



## **PROMISES, PROMISES:**

CITY COUNCIL COMMITMENTS & THE 2018 BUDGET

February, 2018

## ABOUT SOCIAL PLANNING TORONTO

Social Planning Toronto is a non-profit, charitable community organization that works to improve equity, social justice and quality of life in Toronto through community capacity building, community education and advocacy, policy research and analysis, and social reporting. Social Planning Toronto is committed to building a “Civic Society” one in which diversity, equity, social and economic justice, interdependence and active civic participation are central to all aspects of our lives - in our families, neighbourhoods, voluntary and recreational activities and in our politics.

To find this report and learn more about Social Planning Toronto, visit [socialplanningtoronto.org](http://socialplanningtoronto.org).

### **PROMISES, PROMISES: City Council Commitments & The 2018 Budget**

© Social Planning Toronto

**ISBN:** 978-1-894199-47-6

Published in Toronto  
February, 2018

by Social Planning Toronto  
2 Carlton St. Suite 1001  
Toronto, ON M5B 1J3



This report was proudly produced with unionized labour.

# ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

## REPORT AUTHOR

Beth Wilson

## RESEARCH SUPPORT

Jackie Tanner

## REPORT LAYOUT AND DESIGN

Ravi Joshi

Many thanks to Michael Polanyi from the Children's Aid Society of Toronto, Community Development and Prevention Program for providing freedom of information request documents to aid in the budget analysis and for his ongoing work supporting informed community engagement in the city budget process. We would like to extend our appreciation to City of Toronto finance and division staff for their prompt and detailed responses to our inquiries regarding the city budget. Thanks to our community partners, Dusha Sritharan with Toronto Environmental Alliance, Jane Mercer with the Toronto Coalition for Better Child Care and Shelagh Pizey-Allen with TTCriders for their insights and analysis of budget issues.

## FUNDING SUPPORT

Our thanks to our key funders, United Way Toronto & York Region and the City of Toronto.



## EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Social Planning Toronto's budget brief, ***Promises, Promises***, documents the systematic underfunding of key council-approved strategies and service plans in the 2018 city budget. Social Planning Toronto analysis indicates that to meet the commitments council has made, this budget would require:

- an increased investment of \$36 million in the 2018 city operating budget;
- an additional \$35 million to double council's commitment to new affordable rental housing development<sup>1</sup>;
- a revision of the city's budget process to ensure transparency and accountability on critical issues affecting Toronto.

The report presents funding options to support council-approved strategies and service plans.

## CONTEXT

Over the last several years, we have witnessed increasing concern over the ability of the city to keep pace with the challenges we face. These growing concerns go above and beyond access to affordable housing and emergency shelter. Communities are also struggling to access affordable recreation programs, high quality child care and reliable public transit. Residents want to ensure that their local parks, public libraries and community centres are well resourced to support strong neighbourhoods. They are disturbed by rising inequality, inequities faced by racialized and immigrant communities, and the lack of good jobs in our city. Community members worry about the daunting challenges of climate change for our city and the generations to come.

Many of these issues are echoed in Commitment to Community's *'Voices of Toronto Speak Up'*, a report documenting the concerns of hundreds of residents about life in Toronto and their vision for a better city.<sup>2</sup> Similarly, through the city budget process, residents have spoken out about conditions in the city and the need for renewed investment and leadership.

Over the years, Toronto City Council has adopted many strategies and service plans in response to community concerns, to meet urgent needs, and to advance the city's social,

---

<sup>1</sup> City funding for affordable housing includes revenues from development charges and Section 37 planning fees. If these are insufficient, debt funding could be used to support the development of affordable housing as it is used to build shelters and other infrastructure. The Mayor's City Building Fund could also support this much-needed housing.

<sup>2</sup> Commitment to Community (2017).

cultural and economic goals. However, even when council unanimously endorses these plans and strategies, there is no certainty that they will be implemented. A second vote is required during the budget process to fund each plan and strategy, and there is no guarantee that they will be fully funded.

This report provides a detailed analysis of the 2018 city budget and the 2018 implementation costs for advancing key council-approved strategies and service plans focused on recreation, parks, newcomers, strong neighbourhoods, climate change action, poverty reduction, public transit, child care, affordable housing, middle childhood, seniors and youth.

In May 2017, a city staff report was released documenting the 2018 implementation costs for a variety of council-approved service plans and strategies.<sup>3</sup> Using this costing document, additional analysis provided by city staff through a freedom of information request, and city budget reports and documents, we assess the degree to which plans and strategies are funded in the 2018 budget. This report also reflects on the current budget process and makes recommendations in response to findings from this analysis.

Our analysis is based on the state of the 2018 city budget as of February 6, 2018 when the Executive Committee completed its proceedings. As of the publication of this report, the budget process was entering its final stages. Council has one remaining opportunity to make changes to the budget at its February 12 and 13 meeting where final budget votes will take place.

## FINDINGS

### **Several Council-Approved Strategies and Service Plans are Underfunded in the 2018 Budget by More than \$36 Million, Even After Revisions Made by the Budget Committee and Executive Committee.**

- The Recreation Service Plan and Parks Plan are underfunded by over \$10 million.
- Since the May 2017 city costing document was released, 2018 work plans for TransformTO, the city's climate change action plan, and TO Prosperity, the city's poverty reduction strategy, have undergone considerable change resulting in a reduction in funding requests coming forward for consideration in the budget process. While the budget funds the costs associated with revised work plans, the funding is below the original estimates, and community groups are challenging the notion that the revised work plans are adequately addressing the needs as originally

---

<sup>3</sup> City of Toronto (2017, May 23).



envisioned. Groups are calling for just under \$2 million to be added to the budget in these areas.

- The city is planning to revise its commitment of \$11.2 million for the Child Care Growth Strategy by spreading these funds over three years, starting with \$2 million in 2018.<sup>4</sup> Child care advocates are urging council to include the city's full contribution in the 2018 budget to improve the child care system now.
- The city costing report did not include a specific dollar figure for implementation of Housing Opportunities Toronto (HOT), the city's affordable housing plan. Latest reports from the city show that the HOT plan is well off its 10-year target to complete 10,000 units of affordable rental housing by 2019, anticipating that fewer than half will be built by the end of the plan.<sup>5</sup> Budget documents indicate that only 525 new affordable rental housing units are expected to be completed in 2018.<sup>6</sup> The city anticipates approving 1,000 new affordable rental units for development this year, remaining far behind their 10 year target, while the waiting list for social housing now exceeds 100,000 households.<sup>7</sup> An additional \$35 million, which could be provided through operating funding or through debt funding, would allow the city to double its target for newly approved affordable rental units to 2,000 in 2018 and begin to reverse the trend toward delivering less than half of the original target.
- While federal funds have been added to the budget in support of the Middle Childhood Strategy for new kindergarten and school-age subsidies, no municipal funds are included in the budget. The May 2017 costing document anticipated a municipal contribution of \$3.4 million, but that contribution has disappeared from the current plan.
- As part of the Seniors Strategy, the city costing document identified funding needs to support a community paramedic program and to reduce/eliminate the dental waiting list for seniors. Funds for the paramedic program are included in the budget. At the time of publication of this report, it was unclear whether the seniors dental program would receive additional funding.

---

<sup>4</sup> As described in the report, the budget includes funds for 825 new child care fee subsidies. City staff report that if the city's full 20% contribution of \$11.2 million were included in the 2018 budget for additional child care fee subsidies, the child care system would not have the space to accommodate all of these new subsidies. Instead the city plans to introduce these funds over a 3-year period. Child care advocates are urging council to use every dollar available to improve the child care system in 2018.

<sup>5</sup> City of Toronto, Affordable Housing Office (2017, September).

<sup>6</sup> City of Toronto, Affordable Housing Office (no date).

<sup>7</sup> City of Toronto, Toronto Progress Portal webpage: <https://www.toronto.ca/city-government/data-research-maps/toronto-progress-portal/>

- While the costed activities for the Youth Equity Strategy are included in the budget, the Toronto Public Health budget proposes to eliminate funding for the Ambassador Program which supports marginalized youth to complete their high school education. This measure was put forward to meet council's budget freeze direction but elimination of an effective program for marginalized youth is counter to the objectives laid out in the Youth Equity Strategy. The city contributes \$50,000 to this cost-shared program with children's aid societies.
- The TTC Ridership Growth Strategy was recently adopted by the TTC Board. The budget includes only \$1 million to improve service levels and reduce overcrowding. However, the TTC estimates that the cost of meeting the crowding standards for on-peak and off-peak hours is \$12.5 million, so an additional \$11.5 million would be required.<sup>8,9</sup>

### **Council Budget Directions Restrict Progress on Council-Approved Strategies and Service Plans**

The Mayor and Toronto City Council provide directions for the development of the city budget. For the 2018 budget, these directions instructed staff to maintain a residential property tax increase at inflation (2.1%) and for divisions, boards and agencies to freeze their 2018 budgets at 2017 levels. These constraints present challenges for maintaining existing services and send a strong message to city staff to limit their funding requests for new and enhanced programs and services, irrespective of community needs and council-approved strategies and service plan priorities. These directives press staff to "pre-cut" the budgets of programs council has approved before they reach the budget process. This results in programs that are described as "fully funded" in the budget when they are funded at levels sometimes millions below what was recommended in the council-approved plan.

### **Council Approval of Strategies and Service Plans Does Not Guarantee Proper Funding for Implementation**

Toronto City Council approves many city strategies and service plans, often with unanimous support. However, whether a plan is approved, there is no certainty it will in fact be implemented as planned or even at all. That relies on a separate decision made

---

<sup>8</sup> City of Toronto, Toronto Transit Commission (2018, January 12).

<sup>9</sup> TTC staff have reported that it doesn't have the necessary vehicles to improve service to the level of eliminating overcrowding. Transit advocates are urging council to examine this issue further to reduce overcrowding in the system and support ridership growth as much as possible and as soon as possible.

during the budget process. Each year, new and enhanced programs and services are considered for funding through the annual budget process and not automatically added to the base budget. As a result, community groups and residents must advocate repeatedly for a plan from its development through each phase of its implementation, often in competition with other badly-needed programs.

### **Council Continues to Rely on Unsustainable Funding Sources to Fill Holes in the Budget**

In the 2018 budget, the Budget Committee voted to use one-time reserve funds to support some new and enhanced programs and services that will require ongoing investments. This will present financial challenges in future years when future funding is needed and the one-time sources are no longer available. Council continues its over-reliance on the Municipal Land Transfer Tax to balance the budget, and continues to avoid stable, long-term funding sources for the programs residents rely on. Despite repeated debates, studies, and reviews, the current council has not implemented any new revenue tools and relies heavily on the one put in place almost a decade ago, the Municipal Land Transfer Tax.

### **Council Continues to Divert Funds Needed for Council-Approved Programs to Other Uses**

The city uses operating funds that normally support programs and services to offset pressures in the capital budget. These reallocations are referred to as “capital from current” and have grown significantly in recent years. There is, for example, \$373 million in capital from current in the preliminary budget, an increase of \$62 million over the 2017 budget. Similarly, the city has made significant expenditures in optional investments such as elevating the Gardiner Expressway rather than accepting the more frugal option for that project, at a cost of \$2.3 billion, over 60 times the additional investment needed to fully fund the city’s commitments to the policies and programs it has already approved.<sup>10</sup>

## **RECOMMENDATIONS**

### **Fully Fund and Support the Council-Approved Strategies and Service Plans in the 2018 Budget**

To fully fund and support key council-approved strategies and service plans, we recommend an increase of \$36.2129 million in the 2018 operating budget. On the housing

---

<sup>10</sup> City of Toronto, Transportation Services (no date).



front, we urge Toronto City Council to double its current target of 1,000 new affordable rental unit approvals for 2018 to a total of 2,000 units. A total of \$35 million plus city incentives would be required to support this additional development. Operating funds, debt funding or revenues from the Mayor's City Building Fund could be used to build affordable housing.<sup>11</sup>

<b>Strategy/Service Plan</b>	<b>Recommended Increase for 2018 Budget (net \$; millions)</b>	<b>Details</b>
Recreation Service Plan	\$5.3775	Fully fund remaining recreation service plan initiatives including youth leadership program, community development with youth and seniors, compliance with disability legislation, recreation centre maintenance standards; fund Toronto Leadership Program as originally costed
Parks Plan	\$4.842	Fully fund 2018 parks plan to improve quality of parks and park maintenance across city
TransformTO	\$1.523	Hire full complement of 35 staff to implement climate action plan; fully fund Better Building Partnership, community engagement and Live Green Toronto programs as originally costed
TO Prosperity	\$0.3644	Open an additional 2 youth hubs and standardize youth hub staffing and programming across all sites as originally costed
Child Care Growth Strategy	\$9.2	Invest full 20% city contribution in child care system in 2018
Housing Opportunities Toronto	\$35.0*	HOT plan target calls for 10,000 new affordable rental units by 2019 but city projects fewer than half will be built. In light of this, we recommend that the city double its annual target for the remaining years of the plan; city projects

<sup>11</sup> The city's Affordable Housing Office estimates the cost of a single affordable rental unit at 100% average market rent at \$35,000 in city funding and a value of \$40,000 in city incentives such as waiving development charges and future property taxes.

		1,000 new approvals annually; additional funds would increase target to 2,000 units for 2018; we also recommend that the city accelerate the creation of new permanent shelter beds
Middle Childhood Strategy	\$3.4	Expand subsidies for children 6-12 years as originally costed
Youth Equity Strategy	\$0.006	Reverse proposed cut and elimination of Ambassador Program for marginalized youth consistent with goals of youth equity strategy
TTC Ridership Growth Strategy	\$11.5	Improve service levels and eliminate overcrowding during on- and off-peak hours to advance growth strategy
TOTAL	\$36.2129	Not including housing costs; see note below
*As it does for shelter expansion, the city could use debt funding rather operating budget funds to finance new affordable rental housing. The city would also provide incentives to support this development e.g. breaks on development charges and future property taxes as per the Mayor's Open Door Program. The 10-year capital plan already includes funds for new emergency shelters. We are recommending that implementation be accelerated to get new permanent beds online as soon as possible.		

Toronto City Council has a variety of options to fully fund and support these council-approved strategies and service plans: council could make a small increase of 1.25 percentage points to the proposed residential property tax increase (and corresponding increases to non-residential properties), use revenue tools available through the City of Toronto Act, slightly reduce the amount of revenues that the city transfers into the capital budget (i.e. a reduction of capital from current; proposed at \$373 million in the preliminary budget, an increase of \$62 million over 2017) or do some combination of these options. If the city shaved off 1.6% from the hefty \$2.3 billion price tag for the Gardiner Expressway rebuild, the unfunded community priorities identified in this report could be supported.

### **Change the Budget Process and the Funding Process for Council-Approved Plans and Strategies**

Community groups and residents are encouraging council to change the budget process to ensure that council's stated priorities are the starting point for budget development: When council adopts strategies and service plans to realize its goals, decisions regarding funding

should be included. Subsequent fiscal decisions, such as setting the property tax rate, should follow from the city's priority planning process, rather than serve as the starting point for all city decisions. Through this process, when council approves strategies and service plans, community members want to know that council is fully committed to resourcing and implementing them.

### **Ensure Clear and Measurable Targets and Timelines for Council-Approved Strategies and Service Plans, and Dedicate Funds for Evaluation and Community Reporting**

Council-approved strategies and service plans vary in terms of having clear and measurable targets and timelines, and dedicated funds for evaluation and community reporting. City staff, councillors, residents, community organizations and other stakeholders put time and energy into the creation of these plans. Targets, timelines, evaluation processes and community reporting are critical to assessing the progress and success of plans and identifying when a course correction is required to ensure that the plan will meet its overall objective. Dedicated funds are needed to support this work. Community advisory tables can play an important role in shaping and guiding this work and ensuring accountability.

### **Tackle the Big Issues**

In 2018, residents will go to the polls to elect our next Mayor and Toronto City Council. Our communities face serious challenges from child poverty, homelessness and growing inequities to a lack of access to critical services and supports including child care, affordable housing, recreation and more. Toronto needs bold leadership to tackle these challenges and improve life in the city. Too often, council action has amounted to a bit of tinkering around the edges of a serious problem, managing community expectations and putting off big challenges for another day. We must elevate expectations of our elected leaders and call on candidates to commit to a bold vision for Toronto and have the political will to back it up, to resource city plans to transform our city for the future.

## INTRODUCTION

The City of Toronto regularly adopts service plans and strategies to address social challenges, respond to the needs of Toronto residents, and improve quality of life in the city. These plans and strategies are intended to advance a variety of the City of Toronto's social, cultural and economic goals across a range of issue areas and for a diversity of population groups.

Some of the city's current plans and strategies focus on poverty reduction, strong neighbourhoods, climate change action, public transit, parks and recreation, child care and affordable housing as well as specific population groups including youth, middle years children, seniors and newcomers. Each plan identifies a series of strategies and respective actions aimed at achieving specific goals. Following the direction of city council, city staff develop these plans and strategies, usually with extensive community engagement. Together, these blueprints for action form a strong vision for a better city.

These plans and strategies are often adopted unanimously by Toronto City Council. Based on this strong support, one might think that they will be fully funded and implemented according to plan. Community members are often surprised to learn that adoption of a plan or strategy does not automatically result in its funding. Through the city's annual budget process, Toronto City Council considers whether to provide funding and the level of funding to support implementation of the council-approved strategies and plans.

## 2018 IMPLEMENTATION COSTS FOR KEY COUNCIL-APPROVED STRATEGIES & SERVICE PLANS

In May 2017, following the direction of city council, city staff calculated the 2018 implementation costs for 12 approved strategies and service plans.<sup>12</sup> Figure 1 identifies key strategies and plans and their respective 2018 net costs based on the city staff report. These figures reflect the 2018 anticipated costs from municipal revenues required for each strategy and plan.

---

<sup>12</sup> City of Toronto (2017, May 23).

**Figure 1. 2018 Full Cost Implications of Council-Approved Strategies & Service Plans**

<b>Implementation costs for Service Plan Initiatives – Operating</b>		
Activities	Net 2018 (\$000)	Impact/Service Level
<b>Strategies and Service Plans</b>		
Parks and Recreation Plans <sup>13</sup>	7,325.0	Swim to Survive expansion into phase 3, service increase for the Toronto Leadership Program, development and implementation of the Primary Program Model; Urban Forestry Service Plan, phasing in \$22 million of annual property tax fund; establish City Wide Urban Park Ranger program, rejuvenate park horticulture, increase management of natural environment trails by 50KM, enable public involvement in park horticulture, and enhance evening and weekend park maintenance
Toronto Newcomer Strategy	120.0	Additional staffing resources to meet the commitments related to the implementation of the Toronto Newcomer Strategy
Toronto Strong Neighbourhoods Strategy	126.0	32 engagement opportunities for 1600 Residents, 40 employment training workshops; 700 residents engaged in food security activities, 13 Community Hub development projects, 4 District Civic Engagement Initiatives, Toronto Seniors Forum and Resident Advisories supported
TransformTO: Climate Action for a Healthy, Equitable, Prosperous Toronto	6,700.0	The initial approved strategies accelerate and enhance existing City of Toronto programs and policies to maximize their potential to reduce GHG emissions community-wide while supporting improved public health outcomes, local economic prosperity, and social equity benefit. They build on Toronto's existing leadership and innovation in urban climate action to reduce carbon
<b>Poverty Reduction</b>		
TO Prosperity: Toronto Poverty Reduction Strategy (2018 Work Plan)	38,423.0	Includes TCHC (Tenants First), Student Nutrition Program, and shelter expansions
Fair (Transit) Pass Program *	4,600.0	As per EX20.10 adopted by council on December 13, 2016

<sup>13</sup> Parks and Recreation Plans includes the Parks Plan, Recreation Service Plan and Strategic Forest Management Plan.

Child Care Growth Strategy **	4,900.0	Increase fee subsidies for children 0-4 and reduce parent fees
Housing Opportunities Toronto **		The estimated annual City investment required to meet the HOT/Open Door 5-year target of 5,000 new affordable rental homes would be, on average, some \$10.0 million in funding and \$35.0 million in waived fees, charges and property taxes. The remaining affordable ownership and TO Renovates 2018 HOT shortfall would require an additional \$56.7 million. New federal-provincial funding for 2018 has not yet been announced.
Middle Childhood Strategy ***	3,400.0	Increase fee subsidies for children 6-12
Seniors Strategy 1.0 ***	650.0	Expand Program from 2 to 12 Paramedics with 8 Response Units. (Note: MOHLTC 50% Funding trails by 1 year.) & Short term eliminate/reduce TPH wait list of 3,000 seniors. Long term improve access to necessary dental care for low income seniors
Youth Equity Strategy ***	118.0	One educational attainment program, support groups in 5 NIA's, two 15-week sessions engaging 200 residents, employment connection table with 300 referrals, engage 100 program participants and complete 170 story book recordings for 150 children, outcomes framework, resources and support networks created for youth leaving incarceration
<b>Total Impact on Operating Budget</b>	<b>66,362.0</b>	

Note: Since the approval of the Toronto Poverty Reduction Strategy, in 2015, there has been increased coordination of programs and services targeting low-income residents; many City strategies now have complementary actions aligned with one of the 17 poverty reduction recommendations

\* PRS program approved in 2016

\*\* All items in this strategy advance PRS recommendations

\*\*\* All estimated 2018 investment are aligned with PRS recommendations



<b>Implementation cost for Service Plan Initiatives – Capital</b>			
Activities	Debt (Total) (\$000)	Debt 2018 (\$000)	Impact/Service Level
TO Prosperity: Toronto Poverty Reduction Strategy (2018 Work Plan)	298,000.0	298,000.0	TCHC capital rehabilitation plan (Tenants First)
Child Care Growth Strategy	280,000.0	2,000.0	Increased access to licensed child care; increase licensed child care spaces to 70,000 by 2026
<b>Total Impact on Capital Budget &amp; 10 Year Plan</b>	<b>578,000.0</b>	<b>300,000.0</b>	

A freedom of information request was submitted to the City of Toronto to access further details about each of these costed strategies and plans. City staff provided details about the 2018 activities and budget amounts that comprise each of the strategies and plans.

## **ANALYSIS OF THE 2018 CITY BUDGET & KEY COUNCIL-APPROVED STRATEGIES & SERVICE PLANS**

In this report, we assess the degree to which these council-approved strategies and service plans have been funded in the 2018 City of Toronto budget and the extent to which they will be implemented as planned. To assess this, we examine the 2018 implementation costs calculated by city staff in the May 2017 staff report and the funded activities in the city budget as of January 23, 2018.<sup>14,15,16</sup>

At the time of this publication, the budget process was in its final stages but not yet completed. The Budget Committee and Executive Committee had completed their reviews and passed motions to add new and enhanced services to the 2018 budget. Those new and enhanced programs and services are reflected in our analysis. There is one final opportunity for council to change the budget at its February 12 and 13 council meeting where final votes on the 2018 budget take place. To understand the current state of support for the city's strategies and plans, we also reached out to city staff with requests for further information and details.

<sup>14</sup> City of Toronto (2017, May 23).

<sup>15</sup> City of Toronto 2018 Budget webpage: [www.toronto.ca/budget2018](http://www.toronto.ca/budget2018). Review included budget presentation, budget notes and briefing notes for various agencies, boards and divisions.

<sup>16</sup> City of Toronto, Budget Committee (2018a, January 23).

All dollar figures presented in this report reflect 2018 net funds required to implement city plans and strategies or that are included in the 2018 city budget; net funds are from municipal revenue sources such as property taxes rather than provincial or federal government funding sources.<sup>17</sup>

## **Parks, Forestry and Recreation Service Plans**

According to a May 2017 report, city staff calculated the 2018 implementation costs for the recreation service plan, parks plan and strategic forest management plan at \$7.325 million net (i.e. from municipal revenue sources).<sup>18</sup> City documents accessed through a freedom of information request provided further detail regarding these activities.<sup>19</sup>

### **Recreation Service Plan**

According to the City of Toronto, “the 2013 – 2017 Recreation Service Plan aims to increase overall participation in recreation, decrease financial barriers to recreation and improve local geographic access. It outlines the role that the City plays in meeting the recreation needs of Torontonians, within the context of the larger recreation service sector that has many diverse providers.

In 2009, City Council approved the development of a city-wide, multi-year Recreation Service Plan based on four guiding principles:

- Equitable access
- Quality
- Inclusion
- Capacity building”<sup>20</sup>

Our analysis shows that most recreation activities described in the staff costing report are included in the 2018 budget with the exception of the Toronto Leadership Program. However, several activities needed to fully implement the Recreation Service Plan, a 5-year service plan for 2013-2017, were not included in the staff costing report, and no funds were requested in the 2018 budget process to support those initiatives.

---

<sup>17</sup> Net funds are from municipal revenue sources; gross funds include all revenue sources including provincial and federal funding and funds drawn from city reserve accounts.

<sup>18</sup> City of Toronto (2017, May 23).

<sup>19</sup> City of Toronto (2017, May 18).

<sup>20</sup> City of Toronto, Recreation Service Plan webpage: <https://www.toronto.ca/city-government/accountability-operations-customer-service/long-term-vision-plans-and-strategies/parks-forestry-recreation/recreation-service-plan/>

The Toronto Leadership Program “invests in Toronto's vulnerable youth through the provision of job-readiness skills, national training qualifications (aquatics and/or sport), High-Five Principles of Healthy Child Development training, Fundamental Movement Skills and Physical Literacy training, as well as First-Aid and CPR.”<sup>21</sup> The 2018 cost for continued implementation of the Toronto Leadership Program was calculated at \$300,000. These funds are not included in the budget. According to the city budget notes, the funds were not requested “in consideration of financial priorities for 2018”.<sup>22</sup> These financial priorities refer to the budget direction set by the mayor and city council, requesting that all city agencies, boards and divisions freeze their budgets at 2017 levels.<sup>23</sup> As a result, requests for new funding to expand programs and services are limited.

Figure 2 shows the remaining service plan initiatives required to implement the Recreation Service Plan. These activities were not included in the city costing report and are not funded in the 2018 budget. As well, no request for funding was put forward to support these activities in the 2018 budget process.<sup>24</sup>

**Figure 2. Recreation – Remaining Service Plan Initiatives (Not Submitted)\***

	2018 (\$000)
Service Excellence – Communications and Marketing Strategy	550.0
Service Excellence – Consistent Maintenance Standards	3,000.0
Service Planning – Enhanced Reporting	125.0
Service Planning – Community Development (Equity, Youth, Seniors, Partnerships)	165.0
Service Planning – Compliance with Disability Legislation	437.5
Service Levels – Youth Leadership Programming	800.0
<b>Recreation Service Plan Unfunded Total Required for 2018</b>	<b>5,077.5</b>

\* Not submitted for consideration in 2018 Budget process.

<sup>21</sup> City of Toronto, Parks, Forestry and Recreation (no date).

<sup>22</sup> *ibid.*

<sup>23</sup> Budget freezes, in fact, necessitate either service cuts or savings from efficiencies because divisions, agencies and boards must cover the cost of inflation to maintain existing services. In the preliminary city budget, some division, agency and board budgets were frozen at 2017 budget levels. However, others were not with staff citing the detrimental impact on services that would result from maintaining a freeze.

<sup>24</sup> *ibid.*

This year's budget includes an increase to recreation user fees of 2.12% and a reduction of \$600,000 to the city's Welcome Policy which subsidizes the cost of recreation for low-income residents.<sup>25</sup>

On a positive note, the Budget Committee increased funding to expand the Swim to Survive program that teaches basic swim survival skills to 4<sup>th</sup> grade students.<sup>26,27</sup> This funding will support phase 3 of 5 in the expansion of the Swim to Survive program to an estimated 12,250 Grade 4 students with a goal of providing this program to all 22,000 Grade 4 students by 2020. Some councillors would like to accelerate the implementation of this program to teach more students these essential survival skills more quickly.

The Budget Committee also added funding to the budget to create up to 20,000 new recreation spaces in registered programs.<sup>28</sup> The current waiting list for registered recreation programs sits at nearly 198,000, an increase of 74% over the past three years.<sup>29</sup> These new spaces are sorely needed but still leave 90% of the residents on the list waiting for service. Children make up the largest group on the waiting list with swimming, camps and sports programs topping the list.<sup>30</sup>

### Parks Plan

The Parks Plan, 2013-2017, was approved by Toronto City Council in 2013. According to the City of Toronto, "the Parks Plan aims to connect people and communities with parks, advance greening and environmental sustainability, improve the quality of parks, and strengthen the parks system as a legacy for Toronto. It builds on work already being done to maintain and improve the parks system, outlines priorities, and will inform policy-making, guide decision-making and define a program of investment."<sup>31</sup>

Based on our analysis, it appears that no new funds have been included in the 2018 city budget to implement the Parks Plan. The city costing report estimated that \$4.842 million would be required to implement the Parks Plan in 2018. These funds would support park improvements across the city. While some of these activities have been referred to the budget process for the Budget Committee (and eventually, all members of council) to

---

<sup>25</sup> *ibid.*

<sup>26</sup> City of Toronto, Budget Committee (2018a, January 23).

<sup>27</sup> City of Toronto, Parks, Forestry and Recreation (no date).

<sup>28</sup> City of Toronto, Budget Committee (2018a, January 23).

<sup>29</sup> City of Toronto, Parks, Forestry and Recreation (no date).

<sup>30</sup> City of Toronto, Parks, Forestry and Recreation (2017, November 6).

<sup>31</sup> City of Toronto, Parks Plan webpage: <https://www.toronto.ca/city-government/accountability-operations-customer-service/long-term-vision-plans-and-strategies/parks-forestry-recreation/parks-plan/>

consider including in the budget, so far none of these new and expanded parks work has been added to the budget.

### Strategic Forest Management Plan

The Strategic Forest Management Plan, 2012-2022, was approved by Toronto City Council in 2013. According to the City of Toronto, “the plan identifies the efforts required to achieve a healthy, sustainable urban forest with the goal of providing 40% canopy cover.”<sup>32</sup> Its goals include increasing canopy cover, achieving equitable distribution, increasing biodiversity, increasing awareness, promoting stewardship, and improving monitoring.

The staff costing document identified the need for \$1.9 million from municipal revenues to expand the tree canopy in 2018. The 2018 budget includes \$5.03 million from reserve accounts, rather than municipal revenues, to support this expansion.

### Toronto Newcomer Strategy

The Toronto Newcomer Strategy “is designed to improve newcomer settlement through shared leadership, stronger collaboration and a more seamless and well-coordinated service system.”<sup>33</sup> This is a strategy that is largely supported through funding from Immigrant, Refugee and Citizenship Canada. However, the city costing report identified the need for \$120,000 from municipal revenues for “additional staffing resources to meet the commitments related to the implementation of the Toronto Newcomer Strategy”.<sup>34</sup> A total of \$137,000 was included in the 2017 budget and has become part of the base budget in 2018 to support this work.<sup>35</sup>

### Toronto Strong Neighbourhoods Strategy

According to the City of Toronto, the Toronto Strong Neighbourhoods Strategy 2020 “is the City of Toronto’s action plan for ensuring that each of our 140 neighbourhoods can succeed and thrive. TSNS 2020 supports healthy communities across Toronto by partnering with residents, businesses and agencies to invest in people, services, programs and

---

<sup>32</sup> City of Toronto, Strategic Forest Management Plan webpage: <https://www.toronto.ca/city-government/accountability-operations-customer-service/long-term-vision-plans-and-strategies/parks-forestry-recreation/strategic-forest-management-plan/>

<sup>33</sup> City of Toronto, Toronto Newcomer Strategy webpage: <https://www.toronto.ca/city-government/accountability-operations-customer-service/long-term-vision-plans-and-strategies/toronto-newcomer-strategy/>

<sup>34</sup> City of Toronto (2017, May 23).

<sup>35</sup> R. Tranjan (personal communication, 2018, February 2).

facilities in 31 specific neighbourhoods. This will strengthen the social, economic and physical conditions and deliver local impact for city-wide change.”<sup>36</sup>

The city costing document indicated a need for an additional \$126,000 to be included in the 2018 budget for implementation of the plan. According to the costing document, these activities include: “32 engagement opportunities for 1600 Residents, 40 employment training workshops; 700 residents engaged in food security activities, 13 Community Hub development projects, 4 District Civic Education Initiatives, Toronto Seniors Forum and Resident Advisories supported.”<sup>37</sup>

The Budget Committee added \$226,100 in new funding to support the Toronto Strong Neighbourhoods Strategy.<sup>38</sup> According to the city budget notes, this funding will “add 2 new CDOs [Community Development Officers] and 1 Community Development Worker [which] will increase staffs' capacity to support a more robust implementation of TSN at the local level by reducing the number of NIAs [Neighbourhood Improvement Areas] per staff to 2-3 and will increase the Program's ability to engage and support resident participation, particularly residents who face multiple barriers to civic participation. The Community Development Worker will support the work of resident bodies such as the Resident Advisory Committee and Toronto Seniors Forum.”<sup>39</sup>

### **TransformTO: Climate Action for a Healthy, Equitable, Prosperous Toronto**

According to the City of Toronto, “TransformTO, Toronto’s new and ambitious climate action plan, identifies how we’ll reduce our greenhouse gas emissions and improve our health, grow our economy, and improve social equity. In July 2017 City Council unanimously approved a set of long-term, low-carbon goals, and strategies to reach them.

Toronto’s greenhouse gas reduction targets, based on 1990 levels:

- 30% by 2020
- 65% by 2030
- 80% by 2050”<sup>40</sup>

---

<sup>36</sup> City of Toronto, Toronto Strong Neighbourhoods Strategy webpage: <https://www.toronto.ca/city-government/data-research-maps/research-reports/social-reports/toronto-strong-neighbourhoods-strategy-2020/>

<sup>37</sup> City of Toronto (2017, May 23).

<sup>38</sup> City of Toronto, Budget Committee (2018a, January 23).

<sup>39</sup> City of Toronto, Social Development, Finance and Administration (no date).

<sup>40</sup> City of Toronto, TransformTO webpage: <https://www.toronto.ca/services-payments/water-environment/environmentally-friendly-city-initiatives/transformto/>



The plan sets out detailed strategies and actions to support the city in achieving these targets.

In the city costing report, staff estimated the 2018 implementation costs at \$6.7 million.<sup>41</sup> An April 2017 city staff report provides a breakdown of the \$6.7 million in strategies.<sup>42</sup> According to our calculations, a total of \$3.3261 million has been allocated to the implementation of TransformTO.<sup>43</sup> This figure is comprised of \$333,000 included in the 2017 city budget to begin hiring staff to implement the plan, an additional \$723,000 built into the 2018 base budget to maintain that hiring complement, and \$2.2701 million added to the 2018 budget by the Budget Committee at its January 23 meeting to advance specific climate action strategies.<sup>44,45</sup>

Since the staff costing report was released in May 2017, several changes have affected the implementation and resourcing of TransformTO.<sup>46,47</sup> While the overarching goals, measurable targets and individual strategies remain unchanged, the method of resourcing some TransformTO strategies has changed. For example, the city is no longer planning to allocate municipal revenues to social housing energy retrofits because the provincial government has committed substantial capital funding that will serve this purpose. In other cases, the City of Toronto is using its capital budget or relying on new provincial funding to advance specific climate action strategies that it had originally planned to fund through municipal revenues in the operating budget.

The city is also changing the timeline for implementation of some strategies due to initial underfunding of TransformTO in 2017. In the 2017 city budget, TransformTO was underfunded; staff requested \$1.55 million in the 2017 budget for hiring employees to begin implementing TransformTO but council only approved \$333,000.<sup>48</sup> For this reason, implementation of some aspects of the plan has been delayed.

This has affected plans for 2018 as well. The revised plan is to stagger hiring of 35 new staff for TransformTO over the next two years (some of whom would have been hired in 2017 if full funding had been provided). The plan is to fill 10 positions in April 2018, 15 in July 2018,

---

<sup>41</sup> City of Toronto (2017, May 23).

<sup>42</sup> City of Toronto (2017, April 20).

<sup>43</sup> Net amount (i.e. from municipal revenues).

<sup>44</sup> City of Toronto (2017, December 15).

<sup>45</sup> City of Toronto, Budget Committee (2018a, January 23).

<sup>46</sup> City of Toronto (2017, December 15).

<sup>47</sup> M. Bekkering (personal communication, 2018, January 22).

<sup>48</sup> City of Toronto (2017, December 15).

and 10 in April 2019.<sup>49</sup> A total of 31 of these 35 new hires will be within the Environment and Energy Division. City staff commented that the division has 70 employees (i.e. full-time equivalent positions) at present and adding an additional 31 in a single year presents an organizational challenge.<sup>50</sup> For this reason, a staggered approach to hiring has been recommended. However, it will result in a delay in new staff coming on board to implement the climate action plan.

Environmental advocates note that city council could add \$1.523 million to the 2018 budget for TransformTO to accelerate three areas of activity to get TransformTO back on track:

- ensure that resources are in place to allow for the hiring of all 35 positions in 2018 (add \$100,000 to hire 10 positions in December 2018 instead of April 2019),
- fully fund the Better Buildings Partnership to support building energy efficiency (add \$776,000 in order to fully fund this activity as originally envisioned), and
- fully fund community engagement activities and Live Green Toronto programs (add \$647,000, including \$317,000 for full funding of community engagement activities and \$330,000 for full funding of Live Green Toronto activities as originally envisioned).

A full investment in community engagement activities and Live Green Toronto will allow community groups and Toronto residents to participate in the wide range of actions including energy efficiency programs, active transportation options, waste reduction activities originally envisioned on the timelines initially approved.

### **TO Prosperity: Toronto Poverty Reduction Strategy (2018 Work Plan)**

According to the City of Toronto, “TO Prosperity: Toronto Poverty Reduction Strategy is a concrete, 20-year plan that was unanimously approved by City Council in 2015. It contains 17 recommendations linked to a set of actions to be carried over a four-year period. Annual work plans identify initiatives that advance actions. The strategy focuses on housing stability, services access, transit equity, food access, the quality of jobs and incomes, and systemic change.”<sup>51</sup>

---

<sup>49</sup> *ibid.*

<sup>50</sup> M. Bekkering (personal communication, 2018, January 22).

<sup>51</sup> City of Toronto, Poverty Reduction Strategy webpage: <https://www.toronto.ca/city-government/accountability-operations-customer-service/long-term-vision-plans-and-strategies/poverty-reduction-strategy/>

In the city costing report, staff estimated the 2018 implementation costs for TO Prosperity at \$38.423 million to support the 2018 work plan.<sup>52</sup>

The implementation costs for the poverty reduction strategy have also been adjusted since last Spring when the city costing report was released. Staff have stated that the cost estimate provided for the May 2017 report was a preliminary calculation. In November 2017, a city staff report provided a cost estimate of \$11.4 million to support the 2018 work plan, a reduction of 70%.<sup>53,54</sup>

The largest portion of the budget included an additional \$29 million to increase the city's operating subsidy to the Toronto Community Housing Corporation (TCHC). However, TCHC reported an operating surplus in 2017; as a result, TCHC did not request these additional funds.<sup>55</sup> The 2018 budget provides a city operating subsidy of \$243.795 million to TCHC which includes \$2.089 million to assist with the loss of federal funding from expired housing agreements.<sup>56</sup> It also maintains a city contribution of \$37.2 million that was provided in 2017 to allow TCHC to respond to operating cost challenges.

The 2018 city budget still includes \$11.4 million in municipal funding for initiatives such as child care expansion<sup>57</sup>, the transit fare equity program<sup>58</sup>, student nutrition program, youth hubs, library service expansion, Toronto Urban Health Fund, new community development initiatives, community paramedic program, equity budgeting, TO Prosperity evaluation, and administration and human resource needs associated with the poverty reduction strategy.<sup>59,60</sup> However, the budget also uses reserve funds and debt funding to support Toronto Community Housing's Tenants First implementation plan including repairs and maintenance to tenant homes.

The city costing document and freedom of information request identified additional poverty reduction initiatives that would require funding in the 2018 budget.<sup>61,62</sup> Staff have

---

<sup>52</sup> City of Toronto (2017, May 23).

<sup>53</sup> City of Toronto (2017, November 15).

<sup>54</sup> Net amount (i.e. from municipal revenues).

<sup>55</sup> R. Tranjan (personal communication, 2018, February 2).

<sup>56</sup> City of Toronto, Shelter, Support and Housing Administration (no date).

<sup>57</sup> More details provided below

<sup>58</sup> More details provided below

<sup>59</sup> City of Toronto, Budget Committee (2018a, January 23).

<sup>60</sup> City of Toronto, Social Development, Finance and Administration and Toronto Employment and Social Services (2017, December 12).

<sup>61</sup> City of Toronto (2017, May 23).

<sup>62</sup> City of Toronto (2017, May 18).

indicated that some of these initiatives are proceeding using existing resources.<sup>63</sup> In other cases, staff will bring forward requests for funding in 2019 and future years.

Originally costed at \$333,700, three initiatives are moving forward using existing resources: AnchorTO, the garbage bag tag program for Toronto's most vulnerable people and a youth employment partnership.<sup>64</sup> AnchorTO was founded by the City of Toronto and the Atkinson Foundation in 2016. It "brings together 'anchor institutions' including universities, colleges, and public service providers that combined spend billions of dollars annually to purchase goods, services, and infrastructure. Working collaboratively and learning from each other, Toronto's anchor institutions are designing social procurement strategies of their own that will support the creation of good jobs, training opportunities, and prosperous businesses in Toronto."<sup>65</sup> According to the 2018 work plan, the city and its partners will "publish a common social procurement framework, the AnchorTO Blueprint, accompanied with action plans from participating institutions; through 2018, AnchorTO will provide outreach and capacity building support to institutions implementing their action plans."<sup>66</sup>

While the 2018 work plan indicates that AnchorTO will be supported with existing resources, city staff during the budget process have indicated the need for additional resources to take this work to the next level and will be bringing forward a request in the final stages of the budget process.<sup>67</sup> Also supported by existing resources, the city is continuing work on its garbage bag tag program for vulnerable residents and a "mobile youth employment service for the most marginalized youth, including a network of 25 youth employment agencies and 10 youth recruitment events".<sup>68</sup>

The 2018 budget includes \$390,000 to fund three new youth hubs at the Downsview, Flemingdon Park and Malvern public libraries.<sup>69,70</sup> According to the City of Toronto, "youth hubs run in the library after school as a safe space for all youth, ages 13-19."<sup>71</sup> These spaces provide homework help with volunteer tutors, a space to hang out, play board or video games and take part in events, programs and workshops. Activities make use of

---

<sup>63</sup> R. Tranjan (personal communication, 2018, February 2).

<sup>64</sup> *ibid.*

<sup>65</sup> City of Toronto (2016).

<sup>66</sup> City of Toronto (2017, November).

<sup>67</sup> City of Toronto, Budget Committee (2018b, January 23).

<sup>68</sup> City of Toronto (2017, November).

<sup>69</sup> City of Toronto, Budget Committee (2018a, January 23).

<sup>70</sup> City of Toronto, Toronto Public Library (no date).

<sup>71</sup> City of Toronto, Toronto Public Library webpage:  
<https://www.torontopubliclibrary.ca/services/youth-hubs.jsp>

youth hub equipment including “laptops, digital cameras, DJ equipment, and Virtual Reality (VR) headsets.”

The freedom of information request document indicated that an additional \$260,300 would be required in 2018 for two more youth hubs and \$104,100 for standardization of youth hub staffing and programming.<sup>72</sup> These funds were not requested in the 2018 budget and are expected to be brought forward to the budget process in future years as part of the multi-year expansion plan for youth hubs.<sup>73</sup>

### **Fair (Transit) Pass Program**

According to the City of Toronto, “on December 14, 2016, City Council adopted the Fair Pass Program, a major step in making public transit more affordable to low-income Torontonians. The program will be implemented in three phases beginning in March 2018 (subject to approval by Council as part of the 2018 Operating Budget) which is when Metrolinx anticipates that PRESTO will be fully implemented on all TTC vehicles and at all station entry points and will have the software capabilities to program discounts on selected cards.

- Phase 1 – starting in March 2018 – includes Ontario Disability Support Program and Ontario Works clients not in receipt of transportation supports.
- Phase 2 – starting in March 2019 – extends eligibility to residents receiving housing supports or child-care fee subsidies whose household income fall under the Low-Income Measure +15% eligibility threshold.
- Phase 3 – starting in March 2020 – extends eligibility to all other Toronto residents living with an income below the Low Income Measure +15% eligibility threshold

The discount under Fair Pass for those eligible is:

- 33 per cent for the adult single TTC Presto fare; and,
- 21 per cent for the adult monthly pass.”<sup>74</sup>

The Fair Pass Program is a critical component of the city’s poverty reduction strategy. The city is on track to implementing the first phase of the program. On January 23, 2018, the Budget Committee added \$4.6 million to the 2018 budget to fund Phase 1 of the program,

---

<sup>72</sup> City of Toronto (2017, May 18).

<sup>73</sup> R. Tranjan (personal communication, 2018, February 2).

<sup>74</sup> City of Toronto, Toronto Fair Pass Program internet archive:

<https://web.archive.org/web/20170727192303/https://www1.toronto.ca/wps/portal/contentonly?vgnextoid=826519fc366d2510VgnVCM10000071d60f89RCRD&vgnextchannel=a67aa457bc09a510VgnVCM10000071d60f89RCRD>

consistent with the costed amount included in the May 2017 staff report.<sup>75,76</sup> Phase 1 is expected to be implemented in August 2018.

### Child Care Growth Strategy

In 2017, Toronto City Council adopted its 10-year Child Care Growth Strategy. According to the City of Toronto, “the Strategy envisions a licensed child care system that can serve 50 per cent of children aged 0-4 by 2026. Achieving this vision requires significant investment from all three orders of government in terms of creating approximately 30,000 new licensed spaces and making investments in affordability for all families.”<sup>77</sup> The vision for the plan seeks to “build capacity to meet demand, improve affordability for families, and support a thriving workforce”.<sup>78</sup>

Toronto City Council has a long-standing commitment to contribute 20% of funding for child care expansion. When the provincial and federal governments contribute funds to child care expansion, the city will add its 20% to support the growth of the system. In the city’s costing document, staff estimated that the City of Toronto would contribute \$4.6 million from municipal revenues in the 2018 budget as its 20% contribution.<sup>79</sup> This figure was based on estimates of the provincial and federal contribution anticipated for child care expansion.

New provincial and federal funding for child care expansion ended up being more than anticipated at a total of nearly \$46 million for 2018.<sup>80</sup> The city’s 20% contribution equates to \$11.2 million. Instead of contributing the full 20% in 2018, the city plans to contribute \$2 million in 2018, and defer the remainder, with an additional \$7.6 million in 2019, and an additional \$1.6 million in 2020. Each year’s contribution will become part of the base budget in future years. The initial \$2 million in 2018 will be used for one-time capital costs to build Indigenous child care spaces.<sup>81</sup> In 2019, \$2 million will be used for capital and \$7.6 million for child care subsidies, and in 2020, \$1.6 million will be used for capital with the remaining \$9.6 million designated for child care subsidies. In future years, all \$11.2 million will be used for child care subsidies.

---

<sup>75</sup> City of Toronto, Budget Committee (2018a, January 23).

<sup>76</sup> City of Toronto (2017, May 23).

<sup>77</sup> City of Toronto, Children’s Services (2017, March 30).

<sup>78</sup> City of Toronto, Children’s Services (2017, April).

<sup>79</sup> City of Toronto (2017, May 23).

<sup>80</sup> City of Toronto, Budget Committee (2018a, January 23).

<sup>81</sup> S. McNamee (personal communication, 2018, January 29).



The 2018 budget includes funding for 825 new child care subsidies.<sup>82</sup> According to our calculations based on city budget documents, if \$2 million were used for capital and \$9.2 million to create new child care subsidies in 2018, this would result in over 600 new child care subsidies in addition to the 825 approved new subsidies included in the budget. City staff commented that the current system cannot absorb that many new subsidies in one year; new centres and spaces are required for families to utilize new subsidies, beyond the additional 825 subsidies already committed in the 2018 budget.<sup>83</sup> For this reason, the recommendation is to apply the city's 20% contribution to child care over three years.

Toronto families face serious challenges to accessing high quality and affordable child care. Over 12,000 children are on the city's waiting list for subsidized child care.<sup>84</sup> Low-income families are not alone in struggling with costly child care fees. Recent research confirms that Toronto has the highest child care fees in the country<sup>85</sup>; fees are unaffordable for over 75% of Toronto families.<sup>86</sup> In light of the urgent need, advocates are urging city council to find ways to include the full \$11.2 million in the 2018 budget to improve child care for Toronto families now.

### **Housing Opportunities Toronto**

According to the City of Toronto, "in August 2009 City Council endorsed Housing Opportunities Toronto: An Affordable Housing Action Plan 2010 - 2020. HOT has served as the roadmap to guide federal, provincial and City investments, as well as public- and private-sector activity across the full spectrum of housing need in Toronto – from supportive housing for homeless persons to the repair and revitalization of existing rental housing to assisting low-income homeowners to remain in their homes."<sup>87</sup>

The city costing document identifies Housing Opportunities Toronto (HOT) as a component of the city's plans and strategies directed at poverty reduction; however, it does not include a specific dollar figure for implementation of the HOT plan in 2018. The HOT plan has largely relied on funding from the provincial and federal governments to advance HOT targets. Since the inception of the HOT plan, this funding has been in short supply.

---

<sup>82</sup> City of Toronto, Budget Committee (2018a, January 23).

<sup>83</sup> S. McNamee (personal communication, 2018, January 29).

<sup>84</sup> City of Toronto, Toronto Progress Portal webpage: <https://www.toronto.ca/city-government/data-research-maps/toronto-progress-portal/>

<sup>85</sup> Macdonald & Friendly (2017).

<sup>86</sup> City of Toronto, Children's Services (2017, April).

<sup>87</sup> City of Toronto, Affordable Housing Office and Shelter, Support and Housing Administration (2015, February 19).

The plan sets out various targets for improving housing affordability and conditions in Toronto, including a commitment of creating 1,000 new units of affordable rental housing per year. However, in the first five years of the HOT plan, the city created only 2,792 new units of affordable rental housing.<sup>88</sup> At present, there are over 1,700 units of affordable rental housing in development; however, only 525 are expected to be completed in 2018 as new housing developments take approximately 3-5 years to complete.<sup>89</sup> The HOT plan has never delivered on its commitment to complete 1,000 new affordable rental units in a single year and is projecting to be over 5,000 units short of its 10-year target of 10,000 new units by 2020.

Meanwhile, the waiting list for social housing has surpassed 100,000 households in Toronto.<sup>90</sup> In fact, the waiting list grew by over 3,500 households for each of the past two years, three and a half times the unmet HOT target.<sup>91,92</sup> The city's current pace of creating new affordable housing does not come close to keeping up with the growth of the social housing wait list or the growing need for emergency shelter.

The city's homelessness crisis is, in part, a consequence of the failure of the HOT plan to produce critically-needed affordable housing. The homeless shelter system is left overcrowded and unable to meet the need.<sup>93</sup> There is an increasing reliance on overnight spaces, such as Out of the Cold programs, Winter Respite spaces and 24-hour drop-ins, that do not meet the city's shelter standards.<sup>94</sup>

The city needs to move simultaneously on two tracks: create more affordable and supportive housing and ensure that the shelter system is expanded and properly supported to address the critical need for shelter and meet the 90% occupancy target. However, the city has no plan to catch up on its affordable housing target and has made no progress, so far, in lowering occupancy rates on shelters.

Bold action from all orders of government is required immediately. Strong community advocacy has driven Toronto City Council to increase funding for shelters and homeless

---

<sup>88</sup> *ibid.*

<sup>89</sup> City of Toronto, Affordable Housing Office (no date).

<sup>90</sup> City of Toronto, Toronto Progress Portal webpage: <https://www.toronto.ca/city-government/data-research-maps/toronto-progress-portal/>

<sup>91</sup> *ibid.*

<sup>92</sup> Comparing 4<sup>th</sup> quarter 2017 to 4<sup>th</sup> quarter 2016, and 4 quarter 2016 to 4<sup>th</sup> quarter 2015.

<sup>93</sup> Pagliaro, J. (2018, January 31).

<sup>94</sup> Health Providers Against Poverty (2018).

services in the 2018 budget; however, the budget aims to create new shelters to add 1,000 new beds over a three-year period, but many argue urgent needs are occurring now.<sup>95</sup>

### Middle Childhood Strategy

In 2012, “working in partnership with the community, the City developed a Middle Childhood Strategy - an action plan to move toward a system of accessible, high-quality before- and after-school programs for children in middle childhood. The Strategy is accompanied by the Toronto Middle Childhood Strategy Implementation Plan, which contains goals and actions approved by City Council.”<sup>96</sup>

The staff costing report calculated the 2018 implementation cost for the strategy at \$3.4 million from municipal revenues. These funds were intended to increase child care fee subsidies for middle years children, aged 6-12.<sup>97</sup>

At the Executive Committee meeting on February 6, \$5.474 million in new federal funding was added to the budget to create 550 new child care fee subsidies for kindergarten and school-age children.<sup>98</sup> However, no municipal funds were added for this purpose.

In our *Demographic Change in Toronto's Neighbourhoods* report, we note: “For middle years children, many families lack access to out-of-school time programs, including programs provided before and after school and during holidays and summer vacations. Families also have problems finding affordable program spaces among the patchwork of available services. In 2015, the City reported that 66% of elementary schools had a middle childhood program.<sup>99</sup> These schools provided 664 programs with 25,145 spaces, serving only 14% of children aged 6-12 in Toronto ... access to middle childhood programs is not equitable across the city with the lowest levels of access in Wards 7, 10, 16, 35, 37, 38 and 41 located in North York and Scarborough. Notably, neighbourhoods with the largest number and highest concentrations of middle years children are located in the inner suburbs and within city wards with below average access to middle childhood programs.”<sup>100</sup>

It remains a concern that the Middle Childhood Strategy has no dedicated funding source. Progress on this strategy is largely reliant on new federal or provincial funding that can be

---

<sup>95</sup> *ibid.*

<sup>96</sup> City of Toronto, Middle Childhood internet archive: <https://web.archive.org/web/20170726081929/https://www1.toronto.ca/wps/portal/contentonly?vgnextoid=d64ad25ed83ae310VgnVCM10000071d60f89RCRD>

<sup>97</sup> City of Toronto (2017, May 23).

<sup>98</sup> S. McNamee (personal communication, 2018, January 29).

<sup>99</sup> City of Toronto, Children's Services (2015).

<sup>100</sup> Social Planning Toronto (2017).

applied for middle childhood programming. Advocates are calling for the city to dedicate more municipal resources to advance the strategy for this often overlooked group. Resources should be provided to expand middle years programs, particularly in the underserved inner suburbs.

### **Seniors Strategy 1.0**

In 2013, Toronto City Council unanimously adopted the Toronto Seniors Strategy. The strategy was created through extensive community consultation, particularly with seniors and senior-focused organizations. It identifies 8 key themes of age-friendliness, major concerns for seniors within each theme, recommendations, actions and an accountability framework to assess progress.<sup>101</sup> The Toronto Seniors Strategy relies on support from all orders of government and intersects with various complementary city plans and strategies. The City of Toronto is currently working on Toronto Seniors Strategy 2.0, an update to the initial strategy.

According to the city costing document, \$650,000 is needed for implementation of the Toronto Seniors Strategy in 2018.<sup>102</sup> This funding would support a community paramedic program as well as reduce the dental care waiting list for seniors by 3,000. The budget includes funding to expand the paramedic program but at the time of publication of this report, it was unclear whether the expansion of the seniors dental program had been included.<sup>103</sup>

### **Youth Equity Strategy**

According to the City of Toronto, “the Toronto Youth Equity Strategy was developed with contributions from Toronto youth and was adopted by City Council in February 2014. The Toronto Youth Equity Strategy identifies 28 key issues faced by youth most vulnerable to involvement in violence and crime that the City and its partners must address.”<sup>104</sup>

The city costing document identified the need for \$118,000 in the 2018 budget to support the implementation of this strategy.<sup>105</sup> These funds would be used to support a variety of youth-focused programs and initiatives in the areas of educational attainment, counselling

---

<sup>101</sup> City of Toronto (2013).

<sup>102</sup> City of Toronto (2017, May 23).

<sup>103</sup> City of Toronto, Budget Committee (2018a, January 23).

<sup>104</sup> City of Toronto, Toronto Youth Equity Strategy webpage: <https://www.toronto.ca/city-government/accountability-operations-customer-service/long-term-vision-plans-and-strategies/toronto-youth-equity-strategy/>

<sup>105</sup> City of Toronto (2017, May 23).

and support, community engagement, employment, service access, and specific supports for youth leaving incarceration. The budget includes only \$92,000 in one-time funding to support this work but will require additional dedicated funds in future years.<sup>106</sup>

The 2018 budget includes a cut to the Ambassador Program with a plan to eliminate the city's full \$50,000 contribution to this program in 2019.<sup>107</sup> According to the City of Toronto, "the Ambassador Program supports 10-15 youths annually to obtain high school credits while supporting them in learning life-skills and sharing their stories to help prevent younger youth from engaging in risk behavior. This Program is managed by Pape Adolescent Resource Centre (PARC) which is a joint program of the Children's Aid societies."

The City of Toronto is not required by the provincial government to deliver this program, as is the case for many other public health programs. Toronto Public Health is proposing to eliminate the program as a measure to meet council's budget freeze. The budget notes indicate that "this proposal will have a negative impact on youth from equity-seeking and vulnerable groups, who are the primary participants of this program. It will decrease access to education and training and these students' opportunities to complete their high school diploma."<sup>108</sup>

Eliminating the Ambassador Program contradicts the city's commitment to marginalized and vulnerable youth expressed through the Toronto Youth Equity Strategy. It is an inexpensive and effective program that should be supported and perhaps expanded, rather than sacrificed for the bottom line.

### **TTC Ridership Growth Strategy (2018-2022)**

The TTC Ridership Growth Strategy is a significant new plan to increase public transit ridership. This strategy was adopted by the TTC Board on January 25, 2018.<sup>109,110</sup> As a recent strategy, it was not part of the city staff report that detailed the 2018 implementation costs for several council-approved strategies and service plans.<sup>111</sup> The strategies and actions outlined in the plan aim to:

- retain current customers
- increase transit rides per current customer

---

<sup>106</sup> R. Tranjan (personal communication, 2018, February 2).

<sup>107</sup> City of Toronto, Toronto Public Health (no date).

<sup>108</sup> *ibid.*

<sup>109</sup> Toronto Transit Commission (2018, January 25).

<sup>110</sup> Spurr, B. (2018, January 25).

<sup>111</sup> City of Toronto (2017, May 23).

- attract new customers to the system<sup>112</sup>

The plan identifies the need to improve service and address overcrowding, as one set of actions essential to realizing TTC ridership goals.

The 2018 budget includes \$1 million to “bring bus overcrowding to 30% above the current overcrowding standard for non-peak hours”.<sup>113</sup> This small measure will only take effect in September 2018, affecting the ‘worst of the worst’ bus routes during non-peak hours, but still leaving them to operate well-above TTC crowding standards. Last week, transit riders witnessed dangerous levels of overcrowding on the subway system. On a routine basis, riders are left waiting, unable to get on packed buses, streetcars and subway cars. With these service challenges, it is no wonder that transit ridership numbers have remained flat for most of the past decade. Advocates are calling for more investment, delivered sooner to reduce transit waiting times, make a significant improvement in service levels, and reduce overcrowding.

City staff calculate that \$12.5 million would be required to improve service levels to address overcrowding.<sup>114</sup> However, staff have stated that the TTC does not have the infrastructure to increase service levels and will only be able to begin this process in September on bus routes. Transit advocates are urging council to dedicate the required funds and re-examine this issue to find ways to improve overcrowding as soon as possible.

## BUDGET PROCESS OBSERVATIONS

Through this analysis, we have identified critical issues to inform this year’s budget and future directions.

### The Impact of Council Direction on the Budget & the Budget Process

Each year, the Mayor and Toronto City Council provide directions to city staff on the development of the annual city budget. In past years, council has directed staff to cut agency, board and divisional budgets. For example, in 2017, staff were directed to cut their budgets by 2.6%. This year, the direction was to freeze budgets, which has the effect of a cut because divisions must either cut services or find efficiencies in order to absorb inflationary costs and other cost pressures to maintain existing service levels.

Council also sets directions on property tax increases. In recent years, including in 2018, the residential property tax increase was set at inflation before any decisions were made about funding needs to maintain and expand services. This year’s residential property tax

---

<sup>112</sup> Toronto Transit Commission (2018).

<sup>113</sup> City of Toronto, Budget Committee (2018a, January 23).

<sup>114</sup> City of Toronto, Toronto Transit Commission (2018, January 12).



increase is an inflationary increase of 2.1%. By setting the residential increase at inflation, this has the effect of setting the overall rate below the rate of inflation because non-residential property taxes are increased at a lower rate than residential property taxes.

These directions set the stage for austerity budgets that underfund critical public services. They also send a strong message to city staff to limit their funding requests irrespective of the needs in the communities. Council-approved strategies and service plans are under-resourced and plans are delayed in the name of maintaining the lowest property taxes in the province and meeting budget targets that may not reflect service needs.

It is difficult for staff or for council to adequately address service needs in this context. Supporting public priorities would be easier to achieve with a reversal in the budget process: start with goals and objectives for the city and an identification of key priorities, adopt strategies and plans to realize these goals, set measurable targets and timelines, and then analyze the costs and decide the most equitable ways to fund the work of city building.

### **No Guarantee that Council-Approved Strategies and Service Plans Will Be Properly Funded**

With the current budget process, council, often enthusiastically and unanimously, approves city strategies and service plans to expand programs and services, improve service quality and access, and address critical needs in the city. These plans and strategies are often created through extensive community engagement and set out an important vision for a better city for all.

However, the funds required to implement the plans and strategies may not even be allocated, limiting the impact of the passage of these policies. Instead, each year, council reconsiders whether to fund these 'new and enhanced' programs and services and what level of funding will be provided through the budget process after the plans are adopted. For example, council approved a 5-year Student Nutrition Program to support school snack and meal programs in high needs areas.<sup>115</sup> However, each year, the preliminary budget did not include the funds to implement the program, and community members had to advocate to have these funds added to the budget. One year, the plan was underfunded resulting in a redraft of the plan into a 6-year plan. Similarly, Housing Opportunities Toronto set out to build 10,000 units of affordable rental housing over 10 years but has rarely even built half that amount, despite redefining the definition of "affordable" to make

---

<sup>115</sup> City of Toronto, Student Nutrition Program webpage: <https://www.toronto.ca/community-people/health-wellness-care/health-programs-advice/student-nutrition-program/>

the target easier to reach, and has not allocated the resources that would be needed to enable the program to make up the shortfall.

The public is poorly served by a process that purports to adopt strategies to solve significant problems but then retracts those commitments when the time comes to allocate the resources that makes them a reality. Community groups and residents who have to advocate first for a strong plan to address an urgent community need, and then, year after year, for the council-approved plan to be resourced properly are also poorly served by this process. A commitment to transparency and accountability would suggest an alternate system.

### **Unsustainable Funding Sources Used to Resource Council-Approved Plans and Strategies**

On January 23, the Budget Committee voted to fund several new and enhanced programs and services, many activities necessary for advancing council-approved strategies and plans.<sup>116</sup> Some councillors raised concerns about the type of funding used to resource this work. A total of \$13.888 million was drawn from the Tax Rate Stabilization Reserve, which is not a sustainable revenue source.<sup>117</sup> Any attempt to maintain these services using of one-time draws from reserve accounts will create financial challenges in future years.

New and enhanced services will also be supported through property tax revenues from assessment growth (i.e. new residential and non-residential properties) and increases in projected revenues from the Municipal Land Transfer Tax. Some councillors have made the case that revenues from assessment growth should be used to service those new neighbourhoods and developments not fill holes in the budget. Similarly, several councillors have questioned the level of reliance on the Municipal Land Transfer Tax (MLTT). Revenues from the MLTT are dependent on activity in the real estate market. Toronto has experienced a red-hot real estate market for several years but observers note that performance has to slow at some point, something current market trends suggest may be occurring soon. The City of Toronto may be left with diminished revenues and a gaping hole in its budget as a result of its high reliance on this single revenue tool and overly optimistic revenue projections from the MLTT.

Reliance on certain user fees such as high public transit fares and recreation program fees has also been seen as a regressive funding approach for providing vital city services. On the positive side, this year's budget includes a public transit fare freeze, a rare moment where year after year fare increases are commonplace. The budget also includes funding for phase 1 of the Fair Transit Pass Program, a discount fare program for low-income

---

<sup>116</sup> City of Toronto, Budget Committee (2018a, January 23).

<sup>117</sup> *ibid.*

residents. With transit fares out of reach for many low-income residents, the Fair Transit Pass Program is an important new initiative for increasing access to this critical service.

On the other hand, as has been the case for many years, recreation user fees are set to rise again this year. Fees will rise by 2.12%<sup>118</sup> - an increase that is more than that proposed for residential property taxes. Recreation advocates have called for a re-examination of funding approaches to support community access to recreation for all.

### Opportunities to Support Council-Approved Strategies and Service Plans in 2018 Budget

There's still time to act to invest in critical programs to serve Toronto residents. Toronto City Council meets for final votes on the 2018 budget on February 12 and 13. The Mayor and Toronto City Council can choose to fully fund and support its strategies and service plans. We set out recommendations and discuss funding options in the section below.

## RECOMMENDATIONS

### Fully Fund and Support Council-Approved Strategies and Service Plans in the 2018 Budget

We recommend that Toronto City Council add \$36.2 million to the 2018 operating budget in order to advance key council-approved strategies and service plans, address serious challenges affecting Toronto residents, and improve quality of life in the city. Further, we recommend that the city double its target for new affordable rental housing development to approve at least 2,000 new units in 2018. If revenues from development charges and other fees are insufficient to cover the cost, an additional \$35 million in debt funding could be used to support this work. Figure 3 summarizes our recommended increases for each strategy and service plan based on the preceding analysis.

**Figure 3. Recommended Increases to Fully Fund and Support Council-Approved Strategies and Service Plans in 2018**

Strategy/Service Plan	Recommended Increase for 2018 Budget (net \$; millions)	Details
Recreation Service Plan	\$5.3775	Fully fund remaining recreation service plan initiatives including youth leadership program, community

<sup>118</sup> City of Toronto, Parks, Forestry and Recreation (no date).

		development with youth and seniors, compliance with disability legislation, recreation centre maintenance standards; fund Toronto Leadership Program as originally costed
Parks Plan	\$4.842	Fully fund 2018 parks plan to improve quality of parks and park maintenance across city
TransformTO	\$1.523	Hire full complement of 35 staff to implement climate action plan; fully fund Better Building Partnership, community engagement and Live Green Toronto programs as originally costed
TO Prosperity	\$0.3644	Open an additional 2 youth hubs and standardize youth hub staffing and programming across all sites as originally costed
Child Care Growth Strategy	\$9.2	Invest full 20% city contribution in child care system in 2018
Housing Opportunities Toronto	\$35.0*	HOT plan target calls for 10,000 new affordable rental units by 2019 but city projects fewer than half will be built. In light of this, we recommend that the city double its annual target for the remaining years of the plan; city projects 1,000 new approvals annually; additional funds would increase target to 2,000 units for 2018; we also recommend that the city accelerate the creation of new permanent shelter beds
Middle Childhood Strategy	\$3.4	Expand subsidies for children 6-12 years as originally costed
Youth Equity Strategy	\$.006	Reverse proposed cut and elimination of Ambassador Program for marginalized youth consistent with goals of youth equity strategy
TTC Ridership Growth Strategy	\$11.5	Improve service levels and eliminate overcrowding during on- and off-peak hours to advance growth strategy

TOTAL	\$36.2129	Not including housing costs; see note below
*As it does for shelter expansion, the city could use debt funding rather operating budget funds to finance new affordable rental housing. The city would also provide incentives to support this development e.g. breaks on development charges and future property taxes as per the Mayor's Open Door Program. The 10-year capital plan already includes funds for new emergency shelters. We are recommending that implementation be accelerated to get new permanent beds online as soon as possible.		

### Paying for Council-Approved Plans and Strategies

Toronto City Council could adjust the proposed residential property tax increase from 2.1% to 3.35% (and make comparable adjustments to non-residential property taxes). For the average homeowner with a house valued at \$624,418, this adjustment would amount to approximately an additional \$35 on their 2018 property tax bill (or 67¢ per week) to support critically-needed programs and services. Alternatively, council could adopt one or more revenue tools available through the City of Toronto Act or raise revenues through a combination of property taxes and revenue tools.

Perhaps, the easiest course of action would be to reduce the amount of revenue that the city plans to transfer into the capital budget (i.e. capital from current). The preliminary budget proposes to move \$373 million in revenues from the operating budget, which funds programs, into the capital budget. This is an increase of \$62 million over the 2017 budget.<sup>119</sup> Instead, council could transfer \$337 million into capital, an increase of \$26 million over the 2017 budget, and use \$36 million in revenues to support council-approved strategies and service plans. Perhaps, one place to cut back on the capital side would be the hefty price tag of \$2.3 billion for the Gardiner Expressway rebuild.<sup>120</sup> Shaving 1.6% off the cost of the Gardiner would take care of the unfunded budget priorities identified in this report.

### Change the Budget Process and the Funding Process for Council-Approved Plans and Strategies

The new city council should work with community groups and residents to change the budget process to ensure that vision and priorities council adopts provide the starting point for budget development, that strategies approved by council are incorporated in the budget, and decisions regarding property taxes and revenue sources follow from

<sup>119</sup> City of Toronto (2017, November 30).

<sup>120</sup> City of Toronto, Transportation Services (no date).

community priorities. When council approves a strategy or service plan, it should be funded accordingly.

Community members are frustrated by a budget process that sets up a situation of competition for funding to resource critical and underfunded public services. Council has a variety of revenue tools available; it has undergone several rounds of debate but has been unwilling to adopt additional tools to resource services to meet community need. With many urgent issues facing Toronto residents, council needs to decide how to fund necessary services and take action.

### **Ensure Clear and Measurable Targets and Timelines for Council-Approved Strategies and Service Plans, and Dedicate Funds for Evaluation and Community Reporting**

The stated purpose of city plans and strategies is to achieve a variety of positive outcomes for Toronto residents, such as an expansion of affordable and supportive housing, a reduction in poverty and homelessness, and lower child care fees. To assess the effectiveness of these plans and strategies, we need clear targets and timelines, monitoring and community reporting, and opportunities to re-evaluate and adjust direction to ensure that goals are met. Community engagement is central to all of this work. City plans and strategies vary in the degree to which they meet these requirements. Community advisory tables can provide important insight and direction to shape this work and act as external accountability mechanism for council commitments. The public is poorly served by any process that adopts strategies that fail to include mechanisms for determining if the stated goals are being met, and no system for course correction when the program is failing to meet established objectives.

### **Tackle the Big Issues**

Toronto is the child poverty capital of Canada, disproportionately impacting Indigenous, racialized and newcomer communities and lone mother-led families<sup>121</sup>; social exclusion and inequality are on the rise, illustrated by growing polarization between neighbourhoods and adversity and marginalization experienced by Indigenous, racialized and immigrant communities<sup>122</sup>; youth unemployment is double the rate of the overall population and for some racialized groups, rates are even higher affecting more than one in five young

---

<sup>121</sup> Polanyi, Wilson, Mustachi, Ekra & Kerr (2017).

<sup>122</sup> United Way Toronto & York Region and Neighbourhood Change Research Partnership (2017).

people<sup>123,124</sup>; we have the highest child care fees in the country<sup>125</sup>; our social housing waiting list sets records month after month, now surpassing 100,000 households<sup>126</sup>; our shelter system is bursting at the seams, leaving our most vulnerable neighbours to crowd into make-shift shelters that don't meet city standards<sup>127</sup>; the waiting list for recreation programs has soared to nearly 200,000<sup>128</sup>; underfunding of our public transit system has, at best, left transit riders waiting for the next bus, train or streetcar and at worst, presented dangerous levels of overcrowding<sup>129,130</sup>; the global crisis of climate change demands action at the local, regional, national and international levels<sup>131</sup>, and the list goes on.

We need firm, clear action to move us forward, to tackle our most pressing challenges that impact the people of Toronto. Too often, council action has consisted of limited efforts towards minor change, that are in the end not fully implemented. For Toronto to succeed, council members, now and in the future, will need to commit to meaningful action and deliver on it, with clear accountability for the implementation and effectiveness of the policies and strategies they adopt.

## CONCLUSION

Now is the time for the Mayor and Toronto City Council to fully fund and support council-approved strategies and service plans to address serious challenges affecting Toronto residents and improve quality of life in Toronto. Council has options available to fund these critical programs and services. We urge the Mayor and Toronto City Council to make good on its promises to the people of Toronto and support its council-approved strategies and service plans in the 2018 city budget.

---

<sup>123</sup> Statistics Canada (2018).

<sup>124</sup> According to the 2016 census, the unemployment rate for the Toronto CMA is 7.7% compared to 16.7% for 20-24 year olds. For racialized youth aged 20-24, the unemployment rate is 18.6% and over 20% for Arab, Black, Chinese and Japanese young people in the Toronto CMA.

<sup>125</sup> Macdonald & Friendly (2017).

<sup>126</sup> City of Toronto, Toronto Progress Portal webpage: <https://www.toronto.ca/city-government/data-research-maps/toronto-progress-portal/>

<sup>127</sup> Health Providers Against Poverty (2018).

<sup>128</sup> City of Toronto, Parks, Forestry and Recreation (no date).

<sup>129</sup> Spurr, B. (2017, October 31).

<sup>130</sup> Moore, O. (2018, January 30).

<sup>131</sup> City of Toronto, Toronto Energy Efficiency Office (2007).



## REFERENCES

City of Toronto (2017, December 15). 2018 Operating Budget Briefing Note: TransformTO 2018 Operating Budget Request. <https://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2017/bu/bgrd/backgroundfile-109987.pdf>

City of Toronto (2017, November 30). 2018 Preliminary Operating Budget & 2018-2027 Capital Budget & Plan. Presentation. Toronto, Ontario. <https://www.toronto.ca/wp-content/uploads/2018/01/8d94-2018-Budget-Launch-Final.pdf>

City of Toronto (2017, November 15). TO Prosperity: Toronto Poverty Reduction Strategy, 2017 Report and 2018 Work Plan. Staff report. Toronto, Ontario. <https://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2017/ex/bgrd/backgroundfile-109105.pdf>

City of Toronto (2017, November). Appendix B: Poverty Reduction Strategy 2018 Work Plan. EX29.12. Toronto, Ontario. <https://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2017/ex/bgrd/backgroundfile-109110.pdf>

City of Toronto (2017, May 23). 2018 Implementation Costs for Various Approved Service Plans. Staff report. Toronto, Ontario. <https://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2017/cc/bgrd/backgroundfile-104105.pdf>

City of Toronto (2017, May 18). Budget Committee request for 2018 estimates. Freedom of Information request.

City of Toronto (2017, April 20). TransformTO: Climate Action for a Healthy, Equitable and Prosperous Toronto – Report #2 – The Pathway to a Low Carbon Future. Staff report. Toronto, Ontario. <https://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2017/pe/bgrd/backgroundfile-103086.pdf>

City of Toronto (2016). Toronto Poverty Reduction Strategy: Year 1 Report to the Community. Toronto, Ontario. <https://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2016/ex/bgrd/backgroundfile-98562.pdf>

City of Toronto (2013). The Toronto Seniors Strategy: Towards an Age-Friendly City. Toronto, Ontario. <https://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2013/cd/bgrd/backgroundfile-57326.pdf>

City of Toronto, Affordable Housing Office (2017, September). Affordable Housing Office 2017 Mid-Year Report: New affordable homes approved, completed and repaired. Toronto, Ontario. <https://www.toronto.ca/wp-content/uploads/2017/11/8e82-AHO-Summary-for-HOT-TargetsCompletions-September-2017-Final.pdf>

City of Toronto, Affordable Housing Office (no date). 2018 City of Toronto Budget Notes: Affordable Housing Office. Toronto, Ontario. [https://www.toronto.ca/wp-content/uploads/2017/12/94c8-AHO-Operating\\_Budget\\_Notes-V3.pdf](https://www.toronto.ca/wp-content/uploads/2017/12/94c8-AHO-Operating_Budget_Notes-V3.pdf)

City of Toronto, Affordable Housing Office and Shelter, Support and Housing Administration (2015, February 19). Housing Opportunities Toronto 2010-2020 Five Year Review. Staff report. Toronto, Ontario. <https://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2015/ex/bgrd/backgroundfile-77989.pdf>

City of Toronto, Budget Committee (2018a, January 23). Budget Committee Minutes of January 23, 2018. Toronto, Ontario. <http://app.toronto.ca/tmmis/viewAgendaItemHistory.do?item=2018.BU41.1>

City of Toronto, Budget Committee (2018b, January 23). Budget Committee proceedings. Video, Part 1 of 2. <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=o--Eoy-agGE>

City of Toronto, Children's Services (2017, April). Toronto's Licensed Child Care Growth Strategy for Children Under 4: 2017-2026. Toronto, Ontario.

<https://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2017/cd/bgrd/backgroundfile-102626.pdf>

City of Toronto, Children's Services (2017, March 30). Toronto's Child Care Growth Strategy. Staff report. <https://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2017/cd/bgrd/backgroundfile-102452.pdf>

City of Toronto, Children's Services (2015). Toronto Children's Services 2015-2019 Service Plan. Toronto, Ontario. <https://www.toronto.ca/wp-content/uploads/2017/11/8fee-children-services-service-plan-2015-2019.pdf>

City of Toronto, Parks, Forestry and Recreation (2017, November 6). Community Recreation 2018-2020 Growth Plan and Waitlist Management. Toronto, Ontario.

<https://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2017/cd/bgrd/backgroundfile-108888.pdf>

City of Toronto, Parks, Forestry and Recreation (no date). 2018 City of Toronto Budget Notes: Parks, Forestry and Recreation. Toronto, Ontario. <https://www.toronto.ca/wp-content/uploads/2017/12/8deb-PFR-2018-Op-Budget-Notes-V2.pdf>

City of Toronto, Shelter, Support and Housing Administration (no date). 2018 City of Toronto Budget Notes: Shelter, Support and Housing Administration. Toronto, Ontario. <https://www.toronto.ca/wp-content/uploads/2017/12/95ff-SSHA-2018-Op-Budget-Notes-V3.pdf>

City of Toronto, Social Development, Finance and Administration (no date). 2018 City of Toronto Budget Notes: Social Development, Finance and Administration. Toronto, Ontario.

<https://www.toronto.ca/wp-content/uploads/2017/12/860e-SDFA-2018-Op-Budget-Notes-V3.pdf>

City of Toronto, Social Development, Finance and Administration and Toronto Employment and Social Services (2017, December 12). TO Prosperity: Toronto Poverty Reduction Strategy 2017 Report and 2018 Work Plan. Toronto, Ontario.

<https://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2017/ex/bgrd/backgroundfile-109105.pdf>

City of Toronto, Toronto Energy Efficiency Office (2007). Change is in the Air - Climate change, clean air and sustainable energy action plan: Moving from framework to action, phase 1. Toronto, Ontario.

[https://www1.toronto.ca/City%20Of%20Toronto/Environment%20and%20Energy/Programs%20for%20Residents/Files/pdf/C/clean\\_air\\_action\\_plan.pdf](https://www1.toronto.ca/City%20Of%20Toronto/Environment%20and%20Energy/Programs%20for%20Residents/Files/pdf/C/clean_air_action_plan.pdf)

City of Toronto, Toronto Public Health (no date). 2018 City of Toronto Budget Notes: Toronto Public Health. Toronto, Ontario. [https://www.toronto.ca/wp-content/uploads/2017/12/8d6c-TPH-Operating\\_Budget\\_Notes-v2.pdf](https://www.toronto.ca/wp-content/uploads/2017/12/8d6c-TPH-Operating_Budget_Notes-v2.pdf)

[https://www.toronto.ca/wp-content/uploads/2017/12/8d6c-TPH-Operating\\_Budget\\_Notes-v2.pdf](https://www.toronto.ca/wp-content/uploads/2017/12/8d6c-TPH-Operating_Budget_Notes-v2.pdf)

City of Toronto, Toronto Public Library (no date). 2018 City of Toronto Budget Notes: Toronto Public Library. Toronto, Ontario. <https://www.toronto.ca/wp-content/uploads/2017/12/8b96-TPL-2018-Op-Budget-Notes-V1.pdf>

City of Toronto, Toronto Transit Commission (2018, January 12). 2018 Operating Budget Briefing Note: Toronto Transit Commission: Options to Address Bus Overcrowding, Bus Availability & Garage Storage Capacity. Briefing note. Toronto, Ontario.  
<https://www.toronto.ca/legdocs/mmis/2018/bu/bgrd/backgroundfile-110782.pdf>

City of Toronto, Transportation Services (no date). 2018 City of Toronto Budget Notes: Transportation Services. Toronto, Ontario. <https://www.toronto.ca/wp-content/uploads/2017/12/8eca-TP-2018-Cap-Budget-Notes-V2.pdf>

Commitment to Community (2017). Voices of Toronto Speak Up: A shared vision for the 2018 City of Toronto budget. Toronto, Ontario.  
[https://d3n8a8pro7vhm.cloudfront.net/socialplanningtoronto/pages/1815/attachments/original/1511889036/Voices\\_of\\_Toronto\\_Speak\\_Up\\_Report\\_-\\_November\\_27th\\_Update.pdf?1511889036](https://d3n8a8pro7vhm.cloudfront.net/socialplanningtoronto/pages/1815/attachments/original/1511889036/Voices_of_Toronto_Speak_Up_Report_-_November_27th_Update.pdf?1511889036)

Health Providers Against Poverty (2018). An Evaluation of Toronto's Warming Centres & Winter Response to Homelessness. Toronto, Ontario.  
<https://healthprovidersagainstopoverty.files.wordpress.com/2018/01/warming-centre-report-jan-20.pdf>

Macdonald, D. & Friendly, M. (2017). Time Out: Child Care Fees in Canada 2017. Ottawa, Ontario: Canadian Centre for Policy Alternatives.  
<https://www.policyalternatives.ca/sites/default/files/uploads/publications/National%20Office/2017/12/Time%20Out.pdf>

Moore, O. (2018, January 30). Chaos ensues as TTC experiences slew of problems. The Globe and Mail. <https://www.theglobeandmail.com/news/toronto/chaos-ensues-as-ttc-experiences-slew-of-problems/article37800167/>

Pagliaro, J. (2018, January 31). As advocates push for more to shelter homeless, council votes to review supports and keep respite centres open longer. Toronto Star.  
[https://www.thestar.com/news/city\\_hall/2018/01/31/as-advocates-push-for-more-to-shelter-homeless-council-votes-to-review-supports-and-keep-respite-centres-open-longer.html](https://www.thestar.com/news/city_hall/2018/01/31/as-advocates-push-for-more-to-shelter-homeless-council-votes-to-review-supports-and-keep-respite-centres-open-longer.html)

Polanyi, M., Wilson, B., Mustachi, J., Ekra, M. & kerr, m. (2017). Unequal City: The hidden divide among Toronto's children and youth. Toronto, Ontario: Children's Aid Society of Toronto, Social Planning Toronto, Family Service Toronto (Ontario Campaign 2000), Ontario Coalition of Agencies Serving Immigrants and Colour of Poverty – Colour of Change.  
<https://d3n8a8pro7vhm.cloudfront.net/socialplanningtoronto/pages/1779/attachments/original/1511473048/CAST-2017-report-v12-web.pdf?1511473048>

Social Planning Toronto (2017). Demographic Change in Toronto's Neighbourhoods: Meeting community needs across the life span. Toronto, Ontario.  
<https://d3n8a8pro7vhm.cloudfront.net/socialplanningtoronto/pages/696/attachments/original/1498575451/DemographicChangeCensusReport-v1.2-web.pdf?1498575451>

Spurr, B. (2018, January 25). TTC approves ridership growth strategy. Toronto Star.  
<https://www.thestar.com/news/gta/transportation/2018/01/25/ttc-approves-ridership-growth-strategy.html>

Spurr, B. (2017, October 31). 50 TTC routes exceed crowding standards. Toronto Star.  
<https://www.thestar.com/news/gta/transportation/2017/10/31/50-ttc-routes-exceed-crowding-standards.html>

Statistics Canada (2018). 2016 Census of Population, Statistics Canada Catalogue no. 98-400-X2016286.

Toronto Transit Commission (2018, January 25). Ridership Growth Strategy 2018-2022. Staff report. Toronto, Ontario.  
[https://www.ttc.ca/About\\_the\\_TTC/Commission\\_reports\\_and\\_information/Commission\\_meetings/2018/January\\_25/Reports/2\\_Ridership\\_Growth\\_Strategy\\_2018-2022.pdf](https://www.ttc.ca/About_the_TTC/Commission_reports_and_information/Commission_meetings/2018/January_25/Reports/2_Ridership_Growth_Strategy_2018-2022.pdf)

Toronto Transit Commission (2018). Ridership Growth Strategy. Presentation to the TTC Board. Toronto, Ontario.  
[https://www.ttc.ca/About\\_the\\_TTC/Commission\\_reports\\_and\\_information/Commission\\_meetings/2018/January\\_25/Reports/2\\_Ridership\\_Growth\\_Strategy\\_2018-2022\\_Presentation.pdf](https://www.ttc.ca/About_the_TTC/Commission_reports_and_information/Commission_meetings/2018/January_25/Reports/2_Ridership_Growth_Strategy_2018-2022_Presentation.pdf)

United Way Toronto & York Region and Neighbourhood Change Research Partnership (2017). The Opportunity Equation in the Greater Toronto Area: An update on neighbourhood income inequality and polarization. Toronto, Ontario.  
[https://www.unitedwaytyr.com/file/2017\\_Opportunity\\_Equation\\_Update\\_Low-Res.pdf](https://www.unitedwaytyr.com/file/2017_Opportunity_Equation_Update_Low-Res.pdf)