

Comparison of Pure Water Monterey Expansion & Cal Am Desal

COST & DEMAND ISSUES

PURE WATER MONTEREY EXPANSION	CAL AM DESAL
Current annual demand for Monterey Peninsula: 5-Year average is 10,109 AFY, 3-year average is 9,788 AFY.	
Adds 2,250 acre-feet per year (AFY) to water supply. Total available water supply 11,700 AFY.	Adds 6,252 acre-feet per year (AFY) to water supply. Total available water supply 15,602 AFY.
Estimated cost per acre-foot \$2,077.	Cost per acre-foot is \$6,094 (at 86% capacity). If capacity drops, cost rises \$7,300-\$8,300 per AF.
Cost with O&M over 30 years is \$190 million. Lower cost from non-profit public agency.	Cost with O&M over 30 years is \$1.2 Billion. Substantially raises ratepayer costs.
Produces enough water for 40-50 years of growth. Historic demand for new development is 16.4 AFY.	Oversized for current need of 10,109 AFY (5 yr. avg.) Exaggerates future demand.
Meets peak demand.	Meets peak demand.
	Cost of replacing fresh water drawn from Salinas Valley Groundwater Basin to meet Agency Act.

ENVIRONMENTAL ISSUES

PURE WATER MONTEREY EXPANSION	CAL AM DESAL
Expands existing approved project. No coastal impact.	Destroys 7 acres of coastal dunes and habitat. New construction in coastal and inland areas.
Energy consumption is 5,819 megawatt hours per year. (12 MWh - PG&E / 5,807 MWh - landfill biogas.)	Energy consumption is 37,954 megawatt hours per year (PG&E).
Produces 2 metric tons of CO2 per year (46 MT CO2 over 30 years).	Produces 4,993 metric tons of CO2 per year (149,776 MT CO2 over 30 years).
Protects against seawater intrusion.	Project must create seawater intrusion to work.
Captures and purifies existing wastewater for indirect potable use and stores it in Seaside Groundwater Basin. Improves water quality in Basin. Provides drought reserve. Reduces current discharge to Bay.	Draws 16,000 AFY of groundwater from Salinas Valley Groundwater Basin with experimental slant wells. Adds brine discharge to Bay.

LEGAL & POLICY ISSUES

PURE WATER MONTEREY EXPANSION	CAL AM DESAL
No issues with water rights.	Cal Am has no water rights to the groundwater it wants to use. It cannot meet the criteria laid out by the SWRCB to gain appropriate water rights.
CPUC has approved the Pure Water Monterey project for 3,500 AFY. CPUC did not complete its review of the PWM Expansion and has not seriously considered it as a feasible alternative.	CPUC has approved the desal, subject to the independent judgment of other key permitting agencies (CCC and Central Coast RWQCB). New information was not included in original EIR that was approved.
Same permitting as approved PWM project for 3,500 AFY. No surprises.	Permitting faces obstacles and litigation over groundwater. No slant wells in use for desal anywhere in the world.
No litigation.	Current litigation expected to continue. High risk of litigation delay.
Consistent with SWRCB Dec.12, 2018 notice emphasizing recycling of water as preferred policy.	SWRCB policy requires that feasibility of slant wells must be determined before proceeding.
	Needs Marina Coast Water District pipeline (not available)

COASTAL ZONE ISSUES

PURE WATER MONTEREY EXPANSION	CAL AM DESAL
Best environmental alternative in the public interest.	Not in the public interest.
No coastal impact.	Violates LCP. 7 slant wells, transmission pipelines, construction disturbances. Western Snowy Plover nesting area. Destroys ESHA.
Existing wastewater is purified and recycled for indirect potable use. Reduces discharge to Bay.	Adds new brine discharge to Marine Sanctuary (8 million gallons per day). Potential Dead Zone.
Protects against seawater intrusion.	Induces seawater intrusion into groundwater basin.
No Environmental Justice issues.	Puts the cost of water out of reach for many with lower incomes (Environmental Justice issue).

OTHER ISSUES

PURE WATER MONTEREY EXPANSION	CAL AM DESAL
Can meet December, 2021 CDO deadline and lift moratorium.	May not meet CDO deadline due to litigation or permit delays.
Needs Water Purchase Agreement from Cal Am.	More profitable for Cal Am. \$123 million profit (30 yrs.)
Cooperative public partnership serves agriculture and urban needs.	Threatens Marina's water supplies to meet the Peninsula's needs.