational Contributors to Nancy Fuerst**

<b>Organizational Contributor</b>	<b>Type</b>	<b>Amount</b>
1. Burke & McGrath*	Law Firm	\$50,500
2. Nurenberg, Plevin, Heller & McCarthy	Personal Injury Law Firm	\$35,000
3. Weisman, Kennedy & Berris Co., LPA	Personal Injury Law Firm	\$26,800
4. Spangenberg, Shibley & Liber	Personal Injury Law Firm	\$23,000
5. Charles Kampinski Co., LPA	Personal Injury Law Firm	\$18,000
Williams, Jilek, Lafferty, Gallagher & Scott	Personal Injury Law Firm	\$18,000
6. Clark, Perdue, Roberts & Scott	Personal Injury Law Firm	\$16,500
7. Jeffries, Kube, Forrest & Monteleone	Personal Injury Law Firm	\$15,000
8. Scanlon & Gearinger Co., LPA	Personal Injury Law Firm	\$13,400
9. Okey Law Firm	Personal Injury Law Firm	\$13,000
10. Kelley & Ferraro	Personal Injury Law Firm	\$11,000
Lancione & Lancione	Personal Injury Law Firm	\$11,000

**Contributions include PACs, employees and other contributions by organization. Totals include both monetary and in-kind contributions. \*A family member made the contributions from Burke & McGrath. Family members are exempt from contribution limits in judicial races.**

**Top Political Party, Candidate Committees and Leadership PACs**

1. Friends of Tim Hagan	\$1,000
2. Dimora Boosters Committee	\$500
3. Cleveland Heights Democrats	\$300
4. Cleveland Stonewall Democrats	\$250
Friends of Mayor Kelley	\$250
Friends of Sheriff McFaul	\$250

**Judith Lanzinger**  
**Candidate for Justice of Ohio Supreme Court**  
**Republican/Open Seat**  
**Total November 2, 2003-October 13, 2004— \$1,488,090**



Average Individual Contribution— \$253.49  
 Political Party and Candidate Committees and Leadership PACs— \$239,177  
 Political Action Committee (PAC) Contributions— \$325,419  
 Unincorporated Givers— \$62,783  
 Labor Unions— \$500

<b>Top Organizational Contributors to Judith Lanzinger</b>		
<b>Organizational Contributor</b>	<b>Type</b>	<b>Amount</b>
1. Cincinnati Insurance Companies	Insurance	\$27,351
2. American Financial Group	Insurance	\$24,300
3. FirstEnergy	Utility	\$20,550
4. Nationwide Insurance	Insurance	\$20,137
5. Fifth Third Bank	Banking	\$14,350
6. Ohio National Financial Services	Insurance	\$13,600
7. Porter, Wright, Morris & Arthur	Corporate Law Firm	\$12,735
8. State Farm Insurance	Insurance	\$11,327
9. RPM International	Manufacturing	\$11,000
10. Ohio Casualty Insurance Company	Insurance	\$10,650
<b>Contributions include PACs, employees and other contributions by organization. Totals include both monetary and in-kind contributions.</b>		

<b>Top Political Party, Candidate Committees and Leadership PACs</b>	
1. Ohio Republican Party	\$180,434
2. Columbiana County Republican Party Judicial Account	\$17,723
3. Hamilton County Republican Party	\$10,000
4. Cuyahoga County Republican Party Judicial Fund	\$7,500
5. Friends of Governor Taft	\$5,500

**William O'Neill**  
**Candidate for Justice of Ohio Supreme Court**  
**Democrat/Challenger**  
**Total November 2, 2003-October 13, 2004—\$61,495**



Average Individual Contribution— \$13.12  
 Political Party & Candidate Committees and Leadership PACs— \$7,676  
 Political Action Committee (PAC) Contributions— \$7,600  
 Unincorporated Givers— \$20,970  
 Labor Unions— \$21,160

<b>Top Organizational Contributors to William O'Neill</b>		
<b>Organizational Contributor</b>	<b>Type</b>	<b>Amount</b>
1. Sheet Metal Workers Union	Union	\$2,200
2. Intl Brotherhood of Electrical Workers	Union	\$2,110
3. AFSCME	Union	\$2,000
Laborers Int'l Union of North America	Union	\$2,000
Plumbers & Pipefitters Local Union 392	Union	\$2,000
4. Pipefitters Local Union 120	Union	\$1,700
5. Nurenberg, Plevin, Heller & McCarthy	Personal Injury Law Firm	\$1,130
6. Casper & Casper	Personal Injury Law Firm	\$1,040
7. Allen Schulman & Associates	Personal Injury Law Firm	\$1,030
8. Charles Kampinski Co., LPA	Personal Injury Law Firm	\$1,020
Friedman, Domiano & Smith Co., LPA	Personal Injury Law Firm	\$1,020
Ohio Education Association	Union	\$1,020
9. Law Offices of Matthew W. Chapel	Personal Injury Law Firm	\$1,010
Spangenberg, Shibley & Liber	Personal Injury Law Firm	\$1,010
<b>Contributions include PACs, employees and other contributions by organization. Totals include both monetary and in-kind contributions.</b>		

<b>Top Political Party, Candidate Committees and Leadership PACs</b>	
1. Ohio Democratic Party	\$3,080
2. Democracy for America (Howard Dean PAC)	\$1,000
Geneva Area Democratic Committee	\$1,000
3. Dimora Boosters Committee	\$500
Tim Ryan for Congress	\$500
4. Michael Drain for Judge Committee	\$351
5. Citizens for Keiper	\$250
Friends of Peter Lawson Jones	\$250
Mercer County Democratic Party	\$250

**Terrence O'Donnell**  
**Candidate for Justice of Ohio Supreme Court**  
**Republican/Incumbent**  
**Total November 2, 2003-October 13, 2004—\$1,465,174**



Average Individual Contribution— \$263.56  
 Political Party & Candidate Committees and Leadership PACs— \$163,781  
 Political Action Committee (PAC) Contributions— \$336,281  
 Unincorporated Givers— \$78,733  
 Labor Unions— \$2,100

<b>Top Organizational Contributors to Terrence O'Donnell</b>		
<b>Organizational Contributor</b>	<b>Type</b>	<b>Amount</b>
1. Cincinnati Insurance Companies	Insurance	\$27,388
2. Nationwide Insurance	Insurance	\$20,387
3. American Financial Group	Insurance	\$20,000
FirstEnergy	Utility	\$20,000
4. Vorys, Sater, Seymour & Pease	Corporate Law Firm	\$17,950
5. Jones, Day, Reavis & Pogue	Corporate Law Firm	\$14,275
6. Squire, Sanders & Dempsey	Corporate Law Firm	\$13,500
7. Ohio National Financial Services	Insurance	\$13,000
8. Porter, Wright, Morris & Arthur	Corporate Law Firm	\$12,485
9. RPM International	Manufacturing	\$11,000
10. Cleveland Clinic Foundation	Health Care	\$10,978

**Contributions include PACs, employees and other contributions by organization. Totals include both monetary and in-kind contributions.**

<b>Top Political Party, Candidate Committees and Leadership PACs</b>	
1. Ohio Republican Party	\$98,488
2. Columbiana County Republican Party Judicial Account	\$17,723
3. Hamilton County Republican Party	\$15,000
4. Cuyahoga County Republican Party Judicial Fund	\$7,500
5. Friends of Governor Taft	\$5,500

**Paul Pfeifer**  
**Candidate for Justice of Ohio Supreme Court**  
**Republican/Incumbent**  
**Total November 2, 2003-September 30, 2004—\$74,500**



Average Individual Contribution— \$1,000  
 Political Party & Candidate Committees and Leadership PACs—\$0  
 Political Action Committee (PAC) Contributions— \$7,500  
 Unincorporated Givers— \$55,500  
 Labor Unions— \$10,500

<b>Top Organizational Contributors to Paul Pfeifer</b>		
<b>Organizational Contributor</b>	<b>Type</b>	<b>Amount</b>
1. Ohio Education Association	Union	\$10,500
2. Allen Schulman & Associates	Personal Injury Law Firm	\$5,500
Charles Kampinski Co., LPA	Personal Injury Law Firm	\$5,500
Clark, Perdue, Roberts & Scott Co., LPA	Personal Injury Law Firm	\$5,500
Friedman, Domiano & Smith Co., LPA	Personal Injury Law Firm	\$5,500
Murray & Murray Co., LPA	Personal Injury Law Firm	\$5,500
Nurenberg, Plevin, Heller & McCarthy Co., LPA	Personal Injury Law Firm	\$5,500
Ohio Academy of Trial Lawyers	Plaintiff Attorneys	\$5,500
Spangenberg, Shibley & Liber	Personal Injury Law Firm	\$5,500
Weisman, Kennedy & Berris Co., LPA	Personal Injury Law Firm	\$5,500
Williams, Jilek, Lafferty, Gallagher & Scott	Personal Injury Law Firm	\$5,500
3. Palmer, Volkema & Thomas	Personal Injury Law Firm	\$5,000
4. Miraldi & Barrett Co., LPA	Personal Injury Law Firm	\$2,000
5. Lamkin, Van Eman, Trimble, Beals & Rourke	Personal Injury Law Firm	\$1,000
Linton & Hirshman	Law Firm	\$1,000
<b>Contributions include PACs, employees and other contributions by organization. Totals include both monetary and in-kind contributions.</b>		

# Campaign Finance Profile for Primary Loser





**W. Scott Gwin**  
**Candidate for Justice of Ohio Supreme Court**  
**Democrat Primary Loser/Open Seat**  
**Total Raised November 2, 2003-April 11, 2004—\$234,244**



Average Individual Contribution— \$777.40  
 Political Party & Candidate Committees and Leadership PACs— \$3,650  
 Political Action Committee (PAC) Contributions— \$15,700  
 Unincorporated Givers— \$75,400  
 Labor Unions— \$12,000

<b>Top Organizational Contributors to W. Scott Gwin</b>		
<b>Organizational Contributor</b>	<b>Type</b>	<b>Amount</b>
1. Okey Law Firm	Personal Injury Law Firm	\$18,000
2. Allen Schulman & Associates	Personal Injury Law Firm	\$13,000
3. Murray & Murray Co., LPA	Personal Injury Law Firm	\$12,219
4. Clark, Perdue, Roberts & Scott Co., LPA	Personal Injury Law Firm	\$10,000
5. Roetzel & Andress	Law Firm	\$8,200
6. Waite, Schneider, Bayless & Chesley	Personal Injury Law Firm	\$8,000
7. Perantinides & Nolan	Personal Injury Law Firm	\$7,750
8. AFSCME	Union	\$5,500
Graham, McClelland & Ransbottom, LPA	Personal Injury Law Firm	\$5,500
Ohio Academy of Trial Lawyers	Plaintiff Attorney Association	\$5,500
Ohio Federation of Teachers	Teachers Association	\$5,500
Tzangas, Plakas, Mannos & Recupero	Personal Injury Law Firm	\$5,500
Williams, Jilek, Lafferty, Gallagher & Scott	Personal Injury Law Firm	\$5,500
9. Lancione & Lancione	Personal Injury Law Firm	\$5,000
Spangenberg, Shibley & Liber	Personal Injury Law Firm	\$5,000
10. Weisman, Kennedy & Berris Co., LPA	Personal Injury Law Firm	\$4,000
<b>Contributions include PACs, employees and other contributions by organization. Totals include both monetary and in-kind contributions.</b>		

<b>Top Political Party, Candidate Committees and Leadership PACs</b>	
1. Summit County Democratic Party	\$2,000
2. Friends of Pat O'Malley	\$1,000
3. Re-elect Judge Reinbold Committee	\$250
4. Citizens for Ford	\$200
Keep Joe Martuccio Law Director Committee	\$200
<b>Total</b>	<b>\$3,650</b>

## Following the Money

---

**This study examines campaign contributions to candidates for Chief Justice and Justice of the Ohio Supreme Court from November 2, 2003 to October 13, 2004. The Ohio Citizen Action Education Fund based this study on filings with the Ohio Secretary of State.**

The Ohio Citizen Action Education Fund was able to identify 92 percent of the employers of all individual contributors. The Education Fund identified the economic sector of 95 percent of the total contributions from both individuals and organizations.

There were nearly six thousand (5,739) contributions from individuals over one hundred dollars (\$100). Approximately 2,107 (37%) had no employer identification or were identified only by broad classification. Candidates are required by Ohio law to identify the employer or the occupation of those self-employed, if the contribution is more than one hundred dollars (\$100). Fortunately, 5,336 (93%) of those contributions had employer identification. However, 30 percent or 1,704 provided little meaningful employer identification, making it difficult to track the economic and policy interests of these contributors. Attorneys have traditionally been very active in judicial elections and represent a wide variety of interests and specialties. Physicians have become increasingly interested in judicial selection. Nearly 48 percent of those identified only in broad terms were listed as attorneys (387) or physicians (429).

While Ohio's Supreme Court general elections are nominally nonpartisan, Ohio political party committees provide substantial financial support for Supreme Court candidates. So far this election cycle, county party committees contributed \$106,051 to candidates for Ohio Supreme Court. There are eighty-eight (88) counties in Ohio and party committees are not required to file electronically, making these contributions very difficult to track before Election Day.

## Recommendations

---

**Enhance disclosure by requiring employer identification, or if self-employed, the name of the contributor's business.** Attorneys are the most active contributors in judicial races. However, they represent a wide variety of economic and policy interests. For disclosure to be meaningful, it is essential that all candidates, but especially judicial candidates, be required to report the name of the law firms.

**All contributions to the 88 county parties should be reported to the Ohio Secretary of State.** If any of the county party committees generate more than \$10,000 per reporting period, those committees should be required to file electronically, and this information should be posted by the Ohio Secretary of State's office, and available on the its site. County party committees should provide the full names and full addresses of individual contributors. County parties should also provide the identity of the employer of those individuals who give more than \$100.

**Candidates should identify attorneys and their law firms who have had business in their court in the past year. This would give Ohioans a clearer picture of campaign finance and judicial elections.** This reform could be accomplished by rules established by the Court.

Disclosure could also be improved by eliminating “best effort” for judicial candidates. Candidates for Ohio Supreme Court should be required to identify the employer of individuals of contributions over \$100, rather than simply their occupation. Contributions that are unidentified should be considered “frozen” until properly identified. If the candidate committees are unable to identify contributions, these funds should be returned to the contributor or given to the Client Security Fund. The Client Security Fund was established by the Court and compensates clients who suffer financial loss as a result of attorney misconduct. This is a change that would need to be accomplished legislatively.

**Because the Ohio Supreme Court mandates campaign finance rules and do not apply to other statewide candidates, the Court needs to mandate how this information should be provided.** The Ohio Secretary of State does not dictate how judicial candidates are to electronically report contributions from family members, who do not have contribution limits. The Secretary also does not provide guidelines for contributions from employees of the Court.

**Public financing of judicial campaigns would remove judges from serious fundraising and eliminate the perception that justice may be for sale.** The Next Steps Working Group on Public Financing continues to review reform options. North Carolina will become the first state in the nation to offer full public financing for its top courts this year, and this should give other states, including Ohio, more information about the benefits and problems of implementing a judicial public financing system.

## Methodology

---

The Ohio Citizen Action Education Fund analyzed contributions from November 2, 2003 through October 13, 2004 to candidates for Ohio Supreme Court Justice. Totals include contributions from political action committees (PACs), labor unions, unincorporated businesses, organizations and individuals. Unincorporated businesses are usually “mom and pop shops,” but many law firms are limited liability companies. These unincorporated businesses are not required to have PACs to make their contributions.

The database is based on the filings of judicial candidates for Ohio Supreme Court, available in computerized form from the Ohio Secretary of State. These filings were submitted electronically by the candidate committees to the Secretary of State and are available on-line at [www.state.oh.us/sos/](http://www.state.oh.us/sos/). The fundraising cycle for the Supreme Court candidates began 120 days before the 2004 Primary Election, on November 2, 2003.

***To identify the employers or the organizational affiliations of contributors, the Ohio Citizen Action Education Fund obtained the following databases:***

- A database of attorneys in Ohio from the Ohio Supreme Court
- A list of lobbyists in Ohio from the Joint Legislative Ethics Committee,
- The *InfoUSA PowerFinder*, a national phone directory on CD,
- The 1999-2000 *Run for the Money* database, an analysis of 1999-2000 contributors and the 2002 *Contributions to Candidates for the Ohio Supreme Court*, an analysis of 2002

contributions to Supreme Court candidates. Both of these databases are founded on databases from the Ohio Secretary of State.

- A list of Ohio Political Action Committees from the Ohio Secretary of State website to identify PAC sponsors.

There are many different kinds of attorneys. To identify personal injury attorneys, the Ohio Citizen Action Education Fund used a database of law firms that advertise in the *Yellow Pages* as personal injury attorneys. This database was cross-referenced with those who identified personal injury work as a primary focus in the *Martindale-Hubbell Lawyer Locator*. The *Martindale-Hubbell Lawyer Locator* at [www.martindale.com](http://www.martindale.com) provides free online access to the Martindale-Hubbell database. This captured those who publicly identified themselves as personal injury attorneys. However, this study likely underestimates contributions that can be attributed to personal injury attorneys and certainly does not include all plaintiff trial attorneys.

***For each candidate the total amount in this database includes the following:***

- Contributions received
- Contributions received at a social or fundraising event
- In-kind contributions received
- Contributions the candidate gave to his or her own campaign

The profiles do not include Statement of Other Income, which include interest, refunds, loans, returns, and other non-contribution income. Contribution totals are rounded up. Contact Catherine Turcer at 614-263-4111 if you are interested in the exact change.

It should be noted that contribution limits are based on whether the candidate is in a contested primary. For a chart of contribution limits for candidates for justice and chief justice of the Ohio Supreme Court, visit [www.sconet.state.oh.us](http://www.sconet.state.oh.us). Gwin for Supreme Court's initial Post Primary filing was amended, and this study reflects the amended report.

Justice at Stake's *2004 State Supreme Court Monitoring Project* tracks contributions to candidates for state Supreme Courts. Visit [www.justiceatstake.org](http://www.justiceatstake.org) to compare contributions to Ohio candidates with other state's campaign contributions.

Contributions to Citizens for a Strong Ohio, the affiliate of the Ohio Chamber of Commerce are also available on-line at [www.ohiochamber.com/citizens/donor.asp](http://www.ohiochamber.com/citizens/donor.asp).

The Brennan Center for Justice at New York University's *Buying Time 2004: Television Advertising in State Supreme Court Elections* tracks television advertisements related to state Supreme Court elections. The Brennan Center received information from a commercial firm that gathers the television ads through satellite. It should be noted that the amount spent is likely substantially less than the actual cost of advertising and is simply an estimate. The Brennan Center uses the "reasonable person standard," meaning that a reasonable person would interpret the advertisement as intended to affect the election. The Tri-County Physicians for Patients Rights, for example, does not include a reference to a specific candidate or include a candidate's likeness. Visit [www.brennancenter.org](http://www.brennancenter.org), to see comparisons with other states.

## Acknowledgements

---

The Ohio Citizen Action Education Fund thanks the Joyce Foundation and the George Gund Foundation for their encouragement and funding to analyze campaign contributions to Ohio statewide and legislative candidates, legislative caucus committees and political party committees. The Education Fund thanks Larry Hansen, vice-president of the Joyce Foundation, for his guidance.

The Ohio Citizen Action Education Fund thanks Curt Mayhew and Kelly Neer of the office of the Ohio Secretary of State for their advice and information. The Ohio Secretary of State made the filings available in a timely fashion on its File Transfer Protocol (FTP) site.

Thank you to Don Mark for assisting with research and editing. Thanks to Angela Oster for her graphic design. Thanks to Peg Rosenfield, Scott Britton and Dan Tokaji for editing.

Catherine Turcer and Brandi Whetstone are the co-authors of this report. Turcer is the campaign reform director, and Whetstone is the research database manager for the Ohio Citizen Action Education Fund. The Ohio Citizen Action Education Fund is the non-profit, research and education affiliate of Ohio Citizen Action. The Education Fund produces studies on money and politics and on toxins in the environment.

***For questions or comments about the study, contact Catherine Turcer, 3400 N. High St. #430, Columbus, Ohio 43202. (614)263-4111, cturcer@ohiocitizen.org.***