Cleveland Climate Action Plan: Corporate Environmental & Social Governance Analysis

Appendix F
Project Overview

Introduction
The City of Cleveland’s Office of Sustainability engaged BrownFlynn to analyze publicly available environmental, social, and governance data (ESG), via Bloomberg, for the largest public companies in Northeast Ohio. The purpose of this analysis is help make the case for sustainable business practices in the region, and potentially use this data to spur conversation amongst leadership of these public companies for best practice sharing and collaboration.

Growing ESG Awareness
Companies in the region are increasingly aware of the availability of ESG data. Investors and other key stakeholders are using this information to evaluate corporate responsibility performance of companies globally.

Project Objectives
- Identify the largest publicly traded companies in Northeast Ohio
- Illustrate the ESG performance of these companies
- Identify and share ESG best practices with regional companies to build ESG awareness and performance over time
- Apply this research study as a benchmark for future assessments of ESG performance, and spark dialogues amongst company leadership
Project Overview

**Methodology**

- In tandem with the City of Cleveland and the Climate Action Advisory Committee, BrownFlynn identified a list of 20 key performance indicators (KPIs) covering:
  - Environmental topics (e.g., carbon emissions, etc.)
  - Social topics (e.g., diversity, etc.)
  - Governance topics (e.g., Business ethics policies, etc.)

- BrownFlynn then identified a list of 42 of the largest public companies* in Northeast Ohio, based on the:
  - Greater Cleveland Partnership (GCP) member list
  - Crain’s Top 100 Employers list
  - Crain’s Top 100 Public Companies list

- BrownFlynn analyzed these companies’ ESG disclosure using the Bloomberg Professional Service® terminal†

- The Bloomberg data contained in this study provides a high-level example of the ESG initiatives and activities implemented by Northeast Ohio’s largest publicly traded companies.

---

*Only public companies were analyzed as part of this study due to the availability of information in the Bloomberg terminal, which enables a more accurate comparison. Private company data are not included in Bloomberg.

†Bloomberg is a computer software system that provides real-time market data and analysis services.
Project Overview

Scope of Data

- This analysis is limited to data retrieved from the Bloomberg Terminal, which may not reflect the full breadth of each company's ESG strategy and initiatives:
  - Data is aggregated on a corporate level. All data for local subsidiaries reflect parent companies.
  - All data is global in scope, rather than specific to Northeast Ohio operations.
  - Bloomberg obtains data from public resources, such as reports and website communications.

Metrics Used

- ESG KPIs included in this analysis were selected via the following criteria:
  - Inclusion of ESG indicators most applicable across all sectors
  - Capture of the most commonly reported indicators across the entire peer set
  - Obtain indicators relevant to the Cleveland Climate Action Plan
  - Reflect the current level of disclosure across ESG indicators for the peer set
Finding and Observations
ESG Reporting

The majority of reviewed companies are disclosing data, but with limited E & S disclosure.

- In total, 40 out of 42 companies (95 percent) reported on at least one of the selected KPIs.
- Corporate transparency in Cleveland is skewed toward governance indicators, such as board and executive data.
- The dotted line represents a 'good' score according to Bloomberg (40)

Average Bloomberg Disclosure Scores

- Total Disclosure Score: 26.51
- Environmental Disclosure Score: 25.87
- Social Disclosure Score: 26.63
- Governance Disclosure Score: 56.15
Corporate Policies

The research indicates how the 42 reviewed companies are at various stages in the process of implementing corporate responsibility policies and strategies.
Energy & Emissions

- 19% of companies report total energy consumption.
  - Lowest consumption: 161.98 MWh (financial services)
  - Highest consumption: 544,444 MWh (manufacturing)
- 31% of companies report their total GHG emissions
  - Lowest total emissions: 60.62 Th Tonnes (financial services)
  - Highest total emissions: 190,000 Th Tonnes (manufacturing company)
- CDP disclosure increased between 2016 and 2017* from 22 to 25

*An ‘F’ grade means that either the company was asked to respond and declined, or responded but failed to provide sufficient information to be evaluated.
GHG Goals

The following serve as examples of greenhouse gas (GHG) emission reduction goals in Northeast Ohio.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Organization</th>
<th>Reduction Goal</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Case Western Reserve University</td>
<td>Carbon neutral by 2050</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cleveland Clinic</td>
<td>Reduce energy use by 20% by 2020</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cleveland Public Power</td>
<td>Reduce dependence on fossil fuels, purchase power from renewable energy sources (15% by 2015, 20% by 2020, 25% by 2025)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cuyahoga Community College</td>
<td>Carbon neutral by 2050</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Eaton Corporation</td>
<td>Reduce energy use 25% by 2015 (global goal)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Greater Cleveland Regional Transit Authority</td>
<td>Reduce GHG emissions by 30% by 2016</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KeyBank</td>
<td>Reduce energy use 20% by 2016, 2009 baseline</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Parker Hannifin</td>
<td>Reduce energy intensity by 3% per year</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tremco</td>
<td>Reduce energy use 50% by 2020</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Diversity

While several studies have shown that business with a high percentage of women in management are more profitable, NEO has low female representation on Boards and Executive Teams.

- Equal Opportunity Policy:
  - 64% Policy
  - 36% No Policy

- Female CEOs in NEO:
  - 4 Female
  - 38 Male

- Women in Management:
  - 80% Women on NEO Boards
  - 87% Women on NEO Executive Teams
  - 20% Female CEOs
  - 13% Female on Executive Teams
Equity – Best Practice Indicators

We need your help. We don’t have the racial equity data that we need—can your organizations provide the following?

- Breakdown of workforce based on minority group(s), e.g. race, gender, age, nationality, disability, etc.
- Equity share in management positions (as % of total management workforce)
- Equity share in junior management positions*, i.e. first level of management (as % of total junior management positions)
- Equity share in top management positions**, i.e. maximum two levels away from the CEO or comparable positions (as a % of total top management positions)
- Equity share in management positions in revenue-generating functions*** (e.g. sales) as a % of all such managers (i.e. excluding support functions such as HR, IT, Legal, etc.)

*Junior management positions: refer to first-line managers, junior managers and the lowest level of management within a company’s management hierarchy. These individuals are typically responsible for directing and executing the day-to-day operational objectives of organizations, conveying the directions of higher level officials and managers to subordinate personnel.

**Top management positions: refer to management positions with a reporting line at most two levels away from the CEO. They include individuals who plan, direct, and formulate policies, set strategy, and provide the overall direction of enterprises/orrganizations for the development and delivery of products or services, within the parameters approved by boards of directors or other governing bodies.

***Revenue-generating functions: refer to line management roles in departments such as sales, or that contribute directly to the output of products or services. It excludes support functions such as HR, IT, Legal. May also be referred to as roles that have P&L responsibility.

Based on RobecoSAM Corporate Sustainability Assessment
Discussion & Next Steps

- Discussion:
  - Gaps
    - In indicators?
    - In companies?
    - In data?
  - Private Company Analysis Sources of data: Current and Potential
    - Who can help support data collection and mapping for private companies

- Next Steps
  - Meeting monthly?
  - Action items before the next meeting
Appendix: Reviewed Companies
Reviewed Companies

Alcoa/Arconic
Applied Industrial Technologies
ArcelorMittal
Avery Dennison
Berkshire Hathaway (Lubrizol)
BWX Technologies
Charles River Laboratories
Citizens Financial Group (Citizens Bank)
Cleveland-Cliffs
DDR Corp
Diebold Nixdorf
Dominion Energy
Eaton Corporation
Fairmount Santrol
FirstEnergy
Ford

Forest City Realty Trust
General Electric
General Motors
Goodyear
Invacare
KeyCorp
Lincoln Electric
Materion Corporation
NACCO Industries
Nestle
Nordson
Parker-Hannifin
PNC
PolyOne Corporation
PPG Industries
Progressive

Rockwell Automation
RPM International
Sherwin-Williams
Signet Jewelers
Smucker's
Steris
TFS Financial Corp
Timken
TimkenSteel
TransDigm Group Inc
Appendix: Bloomberg Data
## Selected ESG Data for Largest Public Companies

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td># of Companies Reporting (out of 42)</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alcoa Inc.</td>
<td></td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>13.63</td>
<td>33.33</td>
<td>33.33</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Applied Industrial Technologies</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>22.22</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ArcelorMittal</td>
<td></td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Avery Dennison</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>20</td>
<td>44.44</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lubrizol</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>25</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BWX Technologies</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Charles River Laboratories</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>11.10</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Citizens Financial Group</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>25</td>
<td>12.50</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cleveland-Cliffs</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>10</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DDR Corp</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# Selected ESG Data for Largest Public Companies

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Diebold Nixdorf</td>
<td></td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>2,409</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>28.57</td>
<td>12.50</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dominion Energy</td>
<td></td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>977</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>11.11</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Eaton Corporation</td>
<td></td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>11,907</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>15.38</td>
<td>14.29</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FirstEnergy</td>
<td></td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>20,636.7</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>18.20</td>
<td>45.45</td>
<td>14.3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ford Motor Company</td>
<td></td>
<td>Y</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>15.38</td>
<td>14.3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Forest City Realty</td>
<td></td>
<td>Y</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>15.38</td>
<td>7.69</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

© 2016 BrownFlynn Ltd. All Rights Reserved.
## Selected ESG Data for Largest Public Companies

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td># of Companies Reporting (out of 42)</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>27</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Invacare</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KeyCorp</td>
<td></td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>161.98</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>29.41</td>
<td>21.42</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lincoln Electric</td>
<td></td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>18.18</td>
<td>9.09</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Materion Corporation</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NACCO Industries</td>
<td></td>
<td>N</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>N</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nestle Global</td>
<td></td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>39,333.3</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>34.60</td>
<td>30.77</td>
<td>7.14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nordson</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>11.11</td>
<td>10</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Parker Hannifin</td>
<td></td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>14.29</td>
<td>10.53</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PNC Financial Services</td>
<td></td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>60.40</td>
<td>30.77</td>
<td>23.08</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PolyOne Corporation</td>
<td></td>
<td>N</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>8.33</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PPG Industries</td>
<td></td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>24.36</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Selected ESG Data for Largest Public Companies

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Progressive</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>15.38</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rockwell Automation</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>18.18</td>
<td>7.69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RPM International</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>7.69</td>
<td>12.50</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sherwin-Williams</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>18.18</td>
<td>18.18</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Signet Jewelers</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>20</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Smucker’s</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>30.77</td>
<td>25</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Steris</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>15.38</td>
<td>22.22</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TFS Financial Corporation</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>18.18</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Timken</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>18.18</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TimkenSteel</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TransDigm Group Inc.</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Thank You

For more information on BrownFlynn’s services, please visit www.brownflynn.com or contact us below.

Jared Robbins  
Senior Consultant  
(216) 303 6014  
jaredr@brownflynn.com  

Marissa Brydle  
Associate Consultant  
(216) 303 6011  
marissab@brownflynn.com