Unnecessary jobs in the NHS

Between 2002-3 and 2012-13, the NHS budget increased from £57 billion to more than £105 billion.\(^1\) With the budget now so large and no longer growing so quickly, it’s more important than ever that the NHS delivers value for money.

The NHS employs 1,045,999 full time equivalent staff, but almost half of these are in non-clinical roles. There are 310,924 nurses, 34,546 managers and 55,177 working in “Hotel, property and estates.”\(^2\)

There have been plenty of stories in the print and broadcast media about shortages of medical staff such as nurses,\(^3\) but as this research shows, many trusts are employing people in unnecessary roles that are costing taxpayers tens of millions of pounds.

The key findings of this research are that in 2013:

- There were at least 1,129 unnecessary jobs in the NHS costing taxpayers almost £46 million.
- NHS organisations in the United Kingdom employed:
  - At least 826 PR staff at a cost of £34 million
  - At least 165 equality and diversity staff at a cost of more than £6.8 million
  - At least 86 ‘green’ staff at a cost of almost £3.5 million

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Region</th>
<th>PR jobs</th>
<th>Equality jobs</th>
<th>Green jobs</th>
<th>Other unnecessary jobs</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>East Midlands</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>East of England</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>London</td>
<td>148</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>North East</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>North West</td>
<td>132</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Northern Ireland</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Scotland</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>South East</td>
<td>104</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>South West</td>
<td>67</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wales</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>West Midlands</td>
<td>85</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yorkshire and the Humber</td>
<td>97</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

\(^1\) [http://www.nhsconfed.org/priorities/political-engagement/Pages/NHS-statistics.aspx](http://www.nhsconfed.org/priorities/political-engagement/Pages/NHS-statistics.aspx)

\(^2\) [http://www.hscic.gov.uk/searchcatalogue?productid=14039&q=monthly+nhs+hospital+and+community+service+workforce+statistics&sort=Most+recent&size=10&page=1#top](http://www.hscic.gov.uk/searchcatalogue?productid=14039&q=monthly+nhs+hospital+and+community+service+workforce+statistics&sort=Most+recent&size=10&page=1#top)

\(^3\) [http://www.independent.co.uk/news/uk/politics/coalitioncuts-blamedfor-shortageof-20000nhs-nurses-8933661.html](http://www.independent.co.uk/news/uk/politics/coalitioncuts-blamedfor-shortageof-20000nhs-nurses-8933661.html)
Guy’s and St Thomas’ NHS Foundation Trust employed 22 Public Relations staff at a cost of almost £1.1 million, including:
- Director of Communications
- Three Communications Managers
- Two Communications Officers
- Senior Media Officer
- Media Manager
- Senior Media Manager
- Head of Media and Corporate Communications
- 12 additional PR staff

They also employed:
- Carbon Manager
- Carbon Assistant
- Energy Awareness Project Officer
- Energy Manager

West and South Yorkshire and Bassetlaw Commissioning Support Unit employed 36 Public Relations staff at a cost of £1.4 million, including a Senior Associate for Digital and Social Media.

Leicestershire Partnership NHS Trust employed 6 equality and diversity staff:
- Equality and Diversity Lead Media Manager
- Equality and Human Rights Lead
- Equality and Diversity Lead
- Equality and Human Rights Coordinator
- Equality and Human Rights Compliance Officer
- Integrated Equality Service Administrator and Project Manager – Equality and Human Rights

Barts Health NHS Trust employed an NHS EU Office Director, an EU Office Manager and a Senior EU Policy Manager at a combined cost of more than £210,000.

Other jobs include:
- Mersey Care NHS Trust’s Third Sector Environmental Sustainability Lead
- South London Healthcare Trust’s Energising for Excellence Delivery Lead
- Royal Free London NHS Foundation Trust’s Car Park Sustainability Officer
- University Hospitals Bristol NHS Foundation Trust’s Administrator of Green Travel Facilities
- Black Country Partnership NHS Foundation Trust’s Productive Leadership Facilitator
Imperial College Healthcare, Northumbria Healthcare and Oxford University Hospitals were found to be employing a Trust Energy Manager, an Estates Energy and Sustainability Officer and an Energy Manager. However these trusts were found to have significantly overpaid for their energy during 2012-13 in earlier TaxPayers’ Alliance research.

To see the full research click here

To discuss the research, please contact:

Alex Wild
Policy Analyst, TaxPayers' Alliance
alex.wild@taxpayersalliance.com
07776 205 823

Financial support for this research paper was provided by the Politics and Economics Research Trust (charity number 1121849). Any views expressed in this paper are those of the author and not those of the research trust or of its trustees.
Job categories

Public relations

These are jobs primarily concerned with managing and promoting the reputation of the trust. The large disparity in the numbers of communications staff between trusts of similar size shows that a large PR team is an unnecessary expense. Examples of job titles which fell under this category include: Communications Manager, Press Officer and Head of Media Relations.

Diversity staff

The Equality Act 2010 requires every employer in the United Kingdom to comply with strict requirements relating to individuals belonging to groups with “protected characteristics”. Many NHS trusts have unnecessarily created mini-departments to comply with this policy agenda. Again, the disparities across trusts show that hiring staff specifically to work in this area is not necessary. Examples of job titles which fell under this category include: Equality and Diversity Manager, Equality and Human Rights Advisor and Equality and Inclusion Manager.

Green staff

These staff are employed to reduce an organisation’s energy use and emissions. Whilst this is a commendable aim, the fact that many large hospital trusts do not employ people in such roles again shows that they are not necessary. Examples of job titles which fell under this category include Carbon Management Coordinator, Energy and Sustainability Manager and Energy Management Manager.

Others

These are job titles which could not reasonably be assigned to one of the other categories. Examples of this job titles include: Senior EU Policy Manager, Energising for Excellence Delivery Lead and Leadership Officer.
Sources and methodology

- The information was gathered through Freedom of Information (FOI) requests to every NHS Foundation Trust, Mental Health Trust, Care Trust, Ambulance Trust, Clinical Commissioning Group, Commissioning Support Unit and Special Health Authority in the UK.

- Each organisation was asked to provide a list of all of their job titles in 2013 containing any specified “trigger words.” Examples of such words include: media, press PR, carbon, green, diversity and communications. The employee’s remuneration was also requested.

- In most cases, remuneration was provided in the form of “Agenda for Change Pay Scales.” Where this was the case, the mid-point of each band was taken. For example, if a hypothetical band had 4 points of £15,000, £16,000, £17,000 and £18,000, the value used in the report would be £16,500.

- Where no value was given, the average salary for someone with the same job title was used. If the job title was unique, the average salary of non-medical staff was used. For 2013 this was £26,586. Salaries which have been calculated using this method have been underlined.

- High cost area supplements were calculated in line with the Agenda for Change Pay Circular 1/2013.

- The NHS employer’s pension contribution of 14 per cent was then added to give a total cost.

- Job descriptions for each title were also requested to separate worthwhile jobs from unnecessary jobs. For example, Communications Operators are usually switchboard or telephone operators rather than media managers or press officers.

- Where an organisation failed to provide a job description, one or more descriptions for jobs with identical titles at another NHS trust were used.

- This is not an exhaustive list of unnecessary jobs in the NHS. Given that some trusts failed or were unable to respond, the numbers are almost certainly an underestimate.

---

6 http://www.nhsemployers.org/Aboutus/Publications/Documents/Pay_circular_AforC_1_2013.pdf#page=12
7 http://www.nhsemployers.org/SiteCollectionDocuments/AFC_tc_of_service_handbook_fb.pdf#page=205
8 http://www.nhsbsa.nhs.uk/Pensions/Documents/Pensions/Cost_and_Contributions_Factsheet_2012-13_(Officer)_(V1)_01.2012.pdf#page=2
FOI problems with NHS trusts

NHS reforms made under the Health and Social Care Act 2012, which came into effect on 1st April 2013, have made obtaining information from some NHS organisation problematic.

The handling of FOI requests by the new Clinical Commissioning Groups has been inconsistent with some able to respond, some having Commissioning support Units respond on their behalf and others not responding at all.

Additionally, some trusts said their systems were not configured in such a way as to produce a useable response. Some trusts were only able to provide a table with a breakdown of the headcount of each department. These responses have been excluded.