IN THE MATTER OF NEGOTIATIONS FOR REVISED CRITERIA AND PROCEDURES FOR PROMOTION AND CONTINUING APPOINTMENTS OF PROFESSIONAL LIBRARIANS AND ARCHIVISTS

BETWEEN:

YORK UNIVERSITY

(THE "UNIVERSITY" OR THE "EMPLOYER")

-AND-

YORK UNIVERSITY FACULTY ASSOCIATION

(THE "ASSOCIATION" OR "YUFA")

MEMORANDUM OF SETTLEMENT

January 17, 2019.

- 1. The final form of the Criteria and Procedures for Promotion and Continuing Appointments of Professional Librarians and Archivists ("Criteria and Procedures") is subject to necessary housekeeping and administrative detail for numerical consistency, dates, cross-referencing of Article numbers and the like.
- 2. The revised Criteria and Procedures are subject to the appropriate approval processes of the Parties.
- 3. The Parties agree to the following transitional terms for the implementation of the revised Criteria and Procedures following their approval:
 - (a) Revised Procedures

The revised procedures will apply in the case of Advancement, Continuing Appointment and Promotion files scheduled for adjudication in 2019-20; this includes the establishment of a File Preparation Committee for the assembly of any such files scheduled to commence in the Winter/Spring of 2019.

Timelines For adjudication of files in 2019-20, without prejudice to the rights and privileges of the parties in respect of any other matter:

- (i) The deadline for the adjudicating committee's recommendation in respect of advancement will be December 1 rather than November 1
- (ii) If a decision to deny continuing appointment is not provided to the candidate by the President by June 30, the terminal year will commence

the first of the month next following the date on which the denial notice is provided.

(b) Revised Criteria

Pre-Candidacy Individuals currently in Pre-Candidacy 1 or Pre-Candidacy 2 may elect to have their file adjudicated for Advancement according to the revised criteria; such individuals will be asked to confirm this election when they are advised of the initiation of the proceedings in respect of their Advancement file by the Dean's Office. If this election is not confirmed, their file will be adjudicated according to the criteria in the 2015-18 Criteria and Procedures document. Individuals who elect to have their Advancement file adjudicated according to the revised criteria as above will also have their Promotion and Continuing Appointment file adjudicated according to the revised criteria.

The Advancement file for Individuals in Pre-Candidacy 3 will be adjudicated according to the criteria in the 2015-18 Criteria and Procedures document

Candidacy Individuals in Candidacy 1 and individuals currently in Pre-Candidacy whose Advancement file is adjudicated according to the criteria in the 2015-18 Criteria and Procedures document may elect to have their Promotion and Continuing Appointment file adjudicated according to the revised criteria in the revised Criteria and Procedures document. Individuals in this circumstance will be asked to confirm this election when advised of the initiation of the proceedings in respect of their Promotion and Continuing Appointment file by the Dean's Office. If this election is not confirmed, their file will be adjudicated according to the criteria in the 2015-18 Criteria and Procedures document.

Promotion to Senior Librarian/Archivist Individuals submitting a file for promotion to Senior Librarian/Archivist in 2019-2020 or 2020-21 may elect to have the file considered according to the revised criteria or the criteria in the 2015-18 Criteria and Procedures document. Thereafter promotion-to-Senior-Librarian/Archivist files will be considered according the revised criteria.

4. The "CPPCAPLA" Criteria Guidelines" (the "Guidelines") attached as Appendix "B" to this Memorandum do not form part of the Criteria and Procedures document. They stand apart as a separate document and are intended to assist in the interpretation and application of the revised criteria in the Promotion and Continuing Appointment proceedings. The Parties agree that newly appointed librarians and archivists will be provided with a copy of the Guidelines at the start of their appointment and that a copy of the Guidelines will be included in each file adjudicated according to the revised criteria in the revised Criteria and Procedures document.

The Guidelines may be revised from time to time, and any revisions of the Guidelines will be with the agreement of the parties.

- 5. Within one month of the approval of the revised Criteria and Procedures per Section 2 above, the Employer will arrange sessions for librarians and archivists in which to present and answer questions about the revised the Criteria and Procedures. Representatives of the Association will be invited to participate in the sessions.
- 6. The revised Criteria and Procedures are as set out in Appendix A to this Memorandum.

Date 17 JANUARY WIT	
FOR THE UNIVERSITY	FOR THE ASSOCIATION
July ne	Much
Perf	Per:
Tonso	P. Be
Per:	Per:
f S	A Ja
Per:	Per:
	Ben Dentan.
Per	Per

APPENDIX A

Criteria and Procedures
for Promotion and
Continuing Appointments of
Professional Librarians and Archivists

(Article 13)

25 September 1978

Renewed 21 September 2009

Revised XX January 2019

Preamble

The following criteria and procedures for promotion and continuing appointments of librarians and archivists were developed to reflect the spirit of the *Report of the Senate Committee on Tenure and Promotion* (10 December 1971) and to set out criteria and procedures for librarians and archivists analogous to those applied in the tenure and promotion of faculty members.

Because 1 Librarians' and archivists' functions within the academic community are not the same as those of faculty members and because Senate does not govern on the promotion and continuing appointments of librarians and archivists as it does with faculty, the criteria for promotion and continuing appointment of librarians and archivists outlined in this document are more detailed than those contained in the Senate Committee's Report. Academic librarians and archivists undertake a wide range of professional responsibilities in varied contexts. The core responsibilities include: building and organizing robust collections, teaching, communicating and fostering the concepts and skills necessary for academic achievement and research excellence for both students and faculty and the community at large, as well as providing leadership in developing a knowledge infrastructure that enhances research and learning and provides the essential intellectual resources for quality teaching and student success.

In addition, we understand it as critical to the University's academic mission and to the public good that we develop and interrogate the systems which facilitate and extend both access and organization of information, and that we provide an overarching stewardship of knowledge particularly for materials of significant and enduring value to our scholarly communities. Within the University, librarians and archivists are also uniquely responsible for advocating and ensuring the broadest possible access to the corpus of scholarly knowledge. Academic librarians and archivists bring deep expertise to the research enterprise by facilitating and supporting the lifecycle of scholarship within an evolving information landscape.

In this work, librarians and archivists make important contributions to public discourse and collective memory, and the work they perform for public and private institutions is an integral part of the relationship between the University and the community. Communication with the general public in a variety of forms and media will be a continuing necessity for the modern university.

1.0 Criteria

Because promotion and continuing appointments affect junior members, the criteria below are described so that they may constitute not only a basis for evaluation *after* performance, but also a means for encouraging junior librarians <u>and archivists</u> *before* and *during* performance.

Recommendations concerning promotion and continuing appointments are based on a librarian's total contribution to the Library and the academic community. For purposes of assessing that contribution, there are three general areas associated with a librarian's or archivist's performance are which will be evaluated:

- 1. Professional performance and knowledge
- 2. Professional development contributions and standing
- 3. Service

The Adjudication Committee will review all candidates in accordance with these guidelines and ensure that the guidelines are applied uniformly and fairly to all cases under consideration. Librarians <u>and archivists</u> under review will be evaluated in each of the three areas above on the following scale:

Excellent

Highly competent

Competent

Not satisfactory Competence not demonstrated

1.1. Professional Performance and Knowledge

There are many functions performed by librarians and archivists in varied contexts., but, of necessity, the primary responsibilities of librarians and archivists are to build sound collections in the Libraries, to establish effective bibliographic control over those collections and to assist students and faculty members in making effective use of the Libraries' resources as they are required to support academic and research pursuits. These functions include a wide range of activities related to the practice, development, communication, and application of expertise to

areas such as collection development, teaching, research consultations, resource discovery, cataloguing/metadata/description, digital infrastructure development, scholarly publishing, and data management. For individual librarians and archivists, specific job responsibilities are defined in position descriptions.

Since effective library <u>and archival</u> service to the York community is the primary function of the Libraries, it follows that every librarian's <u>and archivist's</u> foremost responsibility is to provide a high standard of service to the community of users. Therefore, every librarian and archivist being evaluated for promotion to any rank, or for continuing appointment, must achieve at least high competence in this area.

To determine a librarian and archivist's effectiveness, the content of an individual's job is considered in relation to the following factors:

- knowledge and application of bibliographic techniques; best practices of librarianship or archival theory and practice (as appropriate);
- initiative, and resourcefulness and creative in problem-solving whether bibliographic or managerial in areas of responsibility;
- quality of judgement in decision-making;
- evidence of initiative, resourcefulness, and creative problem solving;
- expertise and ongoing professional development in areas of responsibility as defined in the position description;
- understanding of library operations and purposes;
- ability to utilize current library techniques and theories;
- interaction with library personnel at all levels;
- effectiveness of contact with library users and colleagues;
- ability to effectively communicate professional expertise with the user community and with colleagues, both verbally and in written form;
- degree of flexibility in accepting responsibility;
- ability and willingness to engage in responsibilities that broaden knowledge and expertise;
- adapting to and integrating new methods and technology to provide better library and archival service;
- ability to plan and evaluate library services, resources and functions;
- ability to plan, take leadership roles in, and evaluate sustainable University library or archivesal services, resources and functions and programs (as appropriate);
- level of knowledge of subject or foreign languages, if relevant to responsibilities;
- and ability to communicate effectively both in verbal and written form.

1.2 Professional Development-Professional Contributions and Standing

In this area, a librarian's and archivist's activities above and beyond the assigned responsibilities contributions to their profession as a whole are considered, with an emphasis on those activities which are addressed to communities external to York University. Such activities enhance the reputation of the University and its Libraries, and also advance the scholarship, practices, and values of the professions. Since distinction within the library profession arises from research and scholarly work, this area of assessment includes an evaluation of the following factors: an assessment of the research and scholarly work; sharing of professional skills and knowledge with others through publications and, program development, lectures, and other modes of scholarship/debate/critique around professional practice in librarianship or the archival profession, including contributions to the development and critique of provincial, national and/or international standards and practices; and leadership roles in professional and scholarly associations. These activities must not be separated from the other criteria; they should be weighed in relation to the central core of responsibility which belongs to every librarian and archivist not only to transmit, but to extend the boundaries of, perception, understanding, and knowledge in the fulfillment of all areas of their professional responsibility (PPK, PCS, and Service).

Although publication, performance, and association work are not in themselves a guarantee of excellence, one recognizes that these kinds of professional activities are addressed to communities larger than York University and that, therefore, they must be judged in this larger professional context. In certain cases a distinguished public expression constitutes *prima facie* evidence that the quality of the work has been assessed and found to be of a high standard; in other cases it may be necessary to solicit assessments from specialists in the same field. When the candidate has written or produced a work as part of a team or group in a research project, including in the context of community-engaged scholarship, the nature of his or her unique contribution must be identified and assessed.

A librarian and archivist's ability to achieve distinction both inside of York as well as in the larger professional context, often relates to the systematic pursuit of further knowledge-and creative work. Therefore, consideration will also be given to a candidate's efforts to continue to extend or develop the level of knowledge of librarianship, archivy and/or of specific subjects through either formal or informal educational programs.

1.3 Service

Librarians and archivists are expected to serve on some committees as part of their professional responsibilities. Contributions to other committees, however, especially those which shape library or academic policies and/or serve the whole University community, are assessed as an area where a candidate https://library.academic.new.org/ displayed sound judgment and knowledge of library. archival, and information seichee.new.org/ studies.

Service to the University may take many forms. Service to the University is performed by librarians and archivists through participation in the decision-making councils of the University and through sharing in the necessary administrative work of the Libraries, other Faculties, the York University Faculty Association, individual departments/divisions/schools, or other

University bodies. not otherwise counted under Professional Performance and Knowledge, or Professional Contributions and Standing. Reviewers will attempt to distinguish among the kinds of administrative work in which a librarian or archivist has participated. Contributions through committees and administrative offices should be assessed as an area for the display of knowledge and good judgement in the creation of new policies, procedures, documentation, recommendations, events, courses, and programs, faculties and colleges. The work of some committees, including those listed in position descriptions, is routine; obligations to serve on them are implicit in being a librarian or archivist and deserve no special weight. Committees relevant to the making of academic policy, or major duties assumed at the request of the Libraries, University or the York University Faculty Association which have led to significant improvements are clearly more important and will be given proper consideration.

2.0 Eligibility

Ranks for librarians <u>and archivists</u> exist so that the profession may be internally responsible for administering its own standards of achievement. Although there is no absolute relation between ranks and length of service within the University, there is an association between ranks and a general pattern of professional development.

An academic university librarian or archivist is a professional devoted to the pursuit of excellence in the provision of library and archival service, research, pursuit of continuing self-development and service to the institution. Promotion is therefore related to the University's recognition of a librarian's or archivist's achievements. The decision to grant continuing appointment, however, is more critical than the decision to promote, in that continuing appointment is concerned with the librarian's right to pursue and communicate knowledge and express opinions in an atmosphere free of reprisals. Thus librarians and archivists eligible for promotion and continuing appointments will move at varying rates, according to their own pattern of professional growth.

2.1 Years in Rank

Time in rank is based upon a year which begins on 1 July of the calendar year of an individual's appointment. A "year" for purposes of this document therefore extends from 1 July to 30 June. Thus for individuals appointed in the last six months of a calendar year, the first "year" ends on 30 June of the following calendar year; for those appointed in the first six months of a calendar year, the first "year" ends on 30 June of the following calendar.

2.2 Patterns of Advancement

The following outline of advancement is an average profile to indicate what might be expected by librarians and archivists. It is not, however, a set pattern.

Years	Rank	Classification

1-3	Assistant Librarian/Archivist (Pre-Candidacy)	Probationary
4-6	Assistant Librarian/Archivist (Candidacy)	Probationary
6 and on	Associate Librarian/Archivist	Continuing Appointment
10 and on	Senior Librarian/Archivist	Continuing Appointment

Promotions and conferral of continuing appointments are effective the beginning of the next appointment year.

Minimum time requirements for advancement or promotion are normally as follows:

- From Pre-Candidacy to Candidacy three years' professional experience including at least one year at York;
- to Associate Librarian/Archivist and Continuing Appointment five years' professional experience and at least one year at York;
- to Senior Librarian/Archivist at least ten years' professional experience including two years of outstanding performance as an Associate Librarian/Archivist at York.

As stated above, The decision to grant continuing appointment is forms one of the most important relationships between a librarian or archivist and the University since it confers continuing career appointment. Therefore, it is reasonable to assume that a candidate who has been judged worthy of continuing appointment is normally worthy of being promoted to the rank of Associate Librarian/Archivist. Nevertheless, there may be exceptional cases in which promotion is warranted without the conferral of continuing appointment, or, and in which continuing appointment may be granted but promotion to Associate Librarian/Archivist delayed.

In such exceptional cases, the Pre-Candidacy and Candidacy terms may be extended or delayed by one year to ensure a fair appraisal of a candidate for either promotion or continuing appointment. The circumstances under which such an extension could occur may involve one or more of the following:

- (i) medical circumstances where extended and severe medical problems have delayed a candidate from realising his/her promise;
- (ii) major change in field of professional responsibility;

- (iii) documented high promise of excellence or high competence in the three areas to be realized in the immediate future (i.e. no longer than two years);
- (vi) exceptional conditions where extraordinary service was rendered by the candidate;
- (v) extended leave of absence, where provision for credit or non-credit of such time to the years of service has been arranged in advance of the leave between the candidate and the University Librarian/Dean, Faculty of Law.

A candidate may request such an extension or delay by applying in writing to the PCAC within 15 calendar days of receipt of the University Librarian's /Dean, Faculty of Law's notification of the initiation of proceedings.

In cases where PCAC recommends delay of promotion, a candidate may reapply in the following year. If he/she does not re-apply, the candidate will automatically be reconsidered in the second year after the delay recommendation.

<u>Granting continuing appointment and delaying promotion shall normally be reserved for</u> candidates in their final year of Candidacy.

2.2.1 Provision for Extensions or Delay of terms of Pre-candidacy or Candidacy

In such exceptional cases, the Pre-Candidacy and Candidacy terms may be extended or delayed by one year to ensure a fair appraisal of a candidate for either promotion or continuing appointment. The circumstances under which such an extension could occur may involve one or more of the following include, but are not limited to:

- (i) medical circumstances where extended and severe medical problems have delayed a candidate from realising his/her-their promise;
- (ii) major change in field of professional responsibility negotiated position description as set out in 18.17(b);
- (iii) documented high promise of excellence or high competence in the three areas to be realized in the immediate future (i.e. no longer than two years);
- (vi) exceptional conditions where extraordinary service was rendered by the candidate;
- (v) extended leave of absence, where provision for credit or non-credit of such time to the years of service has been arranged in advance of the leave between the candidate and the University Librarian/Dean, Faculty of LawDean.

A candidate may request such an extension or delay by applying in writing to the PCAC University Librarian/Dean, Faculty of LawDean within 15 calendar days of receipt of the

<u>University Librarian's /Dean, Faculty of Law Dean's notification of the initiation of proceedings, copying the File Preparation Committee on the notification application.</u>

2.2.2 Extension of Pre-Candidacy or Candidacy Period for Pregnancy or Primary Care Giver Leave

Candidates who qualify for pregnancy or primary care giver leave shall, upon request to the University Librarian Dean, receive an extension of their probationary period for one year. Normally, candidates must have qualified for pregnancy or primary care giver leave and must have made the request for an extension prior to engagement with the File Preparation Committee.

The Chair of the File Preparation Committee must be informed of all such extensions and/or delays by the University Librarian/Dean, Faculty of LawDean.

2.3 Librarians and Archivists with Previous Experience

Librarians <u>and archivists</u> may be appointed at any rank. Except in unusual circumstances, a candidate should complete at least one year of service at York before being considered for a continuing appointment. The Pre-Candidacy and Candidacy periods may be shortened for librarians <u>and archivists</u> with service elsewhere. Librarians <u>and archivists</u> appointed as Associate or Senior Librarians <u>and Archivists</u> will enter Candidacy upon appointment, unless an agreement to the contrary has been reached between the <u>University Librarian/Dean, Faculty of LawDean</u> and the candidate.

3.0 Progression of Ranks and Appointment Status

Most initial appointments at York are probationary. The purpose of the probationary appointment is to provide the University and the candidate an opportunity for mutual appraisal. Probation does not imply that tenure and promotion will be granted, but it does imply that the University gives serious consideration to such an appointment during that period.

There are two sequential probationary periods: *Pre-Candidacy* and *Candidacy*. The two phases may not total more than six years. In the exceptional case of Pre-Candidacy lasting four years and the individual then being moved into Candidacy, the period of Candidacy shall be two years.

3.1 Pre-Candidacy

All Assistant Librarians/Archivists become pre-candidates upon appointment. The period of Pre-Candidacy will not normally exceed three years. A librarian or archivist shall not remain in the Pre-Candidacy rank for more than three years. During this three-year period, it will be determined whether an individual's appointment will be continued to Candidacy.

Proceedings concerning the promotion and advancement of an Assistant Librarian/Archivist, or the non-renewal of a probationary appointment, may be initiated at any time during the three-year Pre-Candidacy period, but must be initiated no later than 1 May-April of the second year of service unless a delay is requested by the candidate, as per Section 2.2.1.

3.1.1 Criteria for Advancement

The criteria below apply to advancement of a pre-candidate to candidate librarian or archivist from Pre-Candidacy to Candidacy. To advance, an individual must be assessed as highly competent to have at least high competence in the area of professional performance and knowledge and at least competent competence in the two other areas.

Evidence of the levels of competence required <u>includes</u>, <u>would include</u> but <u>is</u> not <u>be</u> limited <u>to</u>, the following characteristics of performance:

- a) Demonstrated fulfilment of assigned responsibilities and duties
- b) Indications of increasing ability to act independently and creatively;
- c) Demonstrated capacity to work flexibly and effectively with colleagues to meet evolving needs and responsibilities of the organization, at both a unit/department level and system wide
- <u>ed</u>) Demonstrated capacity to work harmoniously with colleagues and Library users <u>and promise</u> <u>of leadership in fostering effective interpersonal relationships both within the Libraries and within the community of users.</u>
- <u>ee</u>) <u>Demonstrated</u> interest in and capacity for improving the overall effectiveness of a unit's operations;
- <u>df</u>) Demonstrated <u>potential for long-range</u> planning ability <u>and capacity to identify</u> problems, assess alternative solutions and consequences of recommendations;
- fg) Some eEvidence of increasing competence in a subject and "functional" area;
- h) Successful completion of and/or participation in work-related courses and/or institutes;
- i) Dependability and reliability in the execution of responsibilities;
- i) Need for a decreasing amount of direction as experience increases;
- th) Understanding of Library policies and ability to interpret those policies when required;
- ki) Effective participation in Library task forces, committees, etc.; effective representation of Library interests and problems to non-Library groups, committees or University officials;
- lj) Membership and active participation in a professional or subject-related association;
- mk) Promise of growth in Promise of further in expertise and knowledge pertinent to the position a specific position, in general professional knowledge and, if pertinent, in a subject area;

l) Evidence of an identified research area and work towards building a scholarly profile through publications or presentations, or clear identification of work-in-progress;

3.2 Candidacy

During the period of Candidacy, which normally extends up to three years beyond Pre-Candidacy, the eligibility of a librarian <u>or archivist</u> for continuing appointment is determined. Librarians <u>or archivists</u> appointed at the rank of Associate or Senior Librarian/<u>Archivist</u> will enter Candidacy upon appointment, unless an agreement to the contrary has been reached between the <u>University Librarian/Dean</u>, <u>Faculty of LawDean</u> and the candidate upon appointment. Proceedings concerning consideration for continuing appointment of a librarian <u>or archivist</u> may be initiated at any time after one year of Candidacy, but must be initiated by 1 <u>March-February</u> of the second year of Candidacy.

Librarians or archivists who are in the Candidacy period and hold the rank of Assistant Librarian/Archivist may also normally be reviewed for promotion to the rank of Associate Librarian/Archivist during the Candidacy period. A normal expectation of promotion to the rank of Associate Librarian/Archivist would be after three to six years in the rank of Assistant Librarian/Archivist.

3.2.1 Criteria for Advancement Continuing Appointment and Promotion

Agreed, revised title, November 15, 2018

The criteria below apply to advancement of a librarian and or archivist from Candidacy to continuing appointment, as well as promotion from the rank of Assistant Librarian/Archivist to Associate Librarian/Archivist. To qualify for a continuing appointment or for promotion to the rank of Associate Librarian/Archivist, an individual must be assessed to have at least high competence in the area of professional performance and knowledge, and at least high competence in one other area and at least competence in the third area.

Evidence of the levels of competence required would include, but not be limited to, the following characteristics of performance:

- a) Demonstrated excellence in <u>professional and creative</u> fulfillment of position responsibilities and duties;
- b) Obvious ability to act independently and creatively in the position, and in applying best practices of librarianship or archivy and, by so doing, to enhancing the ability of the Library to fulfill its objectives;
- c) Proven ability and willingness to work flexibly and effectively with colleagues to broaden expertise and meet evolving needs and responsibilities of the organization, at both a unit/department level and system wide;

- <u>ed</u>) Provides leadership in fostering effective interpersonal relationships both within the Library and within the community of users; consistently sensitive to user needs, and coordinates execution of responsibilities with others affected;
- c) Clear understanding of policies; ability to justify and interpret Library policies to staff and users;
- de) Significant contributions in the form of analysis, evaluation, planning, advice and/or counsel, suggestions, and actions which improve the operations of a specific Library unit, or advance the priorities of the Libraries system-wide
- f) Demonstrated planning ability; long-range planning ability and/or the ability to define Library objectives and goals will be considered in terms of ability to set objectives, to allocate resources consistent with system-wide goals and resources, and to shape Library policies, i.e., planning ability based on thorough analyses and evaluations of needs and constraints as well as the ability to gain commitment of persons affected by the changes planned for;
- g) Evidence of growth in librarianship <u>or archivy</u>, <u>and/or subject area</u>; awareness of trends in the profession;
- h) Successful completion and/or participation in job-related courses, institutes and the like;
- <u>ih</u>) Publications, <u>program development</u>, <u>lectures</u>, and other modes of scholarship/debate/critique around professional practice in librarianship or archivy-or other presentations in librarianship and/or <u>subject areas</u> <u>disciplines insofar as it they relates to librarianship or archivy</u>. When publications or other presentations are being considered, the content, <u>and</u> form, <u>and the substantiveness of their contribution to the discourse in librarianship/archivy</u> of such materials is considered rather than the number of titles or descriptive phrases on any curriculum vitae;
- i) <u>Demonstrated effectiveness in Rrepresenting York or providing leadership in local, regional, national or international organizations devoted to librarianship/archivy, and/or subject area <u>as it relates to librarianship/archivy;</u></u>
- j) Effective participation in Library and University task forces, committees, etc. When assessing a candidate's contribution in service, mere membership on committees or service in a position is not enough. The quality of service is considered in terms of thoroughness and consistency of planning and performance, originality of ideas, leadership and quality of end product;
- k) Effective representation of Library interests and problems to non-Library groups, committees or University officials, when such representation is normally not part of position responsibilities;
- m) Other professional contributions to the academic or general community.

When considering the above criteria, no continuing appointment committee could honestly expect that after three to six years of service all candidates for continuing appointment would

have achieved excellence in their careers; however, no continuing appointment committee could seriously entertain the notion that a grey competence is sufficient for continuing appointment.

3.3 Continuing Appointment: Promotion to Senior Librarian/Archivist

Librarians <u>and archivists</u> with continuing appointment and the rank of Associate Librarian/<u>Archivist</u> may apply to the <u>University Librarian/Dean, Faculty of LawDean</u> for promotion to the rank of Senior <u>Librarian/Archivist</u>. While this level of achievement cannot be identified with serving a fixed number of years as an Associate Librarian/<u>Archivist</u>, it is nevertheless considered that most librarians <u>and archivists</u> will be eligible for promotion to Senior Librarian/<u>Archivist</u> after ten years of professional experience.

The rank of Senior Librarian/Archivist is one to which all professional librarians and archivists may aspire. A Senior Librarian/Archivist is an eminent member of the Library whose achievement at York or in another institution and/or in their profession has marked that individual as one of the persons from whom the Library receives its energy and strength.

This promotion is not in recognition of long service but is rather a recognition of distinguished service, senior levels of responsibilities <u>ander</u> outstanding professional achievement.

3.3.1. Criteria

Assessment of eligibility for promotion to Senior Librarian/Archivist is not made on the basis of evaluation or performance in the three areas of professional performance and knowledge Professional Performance and Knowledge, professional Professional development Contribution and Standing, and service Service. For a Senior Librarian/Archivist, these areas cannot be separated, but rather intertwine and overlap to produce an overall quality of excellence. Thus, an individual's achievements as a whole are assessed.

Evidence of the level of achievement required for promotion to Senior Librarian/Archivist are is illustrated by the following:

- a) Performance in areas of professional responsibility of work which is consistently outstanding and above the norm;
- b) Innovative <u>and creative</u> work in designing and implementing <u>services and/or programs</u> which have a recognizable impact on library services and operations procedures and systems;
- c) <u>Assumption of a significant acceptance of an increasing</u> amount of responsibility and effective coordination of the work of others. <u>These qualities may be demonstrated in bibliographic, administrative, service, instructional or collection development activities</u>;

- d) Leadership and substantive contributions across library departments, and within the University or professional associations that extend beyond assigned responsibilities in interdepartmental work, committees, or projects;
- e) Superior <u>record of</u> service to the Library community through improvement in the relationship between the Library and its users, such <u>as strengthening communications</u> <u>engagement with and increasing effective</u> use of Library services <u>and/or resourcesby</u> <u>means of lectures</u>, <u>effective contact with students and faculty</u>, <u>etc.</u>
- f) Scholarship as evidenced by original research and publications, <u>program development</u>, <u>lectures</u>, and other modes of scholarship/debate/critique around professional practice in <u>librarianship</u> or archivy; or other presentations in librarianship, <u>and subject areas</u>. <u>has established a reputation as one of the leaders in his/hertheir profession through contributions to the advancement of librarianship or archivy</u>
- g) Professional expertise, including evidence of growth of self as well as an active ongoing commitment to the coaching and mentorship contributions to the continuing education of other librarians, archivists, and Library staff.
- 4. Procedures for Advancement, Promotion and Continuing Appointments
- (a) Revise 4.1 Initiation of Proceedings as follows:

4.1 Initiation of Proceedings

It is the responsibility of the Office of the University Librarian/Dean, Faculty of LawDean to initiate proceedings at appropriate times by notifying the candidate and the Adjudicating Committee on the standard form. Proceedings may also be initiated by the candidate provided that the established time requirements have been met. In the case of promotion to Senior Librarian/Archivist, proceedings are initiated by the individual.

When the Office of the <u>University Librarian/Dean, Faculty of LawDean</u> initiates procedures, the following deadlines shall be adhered to:

- a) Pre-Candidacy to Candidacy by 1 May April of the second year of Pre-Candidacy;
- b) Candidacy to continuing appointment by 1 March February of the second year of Candidacy.

For initiation of procedures for promotion to Senior Librarian/Archivist, the following deadlines shall be adhered to:

<u>Procedures initiated by May 1 and file submitted to Adjudicating Committee by January 15.</u>

(b) Replace existing 4.2 Processing by the Promotion and Continuing Appointments Committee (PCAC) and subsections with new 4.2 Overview of the Process and subsections as follows:

4.2 Overview of the Process

- a) A file will be prepared for each candidate under the direction of a File Preparation Committee and assessed in the first instance by an adjudicating committee.
- b) The complete file will proceed from the Adjudicating Committee, via the Dean, University Libraries, or Dean, Faculty of Law, to the President.

4.2.1 General Rules

- (a) Deliberations of the Adjudicating Committee and the Appeals Committee shall be *in camera* and completely confidential.
- (b) Candidates shall have the right to appear in person, with or without a representative, before the Adjudicating Committee, the Dean or the President for the purpose of making a statement or providing clarification with respect to substantive or procedural matters concerning their file. A written record of the statement and/or information so obtained shall be added to the file and forwarded to the candidate.
- (c) Candidates shall have the right to review their complete file at any stage subject to the exceptions outlined in 4.2.2.4 *Confidentiality and the Candidate's Right to Know.*
- (d) To the extent possible, the Adjudication Committee will include a broad representation of Library departments and ensure diversity of gender.
- (e) No person shall serve on the Appeals Committee if they have previously served on the File Preparation or Adjudicating Committee for the candidate in question.
- (f) Whenever it is required that a report or letter be copied to the candidate, it shall be sent by email within two business days and, where possible, hand delivered.
- (g) Candidates shall be kept informed in writing about the progress of their file at each point where a recommendation is made to the next stage and shall be given 15 days from the date of mailing of the notification by the Adjudicating Committee and the Dean to add a statement to the file providing clarification with respect to substantive or procedural matters concerning their file before the file is forwarded to the next stage.

4.2.2 Procedures

4.2.2.1 File Preparation

4.2.2.1.1 General

- (a) Files shall be prepared by a committee of no fewer than three persons: one named by the candidate and two named by, and normally from, the Adjudicating Committee. All members of the File Preparation Committee shall be librarians or archivists with a probationary or continuing appointment (normally with a continuing appointment).
- (b) The File Preparation Committee has the responsibility of assembling a file which is complete and which fairly and accurately reflects the candidate's academic career at York and/or elsewhere. It will be responsible for presenting diverse career paths fairly and effectively, so that candidates' professional performance and knowledge, professional development and service can be equitably assessed. Where a candidate is appointed at the level of Candidacy, the File Preparation Committee will make reasonable efforts to obtain evidence from the candidate's previous institution of performance in the three areas of professional responsibility. The File Preparation Committee will not adjudicate the file.
- (c) The only commentary provided by the File Preparation

 Committee shall be factual information required to
 contextualize the evidence in the file (e.g., background
 information on external referees). The candidate will be
 given the opportunity of reviewing any such
 contextualizing commentary before the file goes to the
 Adjudicating Committee.

4.2.2.1.2 Referees

(a) The File Preparation Committee will select at least four referees for advancement to candidacy files and at least 6 referees for other files. While referees will be invited to comment on the entire file, tThe selection of referees for advancement to Candidacy files will be made to ensure that at least two referees will be able to comment knowledgeably on the candidate's Professional Performance and Knowledge and at least one referee will

- be able to comment knowledgeably on each of the other two areas and, for other files, that at least two referees will be able to comment knowledgeably on each area.
- (b) For advancement to candidacy files, at least one of the referees will be external to the University and at arm's length from the candidate. For other continuing appointment and promotion to Associate

 Librarian/Archivist files, at least threetwo of the referees will be external to the University and at arm's length from the candidate. For promotion to Senior Librarian files, at least three of the referees will be external to the University and at arm's length from the candidate.

 Referees are not at "arm's length" if the candidate has had a prior professional involvement with them (e.g., as thesis supervisor, co-author, close colleague within the field, etc.).
- (c) Exceptions to the "arm's length" rule shall be made only if, in the opinion of the File Preparation Committee, the only referees available to assess work done in a particular field are persons with whom the candidate has had a prior professional involvement. The reasons for choosing such referees should be explained in the file.
- (d) The File Preparation Committee shall solicit comments
 from co-authors/co-investigators on the nature of the
 candidate's contribution to joint work (or work produced
 as part of a team or group).
- (e) Candidates will be advised of what materials will be sent to the referees and may add such other materials as they believe are relevant.

4.2.2.3 Contents of the file

The contents of a candidate's application file for advancement to candidacy, continuing appointment and/or promotion will be determined by the File Preparation Committee, in consultation with the candidate, and as a minimum, will include:

- a) Copies of the Libraries' advancement to candidacy, promotion and continuing appointment guidelines;
- b) (Candidates for Continuing Appointment) A copy of the letter advising the candidate of their advancement to

Candidacy for continuing appointment (or letter of appointment, if the candidate was appointed in Candidacy) which normally shall indicate the standards that the candidate is expected to meet if promotion and continuing appointment are to be granted;

- c) An up-to-date *curriculum vitae* from the candidate;
- d) A letter from the candidate's department head or equivalent;
- e) Copies of the candidate's job description and annual performance evaluations, both of which the candidate has had the opportunity to read, comment upon and sign.

 (Note: the methods of preparing job descriptions and carrying out annual performance appraisals are not specified; however, they must be previously agreed upon by the candidate and the department head or equivalent; not required until such time as job descriptions and performance evaluations are consistently available for all librarians at York University);
- f. A list of referees whose letters are included;
- g. Sample copies of letters sent to solicit references;
- h. Letters of reference;
- i. A candidate's personal statement, if any. Candidates will be encouraged to include a brief personal statement (normally not more than 2000 words). Such a statement will normally provide an assessment of one's career progress and an explanation of any anomalies (e.g., career interruptions). This statement may also include reflections on the candidate's approach to their work;
- j. Reviews (if available) of published scholarship;
- k. Statement from co-authors/co-investigators on the candidate's specific contribution to joint work, or work produced as part of a team or group.
- Statistical summaries and analyses demonstrating impact (optional);

m. Information written by the candidate to contextualize and/or frame sections of the file or items included in the file that help the Adjudication Committee understand the impact of the candidate's contribution.

4.2.2.4 Confidentiality and the Candidate's Right to Know

- (a) Candidates shall be apprised of the names of all referees solicited on their file.
- (b) Candidates may review all material in their file, except
 for original copies of letters of reference from colleagues,
 at all levels of consideration.

4.2.2.5 Letters of Reference

The File Preparation Committee shall inform referees that letters of reference must be written in such a form that the writer's name, address and all contextual information will be contained in a header and shall inform referees that the header and signature will be removed or masked and the remaining text of the letter will be photocopied and provided to the candidate.

4.2.2.6 Unsolicited Confidential Letters Unsolicited confidential letters may not be included in the file.

4.2.2.7 Responsibility of the Candidate

- (a) It is the responsibility of the candidate to supply the information requested by the File Preparation Committee.
- (b) When a file is complete, the File Preparation Committee will notify the candidate and the Adjudication Committee.
- Committee so request, a meeting will be scheduled to discuss the file. The meeting will be held within 15 days of the request and no later than 15 days following the notification by the File Preparation Committee that the file is complete. The candidate may be accompanied by a colleague at such a meeting.

4.3 Adjudication

Replace existing 4.3 Recommendations and subjections with new 4.3 Adjudication of the File and subsections as follows:

4.3 Adjudication of the File

4.3.1 Adjudication

- (a) The principal substantive assessment of a candidate's file takes place in an Adjudicating Committee.
- (b) For advancement and continuing appointment files, the Adjudicating Committee will review the evidence in the file and include in a report the detailed results of votes on professional knowledge and performance, professional development and service rated as excellence, high competence, competence or competence not demonstrated, and the vote on the recommendation for continuing appointment and promotion. For promotion to Senior Librarian files, the Adjudicating Committee will review the evidence in the file and vote only to promote or delay.
- (c) An Adjudicating Committee will normally consist of four librarians or archivists and one non-librarian/archivist member. The majority of librarian/archivist members shall have a continuing appointment.
- (d) The level of achievement required for the granting of continuing appointment and promotion is identical for candidates who follow regular timelines and those who accelerate the timeline for their file.

4.3.2 Adjudicating Committee's Recommendations

The Adjudicating Committee shall prepare a written report of its decision to recommend advancement to candidacy, continuing appointment and promotion, continuing appointment without promotion, promotion (in the case where a candidate already has tenure), delay, or rejection denial, with detailed reasons for the decision.

4.3.3 Adjudicating Committee's Report

- (a) The Adjudicating Committee's report shall be added to the file and sent to the Dean, setting forth its decision to recommend one of advancement to candidacy, continuing appointment and promotion, continuing appointment without promotion, promotion, delay or rejection denial, or in cases where the candidate already has a continuing appointment, promotion or delay with clear and detailed reasons for the decision.
- (b) The Adjudicating Committee's report will be added to the file and copied to the candidate.

(c) If the recommendation is negative deny or delay, such notification shall be sent to the candidate by registered mail.

4.3.4 Reconsideration

The Adjudicating Committee's report will constitute notice of recommendation and, consistent with 4.2.1 (g) above, the candidate will have 15 days from the date of mailing to add a statement to the file providing clarification with respect to substantive or procedural matters concerning their file or, in the event of a negative or delay recommendation, to request reconsideration by the Adjudicating Committee.

Following any reconsideration, the Adjudicating Committee will add its recommendation to the candidate's file, copy it to the candidate, and send the file to the Dean.

4.4 Schedule of Recommendations

On the basis of material in the file, the Adjudication Committee will make a recommendation to the University Librarian/Dean, Faculty of LawDean according to the following schedule:

<u>Pre-candidate to candidate – within one</u>by 1 November of the year of the initiation of in which the proceedings are initiated

<u>Candidate to continuing appointment</u> — <u>within one</u>by 1 November of the year of the <u>initiation of</u>in which the proceedings are initiated

Assistant Librarian/Archivist to Associate Librarian/Archivist — within one by 1 November of the year of the initiation of in which the proceedings are initiated

<u>Associate Librarian/Archivist to Senior Librarian/Archivist — within one year of the initiation of proceedings</u>

Dean's Letter

Add new 5. Dean's Letter as follows:

5. Dean's Letter

- 5.1 The Dean will write a letter, either concurring with the recommendation of the Adjudicating Committee or dissenting from that recommendation. The letter will provide reasons for the Dean's recommendation.
- 5.2 The Dean's letter will be copied to the candidate.
- 5.3 Consistent with 4.2.1(g) above, the candidate will have 15 days from the date of

mailing to add a statement to the file providing clarification with respect to substantive or procedural matters concerning their file or, in the event of a negative or delay recommendation, to request reconsideration by the Dean.

Appeals

Renumber and revise 5. Appeals and delete existing 6.0 (Membership of the Promotion and Continuing Appointments Committee) and 6.1 (Membership of the Appeals Committee) as follows:

5.06. Appeals

- **56.1** A candidate shall have 15 days from the date of receipt of the notice of recommendation from the PCACAdjudicating Committee to appeal to the Dean in writing the recommendation to the Dean in writing. Upon receipt of such an appeal, the Dean shall refer the file to an Appeals Committee.
- **56.2** The Appeals Committee shall review the recommendation of the PCAC Adjudicating Committee on the basis of the file of the candidate as it stood when the final recommendation of the Adjudicating Committee was made.
- 5.3 A candidate appealing on a recommendation respecting continuing appointment shall be permitted, if he/she wishes, to nominate a file which was before the PCAC, preferably in the same year, or if necessary in the previous year, which the PCAC felt was worthy of continuing appointment and to which the candidate wishes to be compared.
- 5.4 The Appeals Committee shall be permitted access to files which come before the PCAC.
- 5.5 The Appeals Committee shall review the file of the appellant and report to the University Librarian/Dean, Faculty of Law with its recommendation within two months of its notification of appeal.
- 6.3 The Appeals Committee will not consider a file *de novo* but will evaluate the recommendation to ensure that the procedures and criteria set out herein have been followed.
- 6.4 The Appeals Committee shall issue a decision as to the disposition of the appeal within 60 days of receipt of the appeal, giving a rationale for why it concurs or disagrees with the Adjudicating Committee's recommendation.
- 6.5 The Appeals Committee's report shall be provided to the candidate, the Adjudication Committee and the Dean.
- 6.0 Membership of the Promotion and Continuing Appointments Committee

A standing committee on Promotion and Continuing Appointments shall advise the University Librarian/Dean, Faculty of Law on promotions and continuing appointments; its

deliberation shall be in camera and completely confidential.

Normally, the PCAC shall consist of five members, at least two of whom shall be librarians and archivists with continuing appointment, one to be a non-librarian and archivist and one librarian and archivist without continuing appointment.

When considering the file of a librarian and archivist appointed in the Law Library, at least one member of the PCAC shall be a librarian and archivist appointed in the Law Library with continuing appointment, if possible. If necessary to meet this requirement, the PCAC shall, for the purpose of reviewing such a file, add one member.

No person may serve on a committee to consider an appeal relating to continuing appointment if he/she was a member of the PCAC which made the original recommendation.

6.1 Membership of Appeals Committee

Appeals committees are struck on an *ad hoc* basis when required and shall consist of three members, as follows: two librarians and archivists—one named by the appellant and one named by the PCAC or the University Librarian/Dean, Faculty of Law, depending on the stage at which the appeal is made—and a third member chosen by the two designated librarians and archivists. At least one member should have continuing appointment; the third member may be an external designate.

6.6 Membership of Appeals Committee

An Appeals Committee is struck on an *ad hoc* basis when required and shall consist of three members, as follows: two librarians or archivists—one named by the candidate and one named by the *Dean—and a third member chosen by the two delegated librarians or archivists. All must have continuing appointment; the third member may be an external designate.

President's Letter

Add new 7. The President as follows:

7. The President

The President may exercise discretion to seek advice as the President deems appropriate prior to making a final decision on a continuing appointment and/or promotion case.

8. Denial of Advancement and Continuing Appointment

8.1 Denial of Advancement

<u>Denial of advancement will be communicated to the Pre-candidate by 30 June of the year in which the decision is made. If the Adjudicating Committee's recommendation is transmitted to the Pre-candidate by the preceding 1 November according to the schedule in</u>

4.4 and the final decision by the President is to deny advancement to Candidacy, the Precandidate's employment will end on 30 June. Otherwise, if the Adjudicating Committee's recommendation is not transmitted by 1 November and the final decision by the President is to deny advancement to Candidacy, the Pre-candidate will be eligible for an additional year of employment starting the immediately following 1 July.

8.2 Denial of Continuing Appointment

Denial of a continuing appointment and notice of termination of employment will be provided to the Candidate by 30 June of the year in which the decision is made, such that the next 12 month period from 1 July to 30 June will be the terminal year of employment.

CPPCAPLA Guidelines

January 10, 2018

Introduction

Criteria and procedures for promotion and continuing appointments of librarians/archivists are governed by the Collective Agreement (Article 13). This document offers guidelines, in accord with the Collective agreement criteria and procedures, to provide clarity to candidates, referees and adjudicating and review committees.

Context of Criteria

To develop a consistent understanding and application of the 3 levels, "competent", "highly competent" and "excellent", while also recognizing that there is progression in how these manifest as one moves from pre-candidacy to candidacy, and then from candidacy to continuing appointment. "Competent" must always form a baseline. However, when in pre-candidacy to candidacy stage, an adjudicating committee will need to factor not only "...immediate achievement, but to the promise or lack of promise for further development" (p. 5 "Criteria") to fully achieve Highly Competent or Excellent by the candidacy to continuing appointment stage.

Note: The examples contained herein are illustrative and need not be seen as exhaustive.

Competent

- having the necessary ability, knowledge, or skill to do something successfully
- successful in producing a desired or intended result.
 - o effective, active, proficient, adept, accomplished, skilled

Highly Competent

- of sufficient merit to be worthy of recognition
 - o significant, notable, important

Excellent

- the quality of being outstanding; very distinguished
 - outstanding, distinction, superiority, brilliance, greatness, pre-eminence, supremacy, extraordinary, exceptional;

CPPCAPLA Guidelines

January 10, 2018

Pre-Candidacy

PPK (include but are not limited to)

Competent

- Fulfills the requirements of the job description and of assigned responsibilities and actively contributes to advancement of departmental goals
- Contributes effectively and equitably to larger projects
- Evidence of working harmoniously with colleagues
- Effectively communicates with users and/or stakeholders
- Evidence of critical thinking and engagement within area of responsibility

Highly Competent (Competent +)

- Evidence of the application of library theories, principles and techniques to position responsibilities
- Shows initiative by developing projects within their area
- Contributes significantly to innovative projects
- Helps facilitate/establish collegiality
- Helps develop policies, guidelines & their interpretations
- Evidence of increasing expertise in a subject/praxis area (e.g., collections, instruction)
- A track record of increasing responsibility and expertise related to position responsibilities
- Makes significant contributions in establishing initiatives that improve workflows or enhance library services
- Evidence of effective advocacy, outreach, and promotion of library programs and expertise

Excellent (Highly Competent +)

- Creates innovative solutions to problems or procedures that are regarded as outstanding
- Exhibits a pattern of growth and development leading to excellence
- Exceptional contribution to advance the trajectory of larger projects
- Evidence of high distinction from community/peers

PCS (include but are not limited to)

Competent

Keeps informed of significant developments in area of position responsibility

CPPCAPLA Guidelines

January 10, 2018

- Shows commitment to continuing education
- Demonstrates active engagement within relevant professional or subjectrelated associations
- Presents posters or gives presentations at major conferences
- Evidence of the formulation of a research agenda, such as a manuscript in progress

Highly Competent (Competent +)

- Significantly contributes to professional or subject-related associations
- Presents papers or leads workshops at major conferences
- Contribution of scholarly content to the professional and/or academic discourse that demonstrates maturity and depth of thought.
- Evidence of scholarly publication work with at least one publication in a peer reviewed work (publications may be accepted but not yet out in print)
- Participant on successful research grant application

Excellent (Highly Competent +)

- Outstanding contribution to relevant professional or subject-related associations
- Exceptional evidence of scholarly publication work by several peer reviewed or evaluated works
- Principal Investigator on research grant

Service (include but are not limited to)

Competent

- Evidence of effective contribution to library committees
- Actively contributes to the mission of the library outside of one's PPK responsibilities

Highly Competent (Competent +)

- Demonstrable significant contribution to the advancement of a Library committee's work.
- Evidence of strong contributions to campus committees outside the libraries.

Excellent (Highly Competent +)

• Exceptional contributions to library or university committees, or in other service activities.

CPPCAPLA Guidelines

January 10, 2018

Candidacy

PPK (include but are not limited to)

Competent

- Fulfills the requirements of the job description and of assigned responsibilities with a record of active contributions to advancing departmental goals.
- Demonstrates continued growth and achievements in professional performance
- Demonstrates mastery of the knowledge and skills required by the position
- Shows creativity and acts proactively
- Demonstrates ability to exercise sound judgement and decision-making within institutional structures
- Evidence of working collaboratively with colleagues
- Demonstrates sustained growth, high quality contributions, leadership, and a commitment to ongoing learning in core position responsibilities
- Demonstrates versatility and a readiness to adapt to ever-changing library environments

Highly Competent (Competent +)

- Evidence of using professional experience, knowledge of appropriate research, and creativity to solve significant problems, improve services, and innovate
- Initiates and evaluates for effectiveness, projects within their area that contributes to the significant advancement of the Libraries
- Provides significant contributions to innovative/creative projects
- Makes notable contributions to the improvement of operations within a department/division.
- Evidence of developing important collaborations within the Libraries and/or the University
- Demonstrable notable expertise in a relevant subject/praxis area
- Demonstrates long-range planning ability and ability to effectively navigate ambiguity
- Demonstrable leadership at the library, university, and professional levels that lead to notable improvements in the activities and functions of those entities

Excellent (Highly Competent +)

• Routinely assumes exceptional leadership roles in major projects/activities

CPPCAPLA Guidelines

January 10, 2018

- Demonstrable evidence of outstanding initiative, innovation, creativity and leadership in performance of core position duties and the design of services and solutions
- Demonstrates leadership in resolving conflicts and/or negotiating solutions
- Champions initiatives and advances project/initiative/work of reputational significance
- Elevates the reputation of the Libraries and/or the university

PCS (include but are not limited to)

Competent

- Focused pursuit of professional expertise marked by a continuing program of relevant professional development
- Member in professional or subject-related associations
- Demonstrates sustained progress in scholarship or research
- Participates in a research grant funded project

Highly Competent (Competent +)

- Sustained important contributions to relevant professional or subjectrelated associations
- Strong track record of scholarly presentations at significant conferences
- Evidence of scholarly publications or other modes of scholarship in peerreviewed or evaluated works.
- Demonstrates continual engagement with significant research projects

Excellent (Highly Competent +)

- Extraordinary contributions to professional or subject-related associations
- Creates several items of scholarship that have undergone an independent evaluation and selection process such as peer review, rigorous editorial selection or competitive juried selection
- Principal Investigator on awarded research grant
- Distinguished professional recognition both inside and outside of the university by experts in the field

Service (criteria include but are not limited to)

Competent

• Evidence of active participation and material contributions to library, university, and professional committees with an emphasis on activities that support library and university missions.

CPPCAPLA Guidelines

January 10, 2018

Highly Competent (Competent +)

- Significant leadership contributions to library and York U community
- Notable leadership on university committees or in other service activities that write university policy, carry out university governance, and contribute to the university's teaching, research and strategic functions
- Provides important contributions towards special projects or activities of the Library or University

Excellent (Highly Competent +)

- Sustained and exceptional contributions to the library and university community marked by high levels of responsibility and significant impact
- Recognized professional reputational achievements
- Recognized professional distinction in guiding the strategic direction of the Libraries
- Outstanding leadership on regional national or international organizations related to libraries or archives

Senior Librarian/Archivist

In guiding a decision to promote to Senior Librarian/Archivist, the above guidelines are instructive in the context of:

• "Assessment of eligibility for promotion to Senior Librarian/Archivist is not made on the basis of evaluation or performance in the three areas of professional performance and knowledge, professional contribution and standing, and service. For a Senior Librarian/Archivist, these areas cannot be separated, but rather intertwine and overlap to produce an overall quality of excellence. Thus, an individual's achievements as a whole are assessed."

Promotion is based on an assessment of eminence. Although it is not expected that a Senior Librarian will have exhibited eminence in all three of PPK, PCS and Service, normally a senior Librarian will have demonstrated sustained and ongoing achievements in all three areas.

- Identified as an eminent librarian/archivist as recognized by experts in the candidate's area of librarianship/archivy.
- Demonstrates a clear record of outstanding, nationally or internationally recognized scholarship that advances librarianship/archivy based on the cumulative impact rather than the impact of an isolated piece of work.

CPPCAPLA Guidelines

January 10, 2018

• A candidate's sustained achievements must connect, in some capacity, to their professional responsibilities with thin the University.